

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
1	5	0	0	0	0	Though an overview this chapter is very comprehensive in presenting strengths, weaknesses of community level risk reduction/adaptation. Practitioners however will disagree that current practices known as community based disaster risk management is adequate to address the challenges of climate change. CBDRM definition maybe common in existing and growing literature about the subject. However in practice, they vary widely depending on context, views and environment. Most "successes" reported in CBDRM are at best anecdotal, but the overall effectiveness in countries and regions where these are intensively implemented have not been interrogated, and evaluated. This becomes very important in the CC regime. (Jegillos, Sanny, IINDP)	Chapter was refocused to examine local (including community). Further, localities must be engaged in planning, implementation and evaluation of DRM and if CCA interventions are to be successful.
2	5	0	0	0	0	And similarly, Chapter 5 seems to be distinct from Chapter 1. Chapter 1 makes generally little reference to livelihoods as a determining factor on local vulnerability or adaptation strategies. Chapter 5, however, seems to make a lot of reference to livelihoods. (Forsyth, Tim, London School of Economics and Political Science)	point noted
3	5	0	0	0	0	General Comments: while it is critical to manage risks of climate extremes at the local level from the aspect of community, it is also important to consider technological and engineering solutions to manage the risks at the local level in an even finer scale. This is yet considered in this chapter. (Wang, Xiaoming, Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO))	yes, but local conditions and key actors are crucial in the planning, design, and sustainable performance of such engineering solutions.
4	5	0	0	0	0	The chapter mixes a lot of topics and ultimately provides less specifics on approaches to working within local dynamics than I was expecting. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	Chapter was restructured and tightened to include more specifics.
5	5	0	0	0	0	No particular observations except care in consistency across definitions along the chapters (Bosello, Francesco, Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei, Milan University \)	terms were harmonized with other chapters
6	5	0	0	0	0	the chapter has a very difficult task: addressing adaptation to extremes at the sub-national scale across the world. It would be very difficult to synthesize such information. Nonetheless, the chapter needs a lot of work. It needs to more effectively tie themes together. I also found many assertions being either without sufficient citation of the literature or substantiation. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	Point noted; we have taken care to provide the necessary references in substantiating the points made in the text.
7	5	0	0	0	0	In case of refusal by the populations to leave the flooding areas and to respect the authorities' decisions? (Cisse, Gueladio, Swiss Tropical and Public Health Institute)	unclear as to the nature of the comment.
8	5	0	0	0	0	Participatory approaches, Ecosystem health approach ("Ecohealth") and alike, potentials at local level? (Cisse, Gueladio, Swiss Tropical and Public Health Institute)	additional text was added on ecosystems and participatory approaches.
9	5	0	0	0	0	Particular attention to training of water and sanitation specialists? (Cisse, Gueladio, Swiss Tropical and Public Health Institute)	Unclear as to the nature of the comment; although we feel this is part of the response mechanisms for localities.
10	5	0	0	0	0	CHAPTER OVERLAP: There are at times significant overlaps between Chapters 5, 6 and 7 and boundaries between "local", "national", and "international" are not always clear, but would encourage cross-chapter communications to reduce redundancy. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Overlap was addressed with a refocusing of ch. 5 to the local only and the incorporation of a chapeau as the introduction delineating the intellectual context within each chapter.
11	5	0	0	0	0	STRUCTURE: Chapter 1 (p.39, lines 25-32) describes a structure for Chapters 5, 6 & 7 with a common set of questions that are explored from 7 perspectives. The implementation of this structure is not clearly reflected in the Chapter structure. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Need to articulate with Chapter 1 to ensure it conforms to present version.
12	5	0	0	0	0	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE: Strong and/or sweeping statements are often made based on zero or only one reference. Important information to convey, but you must provide evidence to support these statements. Providing more than one credible source strengthens your assessment. Consider multiple lines of independent evidence. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Additional references have been included to support the statements.
13	5	0	0	0	0	UNCERTAINTY: General comment on the treatment of the words "likely", "very likely", etc. throughout the chapter text. In IPCC, "Likely", "very likely" and all other expressions from the IPCC Uncertainty Guidance are part of calibrated IPCC language and therefore reserved. These words can only be used in relation to the formal treatment of uncertainty! They are formal terms used to quantify the likelihood of an outcome or result where a probabilistic basis can be established. For clarity and consistency, these words (e.g., "likely", etc.) can only be used when assigning a formal likelihood statement. In order to clearly visualize this in the text, they appear in italicized form as per the uncertainty guidance provided to all authors. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Tried to follow as much as possible.
14	5	0	0	0	0	FAQs: Consider including FAQs for your chapter - FAQs provide an effective and concise way in which to present important information and key messages to a wide audience. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Have not done this yet.
15	5	0	0	0	0	CROSS-CHAPTER FAQ: Consider a cross-chapter FAQ for Chapters 5, 6 and 7 on managing the risks of climate extremes at the local, national and international level? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Have not done this yet.
16	5	0	0	0	0	REFERENCING: In certain sections (eg 5.2.4, 5.4.4.2, 5.5.2.2), the full author list is given as a citation instead of eg Brown et al. Please correct this. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Problem with author unfamiliarity with RefWorks and the need for correct punctuation when inputting into the system. Most of these should have been fixed.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
17	5	0	0	0	0	The whole chapter is very focused on developing countries, especially on rural areas. It does not meet the requirements to give answers on adaptation on a local level regarding the vulnerabilities of cities, megacities or regions in industrialized countries. Furthermore, the focus is very much on "communities", while local or regional governments do have an important role to play. In my opinion, chapter 6 demonstrates what chapter 5 should look like (focused on the local level and not on the national level). Several questions are unanswered: What should local governments do? What should the business community do? When should they act? (Bardt, Hubertus, Cologne Institute for Economic Research)	Chapter was expanded to include urban settlements, megacities, and including the private sector where appropriate. We have also used the phrasing of locality instead of community to highlight the different types of local.
18	5	0	0	0	0	This chapter is very scientific, well written, it follows a clear logic, it has an easily understandable approach and language. Well done! (Schmidt-Thome, Philipp, Geological Survey of Finland)	thank you
19	5	0	0	0	0	This Chapter stands out of the whole report completely. I do understand the importance of local knowledge but the presentation of local knowledge in the context of climate change disaster risk management must be done in a very different way. Why the lengthy discussion of grey literature? Why is this section using different definition of 'risk' in comparison to Chapters 1 and 3? There are very good lessons learned from large disasters. I am aware, for example of Red River flooding in 1997 – Canada and US – and issues related to local knowledge (coherence of Mennonite communities, complete destruction of native communities, etc). It is not clear in this Chapter how the scale of a disaster relates to local knowledge. When the disaster exceeds the local coping capacity the local knowledge is of a very limited value. Great example is flooding in Pakistan at the moment. Insurance and local level risk management is misleading. Insurance is about spreading risk. It requires large base in order to be affordable. Therefore, insurance may not be the measure to consider for small-scale local conditions. (Simonovic, Slobodan, University of Western Ontario)	The grey literature discussion was reduced and the definition of risk was harmonized with other chapters. However, local knowledge and local capacity are quite different. We have addressed many of the challenges and limitations.
20	5	0	0	0	0	The following are my general comments on the chapter, it ust be sadi that after reading it I couldn't get a clear message on what is different at the local level, and what practices should be promoted from that level (very important for politicians and decision makers): 1. The chapter defines local as something that includes local goverments but this is not properly developed, there is a subsection on this, but the chapter is needing more analysis and conclusions on what is local and wath role local goverments have played: land use acts, emergency plans, infrastructure, environmental protection, education, local organization, etc. There are several examples in Latin America, Africa and Asia on how local goverments have been dealing with disasters and, more recently, with DRM. Here are two unavoidable references: ISDR, 2010. Local goverments and DRR. Good practices and lessons learned, etc; ISDR, 2008, Linking DRR and poverty reduction. Good practices and lessons learned.etc. 2. The chapter needs to establish the difference between DRM and Local Disaster Risk Management as a practice promoted by locals, who identify risks, solutions, develop plans, take decisions, monitor processes and MAINTAIN RELATION WITH OTHER LEVELS OF MANAGEMENT (State, region, nation) 3. The chapter has overlaps and repetitions with other chapters 1, 3, 6, 7; this is a problem that can be seen in almost all the draft report and needs to be addressed in a more centralized basis. 4. In the same way concepts are not common with other chapters and in some cases they result redundant or mixed (hazard, risk, exposure) (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	The chapter is trying to make the point that the lessons from DRM and how it was coordinated inform how CCA might be implemented and coordinated at the local level. This is great policy relevance. The articulation with other chapters has been handled and the context provided by the chapeau as the introduction to Ch. 5, 6, and 7
21	5	0	0	0	0	in this chapter, there appears to be a reluctance to address issues arising from rapid population growth, with huge increase in demand on resources and especially on land. And big increase in the dependency ratio, children:adults which is a major problem in risk management. of course poverty and maldistribution and poverty create more vulnerability, but so does a high dependency. (McCall Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Population growth was included as were aspects related to household composition and its relationship to vulnerability at the local scale.
22	5	0	0	0	0	It is not easy to see the logical structure or narrative sequence of the main sections and there is sometimes a feeling of deja vu, ie that topics are being repeated.. Especially sections 5.2 and 5.4 . In 5.2 some of the options refer to higher level, not within-community.coping.. In 5.4 why should 'differences in coping' anf 'costs of msnaging' be placed under 'Challenges and Opportunities'? why are 5.4.1.1.to 5.4.1.8 called "differences in coping" when they are also about vulnerability and coping capacity, rather than just coping mechanisms? I think the authors have a plan for the logical stucture, but it is not made clear enough to the reader. And re-thinking some subheadings would help. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Sections were re-organized to reduce internal chapter overlap.
23	5	0	0	0	0	There could be more emphasis in the chapter on the extent of local and indigenous knowledge about risks, hazards, vulnerability and coping, - individual and group knowledge - and its relevance to DRR management. (5,3,5,5 but not much else). It is important not to see the 'local level' only in terms of how the national or regional or sectoral levels can reach 'down' to the local, but to see the local level in terms of autonomy. knowledge and self capacity. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Sections were re-written to emphasize this point--see 5.3.6; 5.3.4
24	5	0	0	0	0	A comprehensive part of the report. Multidisciplinary is obvious attitude. (Yasseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	thank you

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
25	5	0	0	0	0	At this point Chapter 5 is a summary/review of the mostly academic work that is available for review. It takes a top-down approach, from the perspective that high-level decision-makers and their technocrat support teams know what is best or just need some additional guidance from academic research. There is "lip service" paid to community-driven approaches, but based on again on a top-down view. As such, while the conclusions in the Executive Summary may be useful to open the eyes of senior government decision-makers, the conclusions themselves are nothing new to community-based practitioners, and the contents provide very little added value for practitioners. (Kull, Daniel, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC))	The point is noted. We are mindful of the two constituencies--DRM community practitioners and governmental decision makers. Given the nature of IPCC reports, the latter is our primary focus.
26	5	0	0	0	0	Despite specific mention and description of how grey literature was used, most of the references cited are still academic in nature. Recognising the need for reliable sources, the Chapter fails to capture masses of experience of community-centred organisations in DRR/CCA. Many of the references covering community experiences by specific organisations are reported not on the basis of the experiences of the communities and organisations themselves, but rather on an academic review of the experiences. I would recommend doing a more thorough data collection of grey sources, including but not limited to materials available on the websites of PreventionWeb, IRIN, ReliefWeb, Strengthening Climate Resilience, ProVention Consortium, Global Network of Civil Society Organisations for Disaster Reduction, Climate Action Network, CRISTAL, IASC Task Force on Climate Change, ELDIS, IISD, IIED, etc., not to mention the specific website of INGOs and NGOs including Oxfam, Tearfund, IFRC, World Vision, Care International, etc. (Kull, Daniel, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC))	Efforts were made to include more of the grey literature by reviewing and assessing the sources noted by the reviewer.
27	5	0	0	0	0	The draft contains an impressive range of literature and examples, demonstrating the importance of a local perspective on climate risks. However, I find that several of sections of the chapter reads more like a collection of examples than a coherent story. The chapter could be significantly improved by more focus on drawing together the lessons from different parts of the literature, as well as by a clearer description of chapter aims and structure in the introduction. (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Point is noted and with the inclusion of the chapeau and a restructuring, the chapter should have a more coherent structure and purpose.
28	5	0	0	0	0	I was disappointed that the draft chapter says relatively little about drought, among either pastoralists or dryland crop farmers, and therefore makes little use of the large literature on coping strategies against drought. The chapter by Morton in McPeak and Little (eds.) "Pastoral Livestock Marketing in Eastern Africa" (ITDG, 2006) contains a number of references on these topics, of which Gufu Oba in Nomadic Peoples, 2001, 5 (1) 89-119, is especially useful. Other references are various chapters in the two volume compendium "Drought" ed. D. Wilhite (Routledge, 2000), Barton, Morton and Hendy at http://www.nri.org/publications/policyseries/PolicySeriesNo15.pdf , various outputs of the USAID PARIMA programme, and the ALive Policy Options Paper on Community-Based Drought Management at http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/templates/lead/pdf/e-conf_06-10_drought.pdf . Perhaps stemming from this, because drought as the longest-onset disaster has the most points of contact with development policy, there is little detailed discussion of the way vulnerability to drought or other disasters is increasing due to adverse trends in policies or markets. This seems to be touched on in 5.1, but should be a central part of 5.2 or 5.3. Turning this round, the chapter does not bring out the ultimate dependence of local-level initiatives, particularly if they need upscaling, on national policies. Drought mitigation policies for pastoralists (facilitated migration, destocking) can only be upscaled beyond a certain point with suitable national policies, on land and marketing respectively. Of course one could also observe that the success of national initiatives is heavily mediated by local factors. (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	We have tried to balance the management of disaster risks with pertinent examples using flood, tropical storms, and drought.
29	5	0	0	0	0	The chapter needs very careful copy-editing and proofreading. There are many typos, words missing, instances of poor punctuation, places where the sense is extremely obscure, and problems with references. (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	Editorial and taken care of.
30	5	0	0	0	0	The chapter seems to have understated the importance of knowledge and capacity at the local government level as distinct from community knowledge and capacity. This is a major hurdle towards implementing local level sustainable practice in <u>adaptation and risk management</u> . (Gupta, Manu, SEEDS)	This point has been stressed a bit more throughout the chapter.
31	5	0	0	0	0	In my opinion, this chapter is on a quite general level. The first two paragraphs deal with risks and vulnerabilities of developing countries at a general level. The third paragraph also discusses the problem without giving any specific examples. Some practical examples would be interesting and give more focus to the problems and solutions. It seems that the focus of this chapter is on developing countries; it would also be good to state that clearly at the beginning of the chapter as human security issues could also concern developed countries and their populations. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	More specific examples were provided throughout the chapter using developed as well as developing countries.
32	5	0	0	0	0	I would suggest that the term local knowledge would be defined at the beginning of this chapter. The reader easily understands that the term comprises all local level/community knowledge of climate and extreme events and practices to adapt and cope with them, but in this chapter only local knowledge of indigenous peoples is treated. This is of course quite important, however, also other groups of people (such farmers, hunters, foresters, fishermen, gardeners etc.) have a lot of valuable local knowledge concerning for example changes in ecosystems. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	This was done.
33	5	0	0	0	0	I would suggest that the title of this chapter is revised or that the approach and content of the chapter is defined in the beginning of this chapter. It would be helpful if already in the title it would be specified of what or whose challenges and opportunities are discussed here. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	Chapter title cannot be changed, but a new introduction should help clarify the content and approach.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
34	5	0	0	0	0	Comment: sometimes also wealthier communities are situated in hazard-prone locations, as in Helsinki metropolitan area for example the most valuable properties are situated in the coastal and therefore flood risk areas. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	point noted and included
35	5	0	0	0	0	I would suggest that the term entitlement and how it is understood in this context were defined and discussed at the beginning of this chapter. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	We disagree and left the definition to the section where it is discussed at length (5.4.1.5)
36	5	0	0	0	0	I would suggest that for the sake of clarity it would be stated in the beginning of this chapter that it deals with human health. Equally, when population is mentioned, it concerns human populations (and not populations other animals for example). (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	Point is made in section 5.4.1.6
37	5	0	0	0	0	The titles of chapters 4.6.3. and 4.6.4. are quite similar. Also, they both treat costs of disasters. Is the scope of this chapter more on the local level? If so, it would be good to make that clear in the beginning of the chapter. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	The sections were restructured to avoid overlap with Ch. 6 and 7. Also, the costs section was customized to the local scale.
38	5	0	0	0	0	I found inconsistencies in the way "local risk management" is referred to in different sections. While some of the sub-titles suggest that the focus is on the local-community level, I don't think the contents are dealing explicitly with that, but rather with a different range of subnational levels of interventions and analysis. Moreover, some studies in Latin American and the Caribbean have contributed substantially to the conceptualization and debate around "local risk management" and they are not mentioned or referred to in the whole chapter (see for instance "Local Level Risk Management: concept and practices", CEPREDENAC-PNUD, 2005 (Author: Allan Lavell); or "Reducción del Riesgo de Desastres en el Ambito Local: Lecciones desde Sub-región Andina"; Comunidad Andina-PREDECAN. 2009. (Sanahuja, Haris Eduardo, Senior Consultant)	Definitions were clarified of local (the generic term) and when specific types of local entities (e.g. actors, communities, cities) were mentioned, we used the specific term, e.g. city
39	5	0	0	0	0	Communities can take a resolution and developing processes without having always scientific investigations verified by committees and complex paradigms. (Lamprea Quiroga, Pedro Simon, Ideam - Advisor (Colombian institute of hydrology, meteorology and environmental studies))	Point noted
40	5	0	0	0	0	The authors have written an interesting and informative chapter. However, they missed opportunities to better explain why particular issues are important. It appears that the authors assumed the reader would understand why an issue is of importance to effective disaster risk management at the local level. As this may not be the case, it would be helpful when revising the chapter to keep the "so what" in mind. An example is in the ES, where it is stated that relief plays an important humanitarian role that may undermine local disaster reduction measures. I presume this is important because it increases vulnerability to future extreme events. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text was refocused to bring out more clearly the take home messages on why the local is important not only for DRM but CAA.
41	5	0	0	0	0	The Executive Summary is long, with overlapping statements, with quite a few opportunities to combine and condense. For example, the 4th bullet from the bottom could be "Key elements for managing disaster risk that can be conducted at the community level include assessments of the full range of possible local exposures under climate change; vulnerability; and post-disaster response. Such assessments can be based by local knowledge along with information from climate models, disaster risk reduction agencies, and development practitioners. (IPCC WGII TSU)	We agree and this was reduced significantly.
42	5	0	0	0	0	The chapter should include some discussion of early warning systems, including their components. I had expected a discussion of the challenges of effective response to early warning systems because of limited research into how to best communicate with communities and to motivate appropriate behavior. (IPCC WGII TSU)	We agree and included a text box on FEWS NET.
43	5	0	0	0	0	I was surprised that social capital was not discussed until late in the chapter. Surely, part of what makes a community better able to cope with extreme weather events and disasters is related to social capital. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Section was moved forward to the middle of the chapter.
44	5	0	0	0	0	Another issue missing until almost the end is informal settlements. You might consider making that a subheading in 5.4.1. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Informal settlements are covered in 5.4.1.7
45	5	0	0	0	0	This chapter provides a good overview of many concerns at the local level. Entire sections read quite well, present examples that balance or contrast developed and developing countries, and offer a readable summary of key literatures. A general point is that the chapter moves between disaster and adaptation. It would help to bring this linkage forward in the introduction so that the connections make sense throughout the chapter. With regard to the flow of the text, the main areas that need to be reviewed for clarity are the introduction and section 5.2. In addition, there are some sequencing problems as parts of section 3 seem to be more foundational than what is contained in section 2 and there are a number of redundancies that need to be addressed. What follows are responses to specific aspects of the text - some points requiring refinement and others minor edits. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Sections 2 and 3 were restructured to illustrate how local places currently cope with DR (5.2) and how local DRM could provide a foundation for CAA (5.3)
46	5	0	0	0	0	Intro - introductions are hard to write and this one is no exception. It would help to go back and refine and clarify. In addition, it would help to provide some indication about what makes climate unique from DRR or at least worthy of consideration at the local level (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	This was addressed in the new introduction.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
47	5	1	0	41	0	The chapter as a whole provides a lot of very relevant information and analysis. Seen from the overall angle there are however four or five major points to be made as to content and structure. Firstly, the definition given to local at the beginning is wideranging but the contents of the chapter seem to take up explicitly only on the community level-according to section titles. But, secondly, a good part of what is discussed is not really community based and a discussion at other "local" or national levels would probably talk of similar things a good deal of the time. That is to say the explicit community aspect is not highlighted always and the text tends to become more generic than local-community specific. Thirdly, DRM and adaptation cuts across risk reduction, prevention and mitigation, preparedness, response, recovery aspects but these are not all systematically dealt with in each section and at times one or the other of them is privileged in detriment to the others. Fourthly, there is nothing from Latin America in examples and quotes and given LA has contributed enormously to concept, debate, systematization of experience, instrumental development etc at the local level, including autonomous work by local government and NGOs, through to the work of GTZ, COSUDE, oxfam, action aid, care, world vision etc, this omission is notorious. Fifthly, despite the discussion and argument for grey literature little of the types mentioned are used and a good part comes from western literature published in northern journals. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	The chapter was restructured and tightened and these points have been addressed.
48	5	1	0	66	0	Terms "cost" use in several parts of the text often needs to be rephrased by "economic loss". (Kondo, Masahide, University of Tsukuba)	Still working on getting a clarification of this from other chapters (e.g. Ch. 4; Ch. 6; Ch. 7).
49	5	1	54	0	0	"Cost of impacts" is preferably rephrased by "Economic loss impacts", since the concept of opportunity cost has been emphasized in previous chapters. (Kondo, Masahide, University of Tsukuba)	We did not use economic loss as not all losses are economic (e.g. death; injuries; dislocation)
50	5	2	3	2	23	This is not a chapter that deals with reconstruction issues, this should be about the experiences of DRM at the municipal, community and regional level (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	point noted
51	5	2	4	0	0	The executive summary begins with some very broad and definitional points, that are of questionable value in a summary, but does move towards more specific and useful points (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	Executive summary was shortened to make it more specific and hitting the key messages.
52	5	2	18	0	0	Executive Summary: There are very few specific references to climate change in this text. From a policy perspective it would be important to discuss whether the challenges at the local level from managing climate change are qualitatively different from those of managing current climate extremes. (Fuessel, Hans-Martin, European Environment Agency)	TSU: Is it appropriate to do this in an executive summary?
53	5	2	18	0	0	The Executive Summary currently provides useful information, but at a very general level. To the extent possible, consider opportunities to present more specific key findings, as well as the degree of certainty your author team has in those findings, per the new uncertainty guidance that will be available at LAM3. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Done
54	5	2	20	4	24	There is too much bold highlighting in this section. The bold highlighting should be more selective, focusing on just key phrases or ideas. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	This was reduced
55	5	2	25	2	25	Executive summary: "numerous strategies": wouldn't it be advisable to be more concrete and talk about coping strategies (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	Text rewritten
56	5	2	25	2	30	The Executive Summary (ES) mentions disasters triggered by extreme events. But, as it has been recognized in other chapters (1 and 3), disasters can be produced by extreme or non-extreme natural events. Why does this chapter focus only on disasters related to extreme events? Is it because physically is easier to calculate/measure these extremes? Moreover, not all natural extremes are related to disasters. If the chapter refers to "natural" extreme events, it would help mentioning that the first time extreme events is described in the ES and in the introduction of the chapter. (Cavazos, Tereza, CICESE)	Wording was changed
57	5	2	32	2	36	the local context is essential. It is a product of its history.. It is necessary to understand the history of a locale as well as its current pattern (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Noted
58	5	2	38	2	39	Executive summary: is it only social, political and economic changes? Wouldn't it be better instead of only mentioning environmental degradation to talk about natural and physical changes and put degradation as a concrete example in brackets? (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	Paragraph was deleted
59	5	2	38	2	40	The statement that vulnerability is increasing is very important, but is not well documented in the chapter. How is vulnerability measured? Is it based on total lives lost, property lost or is it based on likelihood of individual or individual property being affected? (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	This material is handled in Chapter 2
60	5	2	38	2	42	an example of not mentioning population growth (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Paragraph was deleted
61	5	2	44	2	53	This conclusion is true for top-down implemented projects, often led by central governments. If more information from NGOs and civil society organisations have been reviewed, it would be clear that at the grassroots level the focus is more and more on software approaches. Particularly the notion of raising awareness and capacity of vulnerable communities themselves is missing. (Kull, Daniel, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC))	Considered, but did not include
62	5	2	49	2	53	"Structural" measures should not be sweepingly deprecated as concentrating vulnerability to super-design events. Design can address such events. A good example of such procedures is given in SEAOC(1995) Vision 2000, Performance Based Seismic Engineering of Buildings, Technical Report, Vol. 1. Part 1, Chapter 2, Structural Engineers Association of California, USA. The approach, applicable to wind, flood and other hazards, accepts greater damage for hazards of longer return periods, but avoids life loss for the super-design events. (Wright, Richard, American Society of Civil Engineers)	Text was re-written to highlight when, where, and under what contexts structural approaches work, and when, where, and under what conditions they do not (see 5.2.1).

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
63	5	2	49	2	54	Executive summary: It is true that the focus is still quite heavily on structural measures; however, I think it would be important to mention the crucial role non-structural measures play. The best built infrastructure will not be a success if communities do not know how to maintain and use it. So the role of non-structural measures (e.g. awareness raising, capacity building) should not be underestimated and should definitely be more strongly emphasized in the chapter. Thanks to many capacity buildings communities could rescue themselves before the disaster hit. (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	paragraph was deleted
64	5	2	51	2	51	Please define the term supra-design events (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	paragraph was deleted
65	5	2	52	2	52	The first statement is not a certainty so suggest inserting "may", thus: "even greater disasters may unfold" (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	paragraph was deleted
66	5	3	1	3	4	The review of relief challenges and opportunities is particularly academic and overlooks the realities of providing relief in difficult contexts. It also ignores many of the improvements the international humanitarian system as made, particularly in providing "risk informed" relief that does not exacerbate existing risks. Of course there are still problems, but the picture painted also in Section 5.2 is excessively critical without highlighting progress made. (Kull, Daniel, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC))	Paragraph was deleted
67	5	3	12	3	13	Executive summary: "secure sustainable livelihoods": how do you define secure and can one really talk about secure livelihoods under the current climate variability? (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	Paragraph was deleted
68	5	3	17	3	18	Too sweeping in saying generic approaches are likely to be unsuccessful. Good generic approaches account for local conditions. See for examples the hazard maps in Minimum Design Loadings for Buildings and Other Structures, ASCE/SEI 7-10, American Society of Civil Engineers, Reston, VA, USA (www.asce.org) or the model codes of the International Code Council (www.iccsasfe.org). This point is acknowledged later in the report 5.4.2-6. (Wright, Richard, American Society of Civil Engineers)	Paragraph was deleted
69	5	3	20	42	5	I think that this is probably one of the most important chapters of the document because it is the one that deals with the landing of risk management and climate change adaptation in the local levels... I think that it is necessary here to increase the importance to understand that climate change effects will have its more dramatic expressions in concrete territories... Until now the message sent about this global problematic is to global and general (images of the planet in yellow, orange and red colours), so people don't understand that we are talking about specific changes in their specific territories.. This aspect needs to be improved in all the chapter 5... (Linayo, Alejandro, Research Center on Disaster Risk Reduction CIGIR)	Thank you
70	5	3	30	3	34	Vulnerability is not to be discussed here, anyway appears that most of the chapters offer their own concepts, sometimes two or more definitions respond to the same concepts within the same chapter (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Will be addressed through cross-chapter concurrence and the development of the glossary
71	5	3	37	0	0	Emergent, not emergency (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Fixed but paragraph deleted
72	5	3	37	3	37	Is the current situation an "emergency?" That's a very strong term which does not seem to be substantiated. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	should be emergence; paragraph deleted
73	5	3	41	0	0	"costs of disasters" is preferably rephrased by "economic loss from disasters", since the concept of opportunity cost has been emphasized in previous chapters. (Kondo, Masahide, University of Tsukuba)	same response as comment 48 & 49
74	5	3	41	3	41	If costs of disasters are difficult to estimate, how do you know vulnerability is increasing? (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	vulnerability isn't always measured in terms of economic costs.
75	5	3	41	3	43	I very much agree that estimating the costs of adapting to changes in climate extremes is also difficult. However, considering all the difficulties and uncertainties, even though further development of tools is necessary, it still seems inadequate as the only solution to the problem. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	We have tried to make this point that more work needs to be done on this topic as it is both a research and practice gap.
76	5	3	42	3	43	This sentence is a bit unclear: estimating the costs of adaptation ... is also difficult to estimate? (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	reworded
77	5	3	45	3	51	More information, references and data is needed to sustain predictions (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	See Chapter 3
78	5	3	45	3	51	This assertion is difficult to prove or disprove. Seems speculative. How do we know how much change will make a particular community or location uninhabitable? (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	paragraph deleted
79	5	3	45	3	51	There is some unclarity: Are you referring to some people who are already displaced who then migrate when a disaster hits? Or, as I guess you mean, some people are displaced when the disaster hits? You may also want to note the comment no 1 on the terms migration and displacement. It may also be worth noting somewhere in this chapter that there seems to be agreement that most of the migration and displacement at least in the near future is likely to be internal in countries. See e.g. the report Kolmannskog, Future Floods of Refugees, NRC, April 2008, available at http://www.nrc.no/arch/_img/9268480.pdf ; peer-reviewed article Kolmannskog, "Climates of displacement", Nordic Journal of Human Rights, 26(4), pp 302-320, 2008, as well as submissions from humanitarian agencies to UNFCCC in particular in comment 1). (Kolmannskog, Vikram, Norwegian Refugee Council)	paragraph deleted
80	5	3	50	3	51	and serious impacts on the population in the receiving areas (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Point noted.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
81	5	3	51	4	2	Capabilities and opportunities analysis is also needed to promote a process of risk identification and reduction (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Point noted.
82	5	3	53	4	2	The three elements are all about assessment and analysis but not about follow-up actions. If that is the intent, then perhaps the opening sentence of the paragraph should be changed to focus on assessment and analysis components rather than "managing disaster risk" as a whole. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	Point noted.
83	5	3	53	4	2	The 3rd key element is not "post-disaster assessment", but "mitigation and avoidance" - preparedness, & coping. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Point noted.
84	5	4	4	32	33	Surely human settlement patterns are not the only non-climate factors worth mentioning? (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	paragraph deleted
85	5	4	4	45	52	There is confusion here about whether immediately sub-national levels of government "province" and then "region" are counted as local (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	defined more precisely
86	5	4	8	4	12	Transfers are important, but apart from these 'transfers of risk' and 'social support mechanisms', there are important transfers of knowledge, experience and strategies within and between communities. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	paragrah deleted
87	5	4	8	4	24	Seems that the focus is on post disaster actions and strategies, the point is not in what is been done in preparadness and response measures, but how the conception of "risk" as a social construction and "risk management" might lead to a more holistic approach to reduce impact of disaster in the future. Factors such as local governance, organization, land use acts, environmental protection, education, capacity building, political advocacy and lack of human development should be brought to a more visible level (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Point noted
88	5	4	19	4	19	It would be helpful if the last sentence would be specified a bit: financial support by whom and for adaptation at which level or whose adaptation? (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	Paragraph deleted
89	5	4	21	4	24	Why is coordinated information needed at subnational scales? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Paragraph deleted
90	5	4	22	4	23	It simply is UNTRUE (for the developed and much of the developing world) that little information about specific events is coordinated below the national level. See the references above for 5.3.17-18. (Wright, Richard, American Society of Civil Engineers)	Disagree based on our assessment of the literature.
91	5	4	27	0	0	very well written, well explained. Widely envisaged the idea of interdisciplinarity. (Yasseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	Thank you
92	5	4	29	4	29	"...human and economic losses from CLIMATE AND weather-related..." (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	paragraph deleted
93	5	4	30	4	30	Is there any particular reason for using the word catastrophe as opposed to disaster? Or should we keep using disaster unless we discriminate between disaster and catastrophe as Quarantelli does for example, and decide that extreme impacts are catastrophes and other impacts are disasters, or some such thing? Order of dates need to be chronological-1995, 2005, 2009. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	paragraph deleted
94	5	4	30	4	30	suggest that "catastrophes" replaced by "hazards", which is a more precise (and equally descriptive) term (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	paragraph deleted
95	5	4	31	4	31	Natural hazard related losses instead of "natural hazard losses" maybe? (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	paragraph deleted
96	5	4	31	4	32	"probably" implies a statistical/mathematical construct; rephrase to be consistent with Chapter 3. Given that the weather-related extremes are not specified, it is difficult to say that climate change is probably contributing to all of them. Suggest replacing "these" with "many". (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	paragraph deleted
97	5	4	31	4	32	Unclear sentence: "Climate variability and change is probably contributing to these weather-related extremes". This sounds self-evident ("climate contributing to weather"), suggest rephrasing (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	paragraph deleted
98	5	4	32	4	33	there is no specific identification of large & rapid population increases in this section - it refers just to 'human settlement patterns' (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	paragraph deleted
99	5	4	33	4	33	The first two sentences are all on past patterns and now in this new sentence the authors start to talk of "will" which is future. Should we talk of present or past or of both but not change abruptly from past to future in the same phrase? (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	paragraph deleted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
100	5	4	34	4	34	The notion of coping with disaster risks (latent condition) as opposed to coping with disaster as such (consumated reality) has immense implications. What are we saying in referring to coping with "disaster risks" as opposed to with disaster? Do you cope with disaster risk and also cope with disaster--if so obviously it is not the same thing and does not use the same techniques, instruments, methods or strategies. Coping with disaster risk can only mean prevention, mitigation,early warning etc actions which really is not coping but rather risk reduction-or is risk reduction also coping?.Throughout the chapter, and in some others, coping is used in all sorts of pre and post impact situations--do we intend that or should we be more specific and keep coping for post impact contexts and use other terms for society dealing with disaster risk pre impact--reduction, prevention ,mitigation etc etc? One way or another this variety of use is somewhat disconcerting for the many who believe one does not cope with risk but rather with loss, damage, crisis etc (and, consequently, conditions that determine in part future risk). This one on coping needs still to be worked out between all of us because if not we are going to have very varying usages for the term coping throughout and the outside reader is going to be eternally confused as well. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	paragraph deleted
101	5	4	35	4	38	The chapter should also deal with the issue of the determination disaster-development-disaster, the focus on response measures overlooks at the relevance of development acts that take place at the local level and are crucial in the configuration of risk and disaster scenarios (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	paragraph deleted
102	5	4	40	4	53	Local seems over-defined and elaborated to the point where the effort at definition loses the clarity you intend (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	paragraph shortened
103	5	4	40	4	53	A few references would be helpful for those who would like to know more. (IPCC WGII TSU)	paragraph shortened
104	5	4	40	5	52	This description of institutions Important at the local level totally disregards institutions of the private sector including industries, businesses and professions. These are major stakeholders with vital roles to play. Industries and businesses have major investments to protect and resources to invest in adaptation. Professions, such as architects, engineers and planners, have important skills to share (and all are not government employees). (Wright, Richard, American Society of Civil Engineers)	clarified institutions to include both public and private
105	5	4	42	4	43	The definition of "local" seems very vague - if "formal and informal governance structures" are included, it is hard to see what is not local. (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	reworded definition
106	5	4	42	4	44	It would also be good to factor in local market activity and private sector decision-making as part of the defining set of local experiences. Informal governance may have been intended to cover this, but there are also a range of important local decision-making processes that take place outside of the context of what is traditionally considered governance. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	included private sector decisionmaking in the narrative definition
107	5	4	43	0	0	grass toots actions and received experiences (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	noted
108	5	4	45	4	45	Some countries dont have provinces or states. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	noted
109	5	4	48	4	48	Is it really feasible to think in most cases of totally autonomous local action in todays globalised and integrated world? (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	diagram on interconnections included in the chapeau
110	5	5	1	5	2	And the management arrangements and levels. Given the wide range of circumstances that the authors have included under the notion of "local", we do need to be very clear and explicit as to the the fact that each of these different spatial and functional connotations of "local" means varying different approaches and contents of DRM paractice, differing stake holders, differing interest groups etc and differing relations to the national and international levels. I am not sure a single chapter can actually do justice to so many different connotations of local, defined as subnational, and give us the needed analysis pertinent to each. Thus, discussing local level management in the case of a river basin is so much different to discussing it in the case of a group of communities; an economic region is so different to an ecological region in terms of local management practice etc etc. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	noted
111	5	5	4	5	11	The definition of a community seems not to be appropriate regarding the topic of the chapter. The spatial aspect is important and essential. (Bardt, Hubertus, Cologne Institute for Economic Research)	noted
112	5	5	4	5	11	You do not explain what you mean by communities of culture. It can be inferred, but it should be made clear. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	clarified in the preceeding line
113	5	5	4	5	11	Community' is especially important in terms of Coping mechanisms (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	included
114	5	5	4	5	11	In community structure, not only common values and ideals are to be considered but also collectiveness in conciousness is very much needed. (Yasseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	noted
115	5	5	5	13	13	"Local places" is tautologous (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	changed
116	5	5	5	17	19	Extremely obscure sentence (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	modified
117	5	5	5	37	37	I do not necessarily disagree with the mention of colonial exploitation, but it desperately need references. (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	sentence modified
118	5	5	7	0	0	It is not particularly useful to define a term using "etc." (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	deleted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
119	5	5	7	0	0	Box 5.1 rather wordy (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	noted
120	5	5	13	0	0	Local places also have considerable experience with longer-term adjustments, e.g. establishment of local flood defenses, selection of drought resistant crops, etc. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	changed sentence to include this
121	5	5	13	5	13	Can "local places" have experience? Suggest replacing with "people" (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	noted
122	5	5	13	5	23	Coping with unavoidable disasters seems to be the strong idea used here, whilst this is important, risk reduction deals also with a day to day struggle to improve livelihoods, social services and environmental services, has to do also with development. DRM at the local level should then be considered in this perspective and not only with reactive-coping activities (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	sentence modified
123	5	5	16	5	16	Cf. comment 5: suggest replacing "many localities" with "people in many localities" (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	noted
124	5	5	25	5	26	This sentence is not appropriate and should be deleted. (IPCC WGII TSU)	sentence removed
125	5	5	25	5	27	Many pertinent well-developed examples found in Dekens (2009) Dekens, Julie (2007) Local Knowledge for Disaster Preparedness: A Literature Review. Kathmandu: International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development (ICIMOD) http://books.icimod.org/index.php/search/author/614 (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	paragraph removed
126	5	5	25	5	28	These seems like a random and somewhat odd paragraph given the first person reflection. One would expect you to have a grasp of these issues prior to writing the chapter rather than discovering for the first time that there are diverse strategies at the local level. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	paragraph removed
127	5	5	30	5	30	The use of the term "natural disasters" is a constant in several chapters of the draft, I feel that this is a wrong concept since is clear to all that disasters are not natural, since vulnerability and exposure are human induced conditions; as well as some climatic events that might be attributed to climate change (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	term modified to reflect disasters
128	5	5	30	5	30	Should say "developed and developing countries" (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	comment rejected
129	5	5	32	5	33	The statement "One of the most striking differences in vulnerability is that which distinguishes communities in developing countries and from those in the industrialized nations" is at odds with research showing the large variation in vulnerability within and among developed and developed and developing countries. Examples are Hurricane Katrina in the US, the vulnerability of indigenous peoples in the Arctic, and the large variations within and among developing countries (between continents, urban-rural etc.) (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	sentence deleted
130	5	5	32	5	33	is the difference only between developing and industrialized countries? What about governance issues? shouldn't other aspect not also be mentioned? one of the key messages presented in the Global Assessment Report was "Global disaster risks is highly concentrated in poorer countries with weaker governance (Global Assessment Report, 2009, p. 3) (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	sentence deleted
131	5	5	33	5	33	Figure to add: In order to illustrate the different vulnerability resp. Impact between developing and industrialized countries, the figure published by the Human Development -Report 2007/2008-Fighting Climate Change, page 76 (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	Chose not to do this; data are not the best
132	5	5	36	5	38	Please present evidence and references to support this statement about increasing disaster vulnerability. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	added reference to chapter 2
133	5	5	37	0	0	The relation between "colonial exploitation" and adaptation to extreme weather is completely unclear. This chapter is not about development issues in general - this is only one of many examples with reference to old development debates that is far from the issue of adaptation on a local level (in developing rural and urban areas as well as in industrialized countries) (Bardt, Hubertus, Cologne Institute for Economic Research)	sentence reframed to suggest that resource exploitation and development may influence vulnerability and a reference to Ch. 2 is given.
134	5	5	37	5	37	It is likely that at least one government will object to using "colonial exploitation." There should be an explanation of why development is increasing disaster vulnerability. (IPCC WGII TSU)	word deleted
135	5	5	46	7	22	Using grey literature is a general issue of this report and should be discussed in an introductory chapter, but not in the context of local level adaptation! (Bardt, Hubertus, Cologne Institute for Economic Research)	text box shortened and made more explicit to this chapter
136	5	5	46	7	22	This box does not add analysis to the chapter (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	noted
137	5	5	46	7	22	Grey literatures are used. It is an important issue. How can you trust the figures and numbers in the literature, especially in the papers of local regions. It should be paid more attention by Table 5-1 and Figure 5-1. The current Table 5-1 and Figure 5-1 do not mention it. (Zhao, Zong-Ci, National Climate Center)	these were removed from the text box
138	5	5	48	7	12	This section/ box seems completely out of place. The entire report should be using the same criteria for inclusion of grey literature and this sort of summary should be either an appendix or statement that encompasses the entire work. The fact that it is only related to this chapter raises more questions than it answers. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	text box shortened and made more explicit to this chapter

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
139	5	5	48	7	42	The discussion on grey literature is interesting but seems a bit long. It also raises a bigger question of whether we are building the needed evidence base (peer reviewed or not) for different approaches. Collectively we are not yet very rigorous in attributing outcomes to specific interventions and instead usually settle for simpler indications of correlation rather than causality. Even the peer reviewed literature often seems more rhetorical than evidence-based in this respect. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	text box shortened and made more explicit to this chapter
140	5	5	50	0	0	The word 'is' may be added between grey literature and non-journal based... (Iqbal, Muhammad Mohsin, Global Change Impact Studies Centre (GCISC))	editorial
141	5	5	50	7	9	The discussion of grey literature is very pertinent but maybe should be elsewhere as it is relevant to the whole study--except the last part of what is written that says explicitly why grey literature is so important in local level work and in developing countries in particular. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	noted
142	5	6	0	0	0	Box 5-1: this box could be relevant for other report chapters as well (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	thanks
143	5	6	4	0	0	It should be considered whether 'Personal Communication' based on some solid factual unpublished data on non-controversial issues could be included in the list of grey literature. (Iqbal, Muhammad Mohsin, Global Change Impact Studies Centre (GCISC))	noted
144	5	6	6	29	29	The primary meaning of "actionable" is "giving grounds for litigation". The meaning "allowing or leading to action" may be becoming more common, but seems best avoided. (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	section deleted
145	5	6	6	31	31	It seems neither true nor necessary to say that MOST of the literature on disaster risk is grey (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	section deleted
146	5	6	11	6	12	This grey literature box is an excellent and well written addition! This sentence referring to the IPCC should be rewritten to even better highlight the unique status of IPCC assessment reports which at least from a WG1 perspective are not considered grey literature (as opposed to IPCC meeting reports, good guidance papers etc). Something like: "IPCC assessment reports, (and other similar assessments produced by the world bank for example), represent special cases, undergoing a level of peer and public review far more extensive and rigorous than any journal publication." (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	thanks
147	5	6	19	6	20	"...concerned by its lack of rigor". References would be useful for this statement. (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	section deleted
148	5	6	21	6	21	"... and in many cases increased status." How? Further information or examples would be useful (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	section deleted
149	5	6	25	6	26	I suggest deleting this sentence as part of it is speculative and the other not needed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	section deleted
150	5	6	38	6	38	The WB and UNDP are not international governments. (IPCC WGII TSU)	section deleted
151	5	6	43	6	46	Am not sure this last sentence is necessary, and it seems to imply (probably unintentionally) that authors with a PhD are more credible than others. The excellent description given in the next section regarding how the quality of grey literature was assessed should be more than enough to give the reader confidence, such that the academic or professional background of the authors should be irrelevant. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	section deleted
152	5	6	52	7	9	The description of the approaches used in the report is written in a conditional tense. If they were actually implemented in this chapter or in the report as a whole, please say so. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	section deleted
153	5	7	1	7	6	Although the suggestion that REs provide the 'secondary evaluation' is a good one, it is currently not a part of the official role of the Review Editor as outlined in Annex 1 of Appendix A to the Principles Governing IPCC Work. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	section deleted
154	5	7	1	7	9	This section talks about what could be done, not what was done. Much better to describe what was done. (IPCC WGII TSU)	section deleted
155	5	7	7	19	19	Section 5.2 needs more discussion on the distinction, and relation, between coping and adaptation. Susanna Davies' book "Adaptable Livelihoods" is an important reference. There are also ethical issues about the use of the term coping, see Davies "Are Coping Strategies a Cop-Out?" and Morton in Mcpeak and Little for references to analogous debates on the use of "coping strategies" in the AIDS literature. A reference that could be useful here for typologies of adaptation/coping is Halsted and O'Shea, Bad Year Economics CUP, 1989), as well as the use made of it in recent articles by Agrawal and Perrin (in the volume by Adger, Lorenzoni and o'Brien and the volume by Norton and Mearns) (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	This suggestions belongs in chapter 1 where the fundamental issues are described.
156	5	7	11	7	11	Table 5-1: point 5: why only regional reports? There are also national reports available by ISDR and others? (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	table deleted
157	5	7	15	7	15	Figure 5.1 seems to accept the use of peer-reviewed literature uncritically. Somewhere in the description of procedures, it should be made clear that these approaches deal with the suitability of the source not its content and that the information contained in all suitable sources will be assessed critically - both grey and otherwise. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	figure deleted
158	5	7	20	7	20	The reason this is important is that these perspectives and voices may have critical information on how to more effectively manage the risks of extreme events and disasters. (IPCC WGII TSU)	thanks

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
159	5	7	24	7	28	These distinction developed-developing; rural and urban does not take into account typologies based on the type of hazard that the community-locality faces. For example: local disaster risk management requires diferent strategies and actions in a coastal community than in a landslide prone community. There is also a diference in the type of interventions at the local level: aimed at development with disaster risk control considerations; aimed to preparedness and response only (EWS for example); disaster risk reduction with notions of transformation and development; adaptation trough social, economical and phisical transformation, etc. (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	paragraph removed
160	5	7	24	7	28	I agree with the statements in this paragraph, but they appear inconsistent the assertion on page 5 on the difference between developed and developing countries. (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	paragraph removed
161	5	7	25	7	25	"least countries" should be "least developed" or "poorest"? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	paragraph removed
162	5	7	25	7	25	I didn't understand this sentence. (IPCC WGII TSU)	paragraph removed
163	5	7	30	7	31	The actual diagram - included at the end seems self-evident. It would make far more sense if the quadrants of the diagram were filled in to illustrate critical differences. Otherwise, this can be simply noted in the text - however, only if these points are relevant to what follows, and it is not clear that they are since these relationships are not specifically engaged in the rest of the chapter. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	diagram removed as was the paragraph
164	5	7	33	7	35	Local experience in one place is transferrable to other places 'entering' similar climate/weather conditions; thus local knowlege transfers along climate gradients, (simple eg. is in mountain systems, higher temperatures change pests which change farming patterns) (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	paragraph removed
165	5	7	33	7	42	Suggest rewriting this paragraph and adding examples. The statements are very general and some seem superfluous, such as "long-term adaptation will require that disaster risk management explicitly consider climate variability and change". (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	paragraph removed
166	5	7	33	7	42	This should be covered in the ES and not here. (IPCC WGII TSU)	agree
167	5	7	42	7	42	Take into account the grey literature allows to understand the approach and state of the art of the real decision making process, starting from the language use. The effectiveness of the future summary for policymakers of this SREX reports can be highly improved by the capacity to translate into practice scientific concepts and uncertain conclusions. The analysis, quoting and comparison with the grey literature can help in this process. (BOVO, STEFANO, ARPA Piemonte)	noted
168	5	7	45	0	0	Collectiveness may come first and then collective actions. (Yasseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	Section now in 5.3
169	5	7	45	7	45	Given the indication made at the beginning of the chapter that local refers to all sorts of sub national jursidictions including community levels it now seems from the section title that the authors have opted to consider just community based management and not deal with any of the other levels (city, metropolitan, economic regions, ecosystems, river basins, etc) which are in fact probably more important from a risk and local level risk management angle . But, even here, despite the title of section 5.2 which refers to community coping alone, most of the subsections that are developed afterwards deal with things that at times far exceed the community level. This contradiction or lack of specification requires clarification or rectification. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	This has been dealt with by changing the heading of the section
170	5	7	45	7	45	Coping is only conceived at the community level, what happens with municipalities, provinces, states, etc. (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	This has been dealt with by changing the heading of the section
171	5	7	45	15	49	This whole section seemed a bit unfocused to me. I would have also expected to see more discussion of approaches to coping though formal and informal governance processes, grassroots efforts, private sector roles, etc. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	The changed structure of the section will hopefully address these issues. Issues of informal and formal governance should be covered under collective action and the section 'local government and non-government initiatives and practices (new 5.3.7)
172	5	7	47	7	47	Sentence "Communities everywhere have developed ways of interacting with their environment" doesn't add much as it stands. Suggest being more specific, e.g. saying that communities have developed knowledge, skills and management systems. (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	The suggested changes have been inserted
173	5	7	47	7	54	This paragraph well illustrates the varying uses of the notion of coping- from relations with environment (every day life), to dealing with disaster (post impact) , to coping with disaster risk and climate sensitive hazards (pre impact). Can we really sustain this idea of coping being everything throughout the risk or disaster continuum, and if so how do we distinguish coping from prevention ,mitigation, reduction, response, reconstruction, development etc etc as DRM practices and notions? (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	noted
174	5	7	48	0	0	It would be useful to give an example of the type of livelihood you are referencing. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Not sure that this is possible as there is such a great range of subsistence and commercial, agricultural and industrial livelihoods that are being refered to

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
175	5	7	51	7	53	Statements regarding changes in magnitude and/or frequency of extreme events must be consistent with Chapter 3; rephrase to include necessary specificity and qualifiers as provided in Chapter 3. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	This is a very conditional sentence and as it does not refer to any specific type of climate extreme it is not appropriate or possible to use the types of certainty or likelihood qualifiers.
176	5	7	51	7	54	Whilst is mentioned that "social, political or economic processes..." reduce abilities to cope, they are not threatened in more detail in the next part of section 5.2 (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	This is covered elsewhere in the chapter under a variety of the headings. This is a general point to stress that vulnerability is not just about exposure to the hazard
177	5	7	53	5	53	is it only social, political or economic processes which are reducing the abilities of communities? What about human induced processes, but also physical processes can hamper coping abilities... (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	Have inserted the word 'environmental' in the list of processes.
178	5	7	53	7	53	These factors also are increasing resilience in some communities. It is important to ensure that such statements are balanced and present appropriately nuanced interpretations. (IPCC WGI TSU)	changed 'reducing' to 'affecting'
179	5	7	53	7	54	Please present evidence and references to support this general statement about other processes. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Added Wisner et al., 2004; Adger and Brown, 2009
180	5	8	1	8	1	is it any kind of disaster or do you want to particularly emphasize on hydrometeorological disasters? Maybe a more recent publication to mention would be advisable like the Global Assessment Report on Disaster Risk Reduction "Risk and poverty in a changing climate" published in 2009 which clearly confirms what UNDP and ISDR in 2004 already stated. Or the Human Development Report of 2007-2008 which estimates that 98% of all people affected by climate disasters from 2000 to 2004 were living in the developing world (UNDP, 2007: Human Development Report 2007-2008-Fighting climate change, page 8). (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	This paragraph has been deleted
181	5	8	5	0	0	Cut the word "existing" (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	This paragraph has been deleted
182	5	8	5	8	9	This paragraph again confirms the use of coping at all times, pre, during and post impact. Given this is the approach taken by the authors--personally I think this is an erroneous use of the notion of coping, but we can bear with that for now- it seems necessary in all the following subsections to reorder them to have a logical sequence of activities and actions that first deals with pre impact, next impact, next recovery, for example. At present pages 8 to 15 deal with very different things that take place at different moments but which are not ordered necessarily according to the sequence of those different risk continuum or disaster cycle moments--preparedness, response, recovery etc. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	This paragraph has been deleted
183	5	8	5	8	9	This paragraph needs references. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	This paragraph has been deleted
184	5	8	5	8	9	In my opinion there is more than preparation (EWS, evacuation, disaster relief) and physical measures (structural or non structural), other factors of vulnerability such as lack of incomes, unstable livelihoods, access to social services, enhancement of LOCAL institutionality (these deals with local govts not only communities) (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	This paragraph has been deleted
185	5	8	5	8	9	many more: e.g. secure storage, livelihood diversification, crop/resource diversification, traditional insurance and support systems, psychological cultural adaptation, religious ceremonies, prayer (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	This paragraph has been deleted
186	5	8	5	8	9	Paragraph is missing references (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	This paragraph has been deleted
187	5	8	5	8	9	I have some difficulties with the sequence and listing of the different activities which are not very logical to me.... Possible suggestion: These include measures before, during and after a disaster, 'inter alia': prevention and preparedness measures such as disaster risk education, early warning systems, structural measures (e.g. seawall and levees) and non-structural measures (e.g. awareness raising and capacity building) as well as activities during emergency and the rehabilitation phase (individual and collective actions such as evacuation). (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	This paragraph has been deleted
188	5	8	6	8	6	Pre-event activities should also include spatial planning. This corresponds to the Hyogo Framework for Action (ISDR). (Asphjell, Torgrim, Climate and Pollution Agency (Norway))	This paragraph has been deleted
189	5	8	8	49	0	The USAID FEWS network needs including here. The Box also needs to make it clearer that many of these sources of warning information are primarily oriented towards national and international actors like international food relief agencies, and the availability of information to communities is of secondary importance if any. (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	Box on FEWSNet added
190	5	8	12	0	0	For all of section 5.2.1 it would be useful to use headers that are the same as those in the paragraph that blueprints the section. The section is long so it would be helpful at the start of some of the subsections to reiterate the intent of the section. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Unsure as if the reviewer is referring to all of Section 5.2 since 5.2.1 is < 1 page
191	5	8	12	9	25	This section on EWS overlaps with other section in chapter 6 where is a more in depth look at the EWS potentials and limits. Seems necessary to decide in which chapter it should remain to avoid repetition (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Noted. The EWS information here is meant to overlap since the both Chapters require similar information. The relevant sections are coordinated in both chapters
192	5	8	16	8	17	Please clarify the sentence starting with Effective "early warning".. The meaning of the sentence is unclear (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	New clarifying sentence added. Effectiveness connotes the development and delivery that is used for managing risks and reducing impact.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
193	5	8	18	8	18	"This backdrop is reinforced ... ": Not clear what "this backdrop" refers to - suggest rephrasing (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Text add to explain to explain "backdrop". The importance of the backdrop of underlying assumptions about vulnerability is reinforced through lessons
194	5	8	19	8	20	Please explain a bit in more detail why the existence of predictable climate variability and impacts are necessary...to achieve effective use of climate information. The idea is not revealed to a non-professional. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	Sentence restated . It is now widely accepted that the existence of and confidence in skilful predictions of climate variability and impacts are critical but not
195	5	8	26	8	26	Reference should read "Patt and Gwata, 2002" (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Spelling changed
196	5	8	28	8	28	why not concretely name what you mean by providers and users. For instance the lack of collaboration between scientists and practitioners etc. (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	Not all providers are scientists
197	5	8	29	8	29	mistrust seems misplaced here (IPCC WGII TSU)	Sentence restated.as well as differing cultural values, understanding, and mistrust among research and practitioner communities
198	5	8	32	8	35	Sentence "Policies and actions ..." is very unclear - suggest shortening and rephrasing. (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	The existence of communications infrastructure that support advanced warning have major impacts on the adaptive capacity
199	5	8	32	8	37	should include the wide range of accumulated and constructed local knowledge of hazards and risks, and of local traditional mechanisms for disseminating (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Agree. Text and references added in later discussion
200	5	8	49	8	49	Risk and vulnerability are used as they were diferent, but the second is included in the first. Sometimes also have the feeling that we are writing about hazards, not risk as a more complex situation that also considers exposition and vulnerability (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Sentence re-edited toThere are many sources of physical risk, social vulnerability, and warning information
201	5	8	49	8	54	These are all formal and large scale sources that maybe should be complimented with more local and community based sources given the section is on community coping. All the work with participatory risk and vulnerability analysis at local and community levels really falls under the notion of generation of risk information, so why not deal with that here as well? The World Bank financed CAPRA system in Central America is another source at local and other levels. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FIACSO))	Agree. CAPRA and other examples added to text.
202	5	8	49	8	54	There are many more sources of information worldwide. For a balanced international report, there are far to many US institutions mentioned. The whole chapter is a mix of a strong US perspective and a strong rural development perspective. (Bardt, Hubertus, Cologne Institute for Economic Research)	Additional institutions included in text.
203	5	8	49	8	54	What is the point of this listing of organizations? It seems like a fairly ad hoc listing. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	These are examples. The tradeoff is btween including as many as possible (I.e. all that have a basis in the literature which will be beyond text limits) or illustrative examples. Sentence restated to make that point
204	5	8	49	8	54	Box 5-2: (i) what are the criteria to mention these particular information platforms and not others? What about national platforms like the Prevention web promotes: e.g. http://www.preventionweb.net/english/hyogo/national/?pid:223&pil:1 . (ii) Further, it maybe helpful to add the link to these platforms.... (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	These are meant to be examples (see comment above) will consider adding websites as supplementary material.
205	5	9	2	9	8	The list of types of media is very general and most of the points could refer to almost anything (ex. "web site development and maintenance"). Suggest specifying or deleting (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	These are used by different organizationa to different degrees. Sentence added to calrigy--website development (e.g. Provention Consortium and ReliefWeb)
206	5	9	13	9	24	This paragraph contains a number of awkward and vague sentences. Overall, it needs to be better elaborated and clarified. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Paragraph re-edited as suggested. Elaboration contingent on page limits especially since an earlier comment by the same reviewer noted that the Section was too lengthy
207	5	9	15	9	15	Reference to Sorensen 2000 seems outdated to support the argument that management and dissemination is "still problematic" (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Newer references added
208	5	9	21	9	23	What is "reverse 911"? Suggest also noting that the problem is not only the existence of warning systems: many of the poorest and most vulnerable people and communities, for example in Africa, would not have access to radios and other equipment that could transmit them (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Agree. 911 which is US specific, deletd. "access" explicitly discussed in text
209	5	9	22	0	0	911 is a very US specific term (Bardt, Hubertus, Cologne Institute for Economic Research)	Agree. Deleted
210	5	9	23	0	0	more examples from south and souteast Asia IN. Dekens, Julie (2007) Local Knowledge for Disaster Preparedness: A Literature Review. Kathmandu: International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development (ICIMOD) http://books.icimod.org/index.php/search/author/614 (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Agree. Dekens citation/reference added
211	5	9	30	9	31	This seems overstated. We also have evidence that households will take risky behavior (e.g., not leaving a location even though there are early warning systems) (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Noted. I have inserted 'often' prior to engage indicating that not all individuals seek to avoid risk
212	5	9	30	9	48	There should be examples from developing countries. There is the oft-used example of Bangladesh, where cultural factors resulted in women and children not using evacuation shelters. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Added a couple of sentences on Bangladesh citing Ikeda and Paul et al.
213	5	9	30	10	22	The notion of volunteerism, including many successes, is not mentioned. (Kull, Daniel, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC))	Noted but disagree as to its importance in this section.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
214	5	9	30	10	53	This section on collective and individual action deals with action for evaluation and with the moral economy which operated in post impact conditions. But there is nothing on the collective and individual actions for risk reduction preimpact as is the case in the section on information--although even there it is not easy at times to distinguish when the discussion is about pre, during and post impact moments (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	Much of this is covered in other sections such as sandbagging, microinsurance, food preservation etc. I don't think we need to address it here.
215	5	9	30	10	6	"Collective Action": the main emphasis in this section is on evacuation or in situ protection. But many other collective actions to minimise hazard impacts eg. Local flood protection, drainage, fire breaks, joint pest control, growing and storing famine foods, etc , (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	As above
216	5	9	38	9	48	Can you follow with a comparison or contrast with other countries so it is possible to assess the extent to which these findings can be generalized? (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Have added stuff on Bangladesh
217	5	9	39	9	48	Evacuations in the US are not the most common example of community evacuation exercises, there is a lack of information of how the processes are stuck by other factors such of lack of insurance, absence of roads, no shelter to go to, protection of the few possessions families have in Latin America as well in Asia, for instance (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Have added stuff on Bangladesh
218	5	9	50	10	6	a major reason for not evacuating is to protect home property - often males will remain at the property to guard it (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	added to sentence.
219	5	10	8	10	10	In Europe, there is EU level legislation concerning protective actions (such as the Flood directive). Also, in Scandinavia, there are regulations and guidelines at the state, regional and local levels, that oblige individuals and communities to protective actions. There are of course also voluntary actions, but they are not the only type of protective actions taken in Europe. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	This is not relevant in the context of individual and collective action as used in this section. Local government is covered later and the issue raised in this comment also has international and national components (Chapters 6 and 7)
220	5	10	10	46	47	In the pastoralist literature, particularly G.Oba in Nomadic Peoples, a rather different but equally relevant point is made that the scale and co-variance of drought losses is now undermining traditional livestock-sharing mechanisms in the face of drought. (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	I think this refers to lines 46-47 on page 10; have added a sentence referring to Ob's work.
221	5	10	12	10	14	You might add a sentence or two about the effectiveness of the Cuba approach. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Done
222	5	10	16	10	22	The paragraph assumes that such informal mechanisms no longer exist, which is not true, even if many such systems have changed or are weaker now than in the past (as exemplified by box 5-3). Indeed, it is at odds with section 5.3.5.4 which discusses social norms. (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Have added a sentence saying informal networks are still important with cross-reference to section 5.3.5
223	5	10	24	10	40	What is the message? This system is similar to a collective insurance. Should collective insurances be introduced? That does the last three lines (colonialism, cash economy, Christianity) lead to??? (Bardt, Hubertus, Cologne Institute for Economic Research)	The decline of traditional systems of disaster risk reduction is well documented. This is an outcome of changes to social and political organisation (colonialism), economy(capitalism) and religion which make traditional systems of disaster risk reduction difficult to sustain. Have added some parenthetical statements to clarify this)
224	5	10	26	10	38	What is a "moral economy." It sounds like feudalism to me. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	Moral economy is described in previous paragraph: 16-22
225	5	10	28	10	38	normal in pre-colonial Africa, 'tributary systems": chiefs / headmen accumulated surplus in good years and redistributed it in lean yaers, thus maintaining their social dominant position cf. Opha Pauline Dube and M. B.M. Sekhwela (2007) Community Coping Strategies in Semi-arid Limpopo Basin Part of Botswana: Enhancing Adaptation Capacity to Climate Change. Washington DC: AIACC Working Paper No. 47 www.aiaccproject.org (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Added a sentence using this reference
226	5	10	28	10	38	Please I feel I want to know here more about "Suqe" and " Vanuatu". (Yasseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	Done re Vanuatu. Without going into much greater detail can't really add more about the suqe than what is there
227	5	10	28	10	38	Box 5-3: I guess it would be good to give some geographical information about Vanuatu: an island nation in the South Pacific Ocean (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	Done
228	5	10	36	0	0	Paulson is quoted two times in the same parentheses (leblois, antoine, CIRED)	Done

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
229.1	5	10	38	10	29	The hint to moral economy is a very good contribution. However, it looks like this is rather related to the past than to the present. I thinks this is fortunately not true. I therefore suggest to add the following sentences in line 39: " Although the concept of moral economy is generally associated to the transition of pre-capitalist to capitalist societies (in the past) it is important to point out that significant features of moral economy, such as reciprocity, barter, crop sharing and other forms of cooperation between families and communities or community bases management of agricultural lands, water or woods are still part of the social reality of developing countries that cannot be considered anymore as pre-capitalist. Many studies show that moral economy bases social relationships are still present e.g. in traditional institutions of regulating access, use and on-going redistribution of community owned land (Rist 2000, Pestalozzi 2000; Rist et al. 2003, Delgado & Ponce 2001, Hughes 2001, Jeffry & Sundar 199, Trawick 2001). This means that the revitalization, enhancement and innovation of such moral economy based knowledge, technologies and forms of cooperation and interfamily organization represents an important and still existing source of fostering collective action that serves as an enabling condition for preventing and dealing with hazards related to natural resource management. For this reason the systematization, integration and revitalization of traditional ecological knowledge (TEC) and corresponding forms of socio-economic and ecological organization are constituting an important strategy for enhancing adequate local conditions for dealing with environmental risks (Rist and Delgado, 2009). Examples range from forecasting of "El Niño" in South America (Orlove et al. 2000), drought and famine prevention in Africa (Ifejika Speranza et al. 2008) and India (Kani, 2006). Delgado F, Ponce D. 2001. Local markets and indigenous logic. COMPAS News Letter 5 (Dec 01). Ifejika Speranza C, Kiteme B, Wiesmann U. 2008. Droughts and famines: The underlying factors and the causal links among agro-pastoral households in semi-arid Makueni district, Kenya. Global Environmental Change 18 220-233. Jeffery R, Sundar N (Eds.). 1999. A New Moral Economy for Indian Forests? Discourses of Community and Participation, Sage Publications. Kanani P. 2006. Testing of Traditional Methods of Weather Forecasting in Gujarat Using the Participatory Approach, in: Balasubramanian, AV and Devi, NTD (eds). Traditional Knowledge Systems of India and Sri Lanka. Chennai, COMPAS & Centre for Indian Knowledge Systems (CIKS), p.125-144. McDermott Hughes D. 2001. Cadastral Politics: The Making of Community-Based Resource Management in Zimbabwe and Mozambique. Development & Change 32 (4) 741-768. Orlove B, Chiang J, Cane M. 2000. Forecasting Andean rainfall and crop yield from the influence of El Niño on Pleiades visibility. Nature 403 (6) 68-71. Pestalozzi H. 2000. Sectoral Fallow Systems and the Management of Soil Fertility: The Rationality of Indigenous Knowledge in the High Andes of Bolivia. Mountain Research and Development 20 (1) 64-71. Rist S, Delgado F, Wiesmann U. 2003. The role of Social Learning Processes in the Emergence and Development of Aymara Land Use Systems. Mountain Research and Development 23 (3) 263-270. Rist S, Delgado F. 2009. Strengthening endogenous knowledge production through intercultural dialogue, in: Hoffmann, V, Christinck, A, and Lemma, M (eds). Rural Extension Manual - Revised 3rd edition. Hohenheim, University of Hohenheim, GTZ, CTA Margraf publishers, p.346-353. Rist S. 2000. Linking Ethics and Market - Campesino Economic Strategies in the Bolivian Andes. Mountain Research and Development 20 (4) 310-315. Trawick P. 2001. The moral economy of water: Equity and antiquity in the Andean commons. American Anthropologist 103 (2) 361-379. (Rist, Stephan, Centre for Development and Environment (CDE))	Should this person be included as a contributing author? I have edited this and placed a very large chunk into the text. He was added.
229.2	5	10	38	10	29	Migration to cities/mega-cities may further threaten the loss of traditional coping mechanisms by breaking the traditional village and kinship networks. (Grynszpan, Delphine, UK Health Protection Agency)	I am not sure where the citations for this may come from. There is quite a lot on migration caused by disasters and about migration destinations becoming increasingly at risk, but I couldn't find anything on migration increasing vulnerability at the point of origin. There is a case that kinship networks are not broken by migration and that remittances actually are a positive disaster response.
230	5	10	46	10	47	What types of constraints do they face? How does this affect their ability to mobilize? (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Doesn't this sentence give two examples of constraints? :However, there are many constraints that these movements face in building effective coalitions including the need to connect with other movement organizations and frame the problem in an accessible way ((McCormick, 2010)).
231	5	10	49	10	53	Too little attention paid to "collective action" (4 lines) specially when the most common practice is to build on community capacity on the basis of Local committees for DRR or emergency response. In Latin America a common way to build a national system is to consider the national, province, municipal and community level; in this case local population is encouraged and supported to integrate and cooperate with local-community organization (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	While this paragraph specifically refers to collective action, much of the entire section is about collective action. Also response to comment 229 also helps to further addresses this issue.
232	5	10	49	10	53	Collective action might need collective consciousness first. Maybe we need more information in the system of collectivity here so we can make use of it in other instances. (Yasseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	Added 2 sentences on community based approaches to DRR and CCA as ways of building awareness
233	5	11	0	13	0	The chapter seems to change suddenly towards physical impacts from its initial focus on livelihoods. To my eyes, this seems a bit of a sudden transition. (Forsyth, Tim, London School of Economics and Political Science)	No longer relevant as structure of chapter has been changed
234	5	11	2	11	14	Please include buildings to "structures" mentioned in this paragraph. (Yasseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	This has been addressed by additional text

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
236	5	11	2	11	45	Most of the attention goes to floodings, structural measures for heat waves and droughts, for instance, are not considered (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	This has been addressed by additional text
237	5	11	2	12	45	These two sections deal with themes that are relevant to many levels of "local" as defined in this chapter but here we must assume that the authors are dealing with community based structural mechanisms and land use and ecosystem protection given the title of the section is "Community" coping mechanisms. But if you read the sections it is not clear why this is community based and not river basin based , or city based or whatever--few communities can in fact get on top of these aspects at their community level and require higher jurisdictional support. Moreover, here we are also seeing that building codes, structural mechanisms and land use planning are "coping" mechanisms as opposed to risk reduction , prevention or mitigation methods. Coping has thus taken over all other denominations and categories of analysis and action, and has become a pandoras box for every thing DRM purports to do. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	This problem has been resolved by the changes to heading titles meaning that local is being used much more generically and 'coping' is used much less.
238	5	11	4	11	14	This paragraph is not cohesive - there are quite a few ideas strung together with insufficient elaboration. It seems like this paragraph should be fleshed out and moved to the end of this subsection to provide a counterpoint to the more general discussion of technical measures. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	The above changes (235-237) have elaborated further on some aspects of the paragraph.
239	5	11	4	11	14	The paragraph is difficult to follow (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	Disagree
240	5	11	5	11	7	In my opinion it is not only the lack of maintenance or due to extreme events. Structural measures alone are insufficient and are unlikely to be effective if introduced without fully informing people or consulting them on the design so that the ownership is within the community. Further, it is the capacities and the awarness resp. the understanding of the DRR concept which makes communities to act effectively. The establishment of structural measures wihout the accompnment of non-structural measures is most likely to end in a failure as numerous past experiences have shown. (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	This is pretty much covered later in the section
241	5	11	7	0	0	You probably mean the magnitude of extreme events. This seems like a good point to bring this back to CC and the potential for greater intensity and severity of events. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	have added 'such as river and coastal floods'
242	5	11	7	11	7	Since structural solutions are intended to last, why are they short-term solutions. Provide clarification. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	sentence rewritten to explain this a bit more
243	5	11	7	11	8	It seems like what you are getting at here is that technical considerations take place within socio-political contexts. I make this distinction since you dedicate a portion of the discussion to cost-benefit, so that addresses some of the economic issues. However, what you seem to be trying to point out is that technical measures require local support and benefit from local knowledge. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Have changed ' socio-economic' to 'social and cultural'. As noted in the comment economic considerations are dealt with in a later paragraph.
244	5	11	8	11	11	References to 5.3.5.5 could be integrated into the reference. Additionally, the keyword indiginous knowledge could also be mentioned and more work on indiginous knowledge in DRR could be quoted (e.g."Koen Meyers, "Simeulue, Nias and Siberut: Indigenous Practices and Lessons Learned," in Indigenous Practices and Lessons Learned for Disaster Risk Reduction, eds. UN/ISDR and Kyoto University," Or "Newhouse, David, "Indigenous Knowledge in a Multicultural World." Native Studies Review 15, no. 2 (2004): 139-154." (Ammann, Walter J., Global Risk Forum GRF Davos)	Have added the cross reference -- the other comments relate to section 5.3.5.5
245	5	11	9	5	10	Important point. Where are citations? (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	disagree with reviewer
246	5	11	10	5	11	Only Action Aid is cited. Is it a scholarly source? (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	Yes
247	5	11	12	11	14	You might add a sentence or two about the possible consequences of only relying on technocratic responses. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The implications of technocratic approaches are covered two paragraphs later with discussion of levee effect.
248	5	11	16	11	25	The paragraph should also mention the effect of strucural interventions on surrounding communities (such as flood protection structures increasing flood risks downstream) (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Have added sentence on this
249	5	11	21	11	21	Figure 5.3 is not necessary, delete. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Figure removed
250	5	11	24	11	25	Please provide more references (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	done
251	5	11	25	0	0	A small point: the reference to vertiver grass as a solution is a bit of a chestnut in Southeast Asia and Thailand specifically. It has been introduced as a way to 'stabilize' slopes under the belief that erosion is a main risk. But a lot of experience has shown that sometimes the grass strips do not prevent erosion; and that sometimes erosion is not the problem, but soil fertility (with or without erosion) is. Indeed, it is a source of long-term debate between different interventionists since the 1980s. The Thai-Australian (World Bank) project considered grass strips as THE solution. The Thai-Belgian project, however, saw nitrogen fixation and changing farming systems as a better solution. The point of my comment is that this paragraph in this Chapter seems to be very 'off the shelf' in terms of suggesting solutions - but in fact it assumes that the main impacts of extreme events will be physical risks to slopes, rather than understanding that many farmers have already moved on from needing slopes to be stabilized. (See Forsyth, T., and Walker, A. 2008: Forest Guardians, Forest destroyers, Seattle: University of Washington Press, for more info re Thailand). (Forsyth, Tim, London School of Economics and Political Science)	included reference to this study and the debate
252	5	11	30	11	30	Cost benefit analysis is used to implement measures? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Changed to 'decision making ... is often based on ...'
253	5	11	34	11	34	Please define the term catastrophic potential (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	changed to: 'potential for catastrophic disasters'

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
254	5	11	35	0	0	What is a supra-design event? (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	changed to: 'events that exceed the engineering design level'
255	5	11	35	5	36	I don't dispute that levees can increase development in areas that would not be developed. If they fail, there can be more loss than if they had not been built. But is that the entire story. Did levees enable people to make productive use of land (while the levees stood)? If so, what was gained from the productive use of the land and how does that compare w/ what was lost. The Dutch have long relied on coastal protection. Have they been wrong? (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	Added: 'While protection works often enable areas to be productively used and will continue to be needed for areas that are already densely settled, ...'
256	5	11	41	11	45	Burby, et al offer a more nuanced argument. It is not just about noncompliance, but about the way in which the entire system functions (i.e., it is not just about implementation, but about inspections, government systems, and governance mechanisms). (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Inserted: 'associated with inadequate inspection, and ineffective systems of local government and governance'
257	5	11	41	11	45	In this paragraph building codes are mentioned, which consolidates the previous comment. (Yasseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	Yes, noted. Also made changes in response to earlier comment
258	5	11	43	11	44	Please clarify the sentence starting with "One dilemma..." and perhaps explain in more detail what types of problems are there with implementation of the building codes at local level. At least in Finland the compliance of building code is controlled; if however, a building is damaged in a flood event because of noncompliance of building code, no compensation of damages is paid to the owner. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	While this may bne the case in some jurisdictions, building codes are often not complied with. This is evidenced by 'leaky building syndrome' in many parts of the developed world. In many developing countries issues of compliance are even more problematical. Have modified the tone of the sentences and hopefully changes made in response to comment 256 will also help clarify the issue.
259	5	11	44	11	44	Constrain examples to those extreme events that have a potential climate change signal. Earthquakes do not. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Have deleted the reference to earthquakes, though we should be able to learn from non-climatic hazards as well as those which are solely hvrometeorological.
260	5	11	44	11	44	I didn't understand this sentence. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Sentence modified in response to comment 258
261	5	11	48	0	0	Reference citations in this section are a bit odd and are not consistent with the normal (last name, year) approach used throughout SREX. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Editorial issue to do with RefWorks
262	5	11	50	12	45	This could say more about the need for appropriate (flexible and communal) land tenure as a prerequisite for maintaining pastoral mobility - see Anderson Morton and Toulmin in the 2009 volume by Norton and Mearns, as well as references above (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	Sentence added
263	5	11	51	12	1	It needs to be checked whether so many names mentioned pertain to some single reference or different references (Iqbal, Muhammad Mohsin, Global Change Impact Studies Centre (GCISC))	Couldn't track down the first reference (Brown et al.). Doesn't appear to be in Land Use Policy. The second one does have all these authors. It must be a RefWorks problem that the citation hasn't been shortened.
264	5	12	1	12	2	The phrase starts with disaster management and then goes on to talk of disaster risk management as if this was the same thing. This is contradictory and I think we should be consistent and insist that disaster management is just that, managing disasters once they are about to , and have occurred and that DRM is more inclusive pre and post impact. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FIACSO))	Have removed the more general 'disaster management'
265	5	12	7	12	9	It would be interesting to know a little more of the causes and circumstances under which buffer zones, setback lines and inundation zones can result in controversies and lack of enforcement and then bring about temporary resettlement etc. The causal links are not evident to a reader not familiar with the issue. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	Sentence modified to give eamples of controversies and changed 'bring about' to 'often enables'
266	5	12	8	12	8	What does "lack of enforcement" refer to here? How can buffer zones, setback lines etc. lead to lack of enforcement? (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	clarified: 'lack of enforcement of these planning measures'
267	5	12	11	12	16	Are formal systems less appropriate or less prevelant in these contexts? Also, the inference at the end of the paragraph is that formal approaches are inappropriate in informal settlements. This is inaccurate. The paragraph needs more clarification and elabroation to bring forward what I believe is the intent - that in certain types of settlements there are limited services and DRR measures due to their legality and, as a result, informal measures emerge. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Added to end of last sentence in paragraph: 'and in many cases are informal measures rather than those imposed by governments at the local level'
268	5	12	18	12	30	(urban) population growth has made this much more difficult, socially as well as financially (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Added population growth in coastal areas and flood plains in many parts of the world
269	5	12	19	12	20	Many jurisdictions have not used eminent domain as a DRR measure, but it has been considered in the context of informal settlements and as a means for managing SLR. This is a place where CC could be integrated more squarely into the discussion. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	added climate change
270	5	12	22	12	24	Land acquisition is rarely used also in developing countries to the lack of resources and even land; but specially because of the lack of political willingness (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	sentence modified to include this
271	5	12	32	12	45	Be careful with the inclusion of 2011 references to be sure that they will meet the literature cut off dates. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Material has now been published
272	5	12	32	12	45	Ecosystem based adaptation should is not fully developed in this section, ignoring for example the relation between drought-floods and deforestation (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	example included

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
273	5	12	32	12	45	plus many risk-reducing environmental services provided by sound upper watershed management, forest management, carbon sequestration, etc (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	idea inserted
274	5	12	32	12	45	In my opinion, this last paragraph could be longer as the issue of ecosystem conservation is an important one and central in adaptation and disaster risk management. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	paragraph bolstered to include idea
275	5	12	42	12	45	Correctly notes the importance of integrating structural and ecosystem approaches in contrast to 2.41.30-37. (Wright, Richard, American Society of Civil Engineers)	Noted
276	5	12	51	12	51	"In pre-colonial times...": Sentence seems to suggest, wrongly, that such systems only existed in pre-colonial times. There is little doubt they were stronger and more prevalent then, but a number of studies have documented such systems throughout the colonial times and up to the present (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Changed sentence to reflect these comments
277	5	12	51	12	52	There are other examples, where countries had a food surplus in colonial times and did export food products! What does the many references to colonialism mean regarding adaptation of extreme events on a local level?? (Bardt, Hubertus, Cologne Institute for Economic Research)	There is ample evidence that colonialism brought about social, political, economic and religious changes that saw many traditional practices, some of which were critically important for sustaining resilience, replaced or curtailed
278	5	12	53	12	53	By my understanding, "ensiled" means stored so as to encourage anaerobic fermentation, as with certain types of cattle feed - not I think what is intended here. (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	That actually is what is intended here. These foods were sealed in leaves and buried for up to and sometimes more than one year. Changed the sentence anyway .
279	5	13	3	13	5	At least in Latin American prepositioning of equipment and materiales is not usual at all at indgenous communities. This statement is not true for all situations (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	added the modifier 'many'
280	5	13	5	14	36	Emmigration should also be seen from the place where immigrants go (in the case of voluntary as well as forced migrations) where they are more or less accepted. It could also be mentioned that when some people stay on the affected place, they can benefit from migrants help such as remittances from their previous social networks that can be perpetuated (there is a large recent literature on the topic, for instance "The formation of risk sharing networks" M Fafchamps, F Gubert Journal of Development Economics, 2007) as they are, initially, often used as risk sharing networks. (leblouis, antoine, CIRED)	The reference seems to be more about moral economy than migration and remittances (the word isn't used in the article). Have include a reference to remittances in this section. There is also already reference in the section on the possible effects of relocatees on their destinations.
281	5	13	7	13	11	rationing is in many countries not only done at the level of households but at the community level. Each household contributes to the storage as much as they can so that there is a kind of social system for supporting the extreme poor and poor. Experiences observed in Mali, Bangladesh etc. In the case of Mali, women even have an extra storage which is used during lean periods (cf. Clot, 2008: Highlighting local coping strategies for droughts. Published in: Gender Perspectives: Integrating DRR into CCA, ISDR, 2008). See also photo sent with the two storages. (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	noted
282	5	13	7	13	11	This information is repeated elsewhere in the chapter. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Searched rest of chapter for 'rations', 'rationing' and found nothing. There are references to food elsewhere but not to rationing it.
283	5	13	13	13	18	Rationing is more like an effect of climate related disasters not a "coping" measure (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Respectfully disagree with this -- shortages might occur as a result of a disaster, but rationing is a way of 'coping' with the shortage.
284	5	13	13	13	18	growing of special 'famine' foods (cassava in many places), traditional systems of surplus storage and redistribution (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Not sure what is meant here but Chapter does refer to both surpluses and famine foods by way of a Pacific island example. This is 2 paragraphs previous to this one. The section on moral economy (new 5.3.1) is a bout redistribution
285	5	13	13	13	18	The paragraph should refer to the study by Corbett (1988, in World Development) and related literature showing the stages of coping with food shortages (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Corbett included in the reference and migration added to the list responses to famine
286	5	13	33	13	33	not only "electricity rationing" but also "electricity storage (directly or indirectly with storage of water)" may also be required (Rothstein, Benno, University of Applied Forest Sciences Rottenburg)	Added storage to sentence
287	5	13	37	13	37	After "... listed above." Please add the following sentence: "Clear rules which consumer has priority in using water or electricity might be useful." (Rothstein, Benno, University of Applied Forest Sciences Rottenburg)	Inserted: does this mean he is a contributing author?
288	5	13	38	13	38	You might want to consider rephrasing that using fossil fuels is maladaptive; carbon capture and storage and other technologies may permit use of fossil fuels without increasing GHG emissions. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Sentence modified to include this
289	5	13	41	13	46	Triage is not a disaster risk reduction measure, again is a result of disaster impacts (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Disagree but have deleted 'triage' and replace with prioritize.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
290	5	13	41	13	46	Triage (as the term is used in healthcare) is correctly described here as categorizing and prioritizing patients - it also involves/informs the decision process of where to dispatch patients. Triage however is not a means to ration healthcare in time of disasters: it is an organizational process that is routinely used to streamline medical care (although the triage process may be more discreet when you make an appointment with your family doctor than when in the aftermath of a disaster with many casualties). Rationing is a different process, and could be applied regardless of whether a triage system was set up or not. It may be more informative to focus the paragraph on rationing and the constraints to accessing care (eg: increase in demand for medical care combined with limited/damaged resources, fewer staff, loss of weather-sensitive medication, damaged roads limiting patient transport, etc). (Grynszpan, Delphine, UK Health Protection Agency)	Disagree but have deleted 'triage' and replace with prioritize.
291	5	13	42	13	42	Triage is used incorrectly (IPCC WGII TSU)	Disagree but have deleted 'triage' and replace with prioritize.
292	5	13	49	14	36	One major challenge to relocation and/or migration of populations (particularly by property owners in countries without property insurance systems) from inundated land due to sea-level rise or other river flooding will be the barriers to relocation the investment connected to property that will not/cannot be resold in the market. Particularly middle-class homeowners will be impacted by their investments that are "stuck in place." In addition, movement of communities might also be impeded by political boundaries and the availability of land to which they might relocate. Quite a few citations for these are available. (Tiefenbacher, John, Texas State University)	Have added the problem of investment in property at risk though I couldn't find any reference to support it. Movement across political boundaries (presumably national borders, in most cases at least) should it be covered in chapter 7
293	5	13	51	14	36	References to pastoral migration needed - pastoralists habitually migrate but can "cope" by altering migration patterns to go further, or into areas normally unavailable by reason of conflict, presence of pests and diseases or as private property or protected areas. (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	Done
294	5	13	51	14	36	Migration is a huge topic; in the present topic there are only a few elements which are mentioned and it is far from complete; on the other hand, the example of Arizona is quite specific. In my opinion there should be a better balance of giving more an overall view about the different issues concerned with migration. E.g. migration has a huge impact at the household level: e.g. after hurricane Mitch significant increase in female-headed households (in Nicaragua: from 24% to 40%) (c.f. Gender and Post-Disaster Reconstruction: The case of Hurricane Mitch in Honduras and Nicaragua www.sheltercentre.org/sites/default/files/WB_GenderAndPostDisasterReconstruction.doc). Also during pre-disaster situations , migration of male labour has significant impact on the household level resp. community level. (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	I have added som references to this section. Unfortunately the page for the reference given was not able to found on the web. Have also changed the order of the paragraphs so the community relocation comes later and doesn't seem so out of place as suggested here
295	5	14	5	14	14	The work of Anthony Oliver-Smith also highlights resettlement due to environmental change, hence it could be mentioned in this paragraph. (Ammann, Walter J., Global Risk Forum GRF Davos)	Reference added
296	5	14	16	14	25	This is a good discussion about a controversial topic, migration. This kind of thoughtful and careful analysis should be applied when addressing other difficult or controversial topics in the chapter. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	Noted
297	5	14	19	14	20	This may be published, but there is not much basis for that estimate. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This is true but we observe that the figure is disputed by others
298	5	14	22	14	23	It would be good if some examples of other causative factors of migration (other than climate) would be given here. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	not pertinent to the report
299	5	14	30	14	30	Please explain a bit more in detail to whom and where (in the receiving location or at the origin?) migration will become disruptive. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	Added to sentence about importance of land in pacific islands
300	5	14	39	15	49	The section is more related to the international level and chapter 7 (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Noted, but communities ort local places are affected by international migration
301	5	14	41	0	0	This topic sentence does not make the point you intend. Relief is appropriate when people are and are not helpless! (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	sentence changed
302	5	14	41	14	41	It doesn't follow that relief is often unsuitable beause people are not helpless. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Modified the beginning of this paragraph
303	5	14	41	14	42	Please explain why relief is unsuitable because people affected are not completely helpless - this is not immediately evident to a person not very familiar with the emergency assistance field and its discussions. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	Modified the beginning of this paragraph
304	5	14	41	14	45	The views presented by Cuny might still be true in many countries; however, the last few years development and humanitarian agencies started to more strongly work together resp. thanks to the existing network of developing NGOs, assistance often goes hand in hand with the communities affected. (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	Noted but the sentence refers to 'some' not all cases.
305	5	14	48	14	48	Reference to "outer islands" is unclear (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Modified to make clearer
306	5	14	48	14	49	Self-help is an important element of response in every community. This sentence should be edited maybe to say that self-help is especially imporant in isolated communities and may need to carry those communities longer before other help arrives. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	Done
307	5	14	53	14	54	This information is repeated elsewhere in the chapter. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Have deleted the sentences referring to internatiojnal relief
308	5	14	54	14	54	WFP is probably also another multilateral institution worth mentioning (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	Have deleted the sentences referring to internatiojnal relief
309	5	15	1	15	54	I guess it is worth emphasizing that there are development and humanitarian NGOs unlike in the past where it rather used to be humanitarian NGO (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	done

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
310	5	15	2	15	6	the relief process should also make much more use of local knowledge and local inputs, e.g. in identifying best locations for sanitation, distribution points, water points e.g. Morgan, J. (1994) Sudanese refugees in Koboko: environmental health interventions. Focus on Gender 2 (1) 41-44. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	sentence altered to include the point
311	5	15	17	15	21	This is true, however the situation is very much changing. The approaches of continuum, contiguuum or transition phase exactly try to link development and humanitarian intervention which affect less negatively the resilience (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	Have added to the opening sentence a general statement to this effect although could not find a suitable reference for this
312	5	15	37	15	40	I guess it would make sense to refer to subchapter 5.4.2 where you talk in more detail again about this aspect. Maybe another aspect to explicitly highlighting would be that at present it remains a major challenge to bring the stakeholders' attention (governance, donors etc.) to invest ex-ante in preventive and preparedness strategies instead of being reactive to disaster. (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	Done
313	5	16	0	0	0	Section 5.3.1. seems like it should come earlier in the chapter since it sets the stage for why local/ community is important (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	moved to the introduction (5.1.3)
314	5	16	0	0	0	Section 5.3 in general reads much better than 5.2. The paragraphs are more cohesive, offer greater clarity and better integrate examples. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	thanks
315	5	16	1	0	0	no comment (Yasseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	noted
316	5	16	1	28	18	Here it is confirmed that the one aspect of local that is being considered is the community level as no mention is made of all the other types of local delimitation considered in the chapter definition of local. Or does the section pretend to deal with local interpreted as anything below the provincial and department levels including river basins, ecosystems, economic regions, metropolis, cities etc? A second point relates to the fact that it is not easy to see how this section and its subsections differ in approach and coverage from section 5.2 and its subsections. What really distinguishes them given both deal with methods, instruments, etc around differing management themes when faced with climate related risk? What really is the difference the authors want to establish between community coping mechanisms and community based risk management in a changing climate? This is particularly relevant as it seems as if coping is interpreted as being relevant to or as defining all of the disaster risk management or risk continuum activities and concerns. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	point noted and text changed to refer to localities rather than communities
317	5	16	13	16	13	The first sentence is unclear, maybe there is a word missing? (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	noted
318	5	16	16	16	19	Not sure how much we are all in agreement with this definition of a disaster event given its subjective numerical and parameter basis, where only one of the parameters has to exist to define something as a disaster, as opposed to using a more scientific and substantiated definition . (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	sentence deleted
319	5	16	16	16	19	Statement that "All regions and many of the local communities...have experienced a disaster event...during the past decade". Either define what is meant by regions or rephrase to "Most regions"-- for instance, Antarctica is considered a region under most definitions but it does not meet the criteria provided in the statement. This specific statment also needs citations to support it. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	sentence deleted
320	5	16	22	16	23	Adjust wording to reflect distribution in northern and Southern hemispheres (Chambers, Lynda, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	sentence changed
321	5	16	23	16	25	Careful rewording is needed here to reflect the current uncertainty linking flooding and landslides with climate change. Currently this sentence suggests that more intense rainfall and related flooding have already been observed, but Chapter 3 of SREX assess that there is insufficient literature to determine whether or not an increase in flooding has been observed. More appropriate wording would be something like: "More intense rainfall has been observed and is projected for many parts of the world (see chapter 3), possibly influencing flood and landslide occurrences in these areas". (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	sentence changed
322	5	16	24	16	24	There is a word missing, mountainous areas? (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	sentence fixed
323	5	16	26	0	0	local knowledge of climate experiences, e.g. of cold snaps in Peru, REF. (1) ProVention website. Community Risk Assessment Methodologies and Case Studies. www.proventionconsortium.org/pageid=43 . Follow links to Compendium of Case Studies. Geneva: ProVention, IFRC. REF. (2) . McCall, Michael K. (2008) Participatory Mapping and Participatory GIS (PGIS) for CRA, Community DRR and Hazard Assessment. Geneva: ProVention Consortium, CRA Toolkit, Participation Resources. http://www.proventionconsortium.org/themes/default/pdfs/CRA/PGIS_Sept08.pdf http://know.brr.go.id/dc/assessment/20080400_Mapping_GIS_PGIS_DRR_Community_Risk_Hazard_Assessment.pdf (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	noted and thanks for the references
324	5	16	26	16	29	In the second to last sentence it is stated that the hazards are relatively new for many communities. However, in the preceding sentences in this paragraph, hazards that have occurred during the past decade or so or hazards that are becoming the norm have been described. Therefore it would be helpful if it were specified where and to whom the hazards are relatively new. The last sentence is unclear - maybe there are some words missing. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	sentence changed

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
325	5	16	31	16	32	Table 5-2 needs a lot of explanation. In particular, the extreme events mentioned in the table should be carefully defined. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	deleted
326	5	16	34	16	34	Table 5-3: it might be interesting to compare the present table with the table recently published by Germanwatch which presents the country most affected between 1990 and 2008 which shows a certain tendency resp. shift of the occurrence of disasters (http://www.germanwatch.org/klima/cr2010.pdf) and trend of countries particularly affected during the recent period. (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	deleted
327	5	16	34	16	35	This table may tend to understate the importance of multi-country disasters, e.g. the multi-country drought of 1983-85 in Ethiopia, Sudan and elsewhere. (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	deleted
328	5	16	40	17	5	Please check grammar and spelling. (Rock, Joachim, Johann Heinrich von Thuenen-Institute)	Noted
329	5	16	42	16	42	Either list the other references or delete "and others" (IPCC WGII TSU)	"others" deleted
330	5	16	47	16	48	Total property losses probably are increasing as there is more development in vulnerable areas. That is one way of measuring vulnerability. What about risk of losses, e.g., the probability will be damaged or destroyed. That may be another measure of vulnerability: what is that chance that I as an individual will be harmed or that my property will be damaged? Has that been assessed? Did Pielke and Downton (2000) look at risk in terms of damage per unit of wealth? (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	Changnon et al (2000) and Pielke and Downton (2000) added. However none of these studies included event to event adaptation and changes in land use etc.
331	5	16	48	16	49	"Factors conditioning this outcome ..."; it should be added that the factors and outcome have also a strong relationship to practice/practical disaster management; i.e. "Factors conditioning this outcome have been summed up by Burton et al. (Burton et al., 2001) as "knowing better and losing even more" and complemented by Weichselgartner and Obersteiner (2001) as "knowing sufficient and applying more". Full citation: Weichselgartner, J. and M. Obersteiner, 2002: Knowing sufficient and applying more: challenges in hazards management. Global Environmental Change Part B: Environmental Hazards, 4(2-3), 73-77. (Weichselgartner, Juergen, GKSS Research Center)	Clarifying text added "In this context "knowing better indicates the accumulation of readily available knowledge on drivers of impacts and effective risk reduction practices". Much of the chapter text deals with other conditioning factors
332	5	17	4	17	15	Paragraph is difficult to follow (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	disagree
333	5	17	6	17	7	The sentence starting with "Such a disaster..." is a bit long and therefore difficult to comprehend at the first reading; it also contains terms such as social time that might not be familiar to many readers. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	Text re-edited as suggested. The cumulative effects of such a disaster are clearly seen only when changing historical conditions over decades have
334	5	17	17	17	17	Pro active behavior of planners is not a measure taken at the local level (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Locals also plan. "Community-level planners" added
335	5	17	17	17	18	The sentence starting with "However,..." is unclear; maybe there are words missing or misspelled (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	Typo/rewording addressed
336	5	17	21	17	27	The points made here are useful, but it is not clear whether they refer to particular communities or are applicable to a larger area. As they stand they seem at odds with the notion that hazard mitigation measures need to be context-specific (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Context is a central theme of the chapter and the report
337	5	17	39	0	0	"rebuild the familiar" - not always the case, sometimes the authorities over-react (partly in order to show that they are taking charge and responding to disaster, e.g. Sri Lanka post-tsunami relocation of housing from coastal strip - without considering the costs to (fishermen's livelihood) (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Agree. Text amended to...to rebuild the familiar or increase risks in new locations through displacement
338	5	17	44	17	48	This paragraph strings together some notable policy theories with limited elaboration. It likely makes sense to just merge with the following paragraph. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Agree. Text merged
339	5	17	44	17	48	The message of the paragraph is not quite clear to me; first it is stated that disasters did not have an effect on the mitigation techniques employed in some communities. However in the next sentence it is stated that disasters can result in window of opportunity. This seems to me contradictory to the facts of the previous sentence. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	Text re-edited for clarity as suggested
340	5	17	48	17	50	There are windows of opportunity, but on the other hand there are windows of opportunity? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text re-edited as suggested
341	5	17	50	17	50	"window of opportunity" a repeat of previous sentence (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Text re-edited as suggested
342	5	17	50	18	11	cf. arguments of Naomi Klein Shock Doctrine, that authorities &/or economic powers utilise the (physical and social) tabula rasa of post-disaster situation to engineer a new social-economic order. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Agree. The multiple ways in which "windows" may be used are included. In new text
343	5	17	50	18	13	This is a paragraph that deals with a very important topic but which has very little to do with the community level and is more pertinent to the national and sectoral government levels. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	Text added to clarify that this is framed in terms of how national and sectoral programmes affect the local.
344	5	17	51	0	0	Do you mean mitigation (as opposed to retrofitting)? The terminology seems off here. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Agree. Word changes
345	5	18	15	18	21	How does this paragraph and Box 4 relate to windows of opportunity. There is something missing in the logical flow here. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Section moved
346	5	18	15	18	37	Why is this here and not in the section on gender? I suggest moving it as readers will look for this information in the section on gender. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Section moved

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
347	5	18	23	18	37	this box could be more analytical - it seems naively surprised that women have such roles to play (women are 50% of people!). More important questions are: What are the constraints facing women's involvement in DRR management? What differences are there in women's and men's priorities in DRR, in preparedness, etc.? what differences in behaviour during, and after disasters?. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Section moved. The percent of population is not an indicator of whether that group is marginalized for power and decisionmaking
348	5	18	23	18	37	Box 5-4: Is the reference correct? Enarson and Morrow 1997 although Hurricane Mitch was only in 1998? (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	Reference should be 1998
349	5	18	35	18	35	Sentence "The experience shows that preparedness is an important step in saving lives" seems superfluous (truism) (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Text edited to emphasize targeted preparedness activities aimed at a select groups
350	5	18	37	18	37	Hurricane Mitch stroke Central America in October-November 1998, reference is dated in 1997 therefore must be checked (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Reference should be 1998
351	5	18	42	19	37	This section deals with definition of vulnerability and human development, included in chapter 2 and 7, (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	noted
352	5	18	44	0	0	This sentence is poorly constructed and obfuscates the point. It does not add to the paragraph so can be eliminated. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	sentence changed
353	5	18	44	18	45	This opening sentence needs to be reworded as it paints a generalised, not entirely accurate picture. Some climate extremes will possibly decrease - cold waves/frosts being the obvious example. Clearer and more appropriate wording would be something like: "Future changes in climate trends and patterns will alter the frequency and/or intensity of many severe climatic events (See chapter 3)". (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	sentence changed
354	5	18	44	19	37	Again it is difficult to identify the purely or predominantly community or local based nature of a good part of this discussion. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	section altered to provide a more explicit focus on local
355	5	18	44	19	4	This information is detailed in Chps 3 and 4, and is repeated elsewhere in the chapter. Delete. (IPCC WGII TSU)	section deleted
356	5	18	46	18	46	What are SIDS? (Rock, Joachim, Johann Heinrich von Thuenen-Institute)	sentence deleted
357	5	18	46	19	4	Please check grammar and spelling. (Rock, Joachim, Johann Heinrich von Thuenen-Institute)	noted
358	5	18	52	0	0	correct - but this is often underrecorded and under-valued at macro level (especially by economists) because of their much smaller asset values the poor are dismissed as having "less to lose" (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	noted
359	5	19	3	0	0	It is indeed likely that floods increase probability of diarrhea, cholera and malaria, but is it the case for drought? It could be worth it to mention the link that could be for instance undernutrition... or specifying that there is no link between climate and such diseases, which could be misunderstanding here. (leblois, antoine, CIRED)	sentence changed to delete drought
360	5	19	6	19	16	About the reference on this paragraph I must tell that I have read Parry and Salomon works and I am not sure if this comment belong to them.. It sound for me more familiar to the books and works of Gustavo Wilches, one of the lead authors of this document... (Linavo, Aleiandro, Research Center on Disaster Risk Reduction CIGIR)	reference deleted
361	5	19	6	19	16	Linking climate change and conflict is controversial. For an article on the two main schools of thought in environmental conflict research see Gleditsch, N P, 2003. Environmental Conflict: Neomalthusians vs. Cornucopians, in Security and the Environment in the Mediterranean: Conceptualising Security and Environmental Conflicts, Berlin: Springer. For an investigation of links between climate change, disasters, conflict and displacement as well as protection challenges and responses in two conflict and post-conflict countries in the Horn of Africa, see Kolmannskog, "Climate change, disaster, displacement and migration- initial evidence from Africa," Research Paper 180, New Issues in Refugee Research, UNHCR, December 2009, available at http://www.unhcr.org/4b18e3599.html . A more extensive version of this paper will be published in the Journal of Refugee Studies. The paper is based on Somalia and Burundi case studies and illustrates how complex the dynamics of a disaster can be. Global climate change and local environmental degradation are only two of many factors in the droughts and conflict. While countries that are already affected by conflict, droughts and floods are particularly vulnerable to further climate change, they may also have certain strengths that could be further researched, improved and supported. (Kolmannskog, Vikram, Norwegian Refugee Council)	section re-written to capture the controversy with additional references included
362	5	19	6	19	9	This information is detailed in Chps 3 and 4, and is repeated elsewhere in the chapter. Delete. (IPCC WGII TSU)	deleted
363	5	19	9	19	9	Citation are given to Parry et al (2007) which refers to the whole WGII AR4 is far too general: cite the SPM if it is an overview from AR4 or better the TS or specific Chapter. Even the reference to Solomon et al (2007) which is the WGI AR4 SPM may be too general. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	deleted
364	5	19	11	19	16	Linkages between climate change and conflict are very contested, and a number of studies reject a direct causal link. The paragraph should reflect this through incorporating different views in the debate. (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	paragraph re-written to include differing perspectives
365	5	19	18	19	37	This is more an introduction to the chapter than a discussion of development and human security. I suggest combining with the introduction. (IPCC WGII TSU)	section moved to the introduction (now 5.1.4) and modified
366	5	19	20	19	22	It would be helpful if some specific examples were given here. For example, why is it important to strengthen the link between disaster risk management and adaptation, and if this is done, who are the actors and why does it matter who will take the lead? (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	examples included

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
367	5	19	20	19	26	very good point that analysing the SCALE of the mitigation or adaptation activities is very important. But then it does not logically follow that "THEREFORE any new ... adaptation must be built on strengthening local actors ..." Yes, - when the scale of adaptaiton is local, but when the scale is national or regional then larger-scale *(maybe overriding) interests are relevant. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	point noted
368	5	19	24	19	26	This is a very general statement. Strengthening local actors and enhancing their livelihoods is very important but however, it might not be the only effective approach or relevant in every country, local community or situation (for example, regulation could also play an important role in adaptation). (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	deleted
369	5	19	28	19	29	Please explain a little more in detail what is meant by integrated management approach and how it will ensure that the adaptations will favor the most vulnerable groups. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	sentenced modified to explain this
370	5	19	30	19	31	This is a very strong statement, that there are likely no win-win solutions. From whose perspective? A bomb like this cannot be placed in the text without more explanation, and think many people would disagree. (Kull, Daniel, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC))	sentence deleted
371	5	19	32	19	36	yes, mainstreaming certainly, but then we hardly need to talk about the singularity of climate "adaptation" as a special arrangement. Fact is the climate is changing, circumstances have changed, and all good sound appropriate planning and management has to take into account the actual conditions. "There cannot be sound planning which does not account for and work with climate change" (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	noted
372	5	19	34	19	37	"have to be supported by policies" is policy prescriptive; suggest rephrase to "Efforts to forge greater and more equitable capacity at the local scale, when supported by policies at the national level, increases the ability of local institutions and communities to cope with present and future risks from climate-sensitive hazards ." (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	sentence modified to include that language
373	5	19	40	20	28	Reconstruction is treated as it's not in the hands of community (and thus not local) and seems more like a statement on how reconstruction should be (specially the last paragraph) (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	language made more explicit to suggest it is a community or locally-based function
374	5	19	42	19	45	Very good point about the conceptual and policy problematic of 'return to normal'. (part of the 'resilience' problematic) . But the rest of the para. drops that deeper policy point and changes to narrower issues. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	language added in first paragraph to bring the point home a bit more
375	5	20	6	20	16	I find the argument on security to be speculative. Is the relationship as deterministic as described or more complex? For example, see Liverman (2009) in Climatic Change. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	comment is out of place
376	5	20	9	20	10	Why should it be more important to rehabilitate livelihoods in developing countries than in developed ones? E.g.: Hurrigan Katrina: no house, no money, no food, no organised help readily available - where is the difference to the situation in a developing country, seen from a victims' perspective? (Rock, Joachim, Johann Heinrich von Thuenen-Institute)	clause deleted
377	5	20	10	20	13	and the problems of power inequalities - land and resource grabbing by the economic and politically powerful after the disaster, e.g. losses of beachfront land and livelihoods post-tsunami in Indonesia, loss of land post floods, in Pakistan. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	noted and point included
378	5	20	12	20	13	Unclear sentence: "Indeed post-disaster recovery ..." Should be more specific on what is meant by 're-establishing livelihoods' (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	sentence changed to clarify the meaning
379	5	20	18	20	18	Often the case? Where? In both developed and developing countries? (IPCC WGII TSU)	in both developed and developing; sentence altered to reflect this
380	5	20	18	20	37	I have many concerns about this paragraph. It is written more as an opinion than an assessment. Is it not a value-laden assertion to state that large scale projects are wrong ill conceived because they do not benefit all. Clearly this is a very difficult call. Does the good of the nation as a whole outweigh the harm to individuals. Hard to say. But should IPCC tread a more careful. I think difficult issues such as this can be effectively raised without finger pointing or judgments. I urge you to be subtle in your presentation. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	comment is out of place
381	5	20	30	20	31	This seems to be an opinion. Prove it. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	comment is out of place
382	5	20	31	28	21	The section 6.3.5 on components of RM and adaptation seems to be somehow out of place, and seems like a more conceptual text that could be included in chapter 1 or 2 (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	point noted
383	5	20	32	20	34	Not clear how mainstreaming DRR into national development plans (which I agree with) addresses equity issues raised above. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	disagree with reviewer; comment ignored
384	5	20	42	20	46	and participatory scenario assessments with local communities of alternative climate futures, e.g. prarie farmers in Alberta canada, REF. Patiño, Lorena, and Gauthier, D. (2009) A participatory mapping approach to climate change in the South Saskatchewan River Basin. Prairie Forum (Special issue) 34 (1) (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Have included.
385	5	20	43	20	43	"surprise associated with climate change" -- unclear what is meant by the use of "surprise". Do you mean the "uncertainties associated with climate change"? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Changed surprise to uncertainties
386	5	20	52	20	54	I don't entirely agree that seasonal climate forecasts have not been used in relation to extreme events. For example, seasonal forecasts were used before the El Nino of 1997/98 and subsequent years that led to heavy rainfall/drought events (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	noted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
387	5	20	53	21	1	Box 5.5 does not refer to seasonal forecasts (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Agree - have moved box to end of section
388	5	21	8	21	8	Did this result in the relief being received faster? (IPCC WGII TSU)	noted
389	5	21	10	0	0	Box 5 is a nice example. However, it would help to set it up or link it to a section related to local knowledge and local action. Alternatively, you could incorporate a paragraph in the case about how the farmers monitored the climate and how this locally generated information was used to guide action. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Paragraph included on local knowledge and local action
390	5	21	10	21	33	There is no reference to climate change adaptation in the example. This is development, not adaptaion (Bardt, Hubertus, Cologne Institute for Economic Research)	Has been added
391	5	21	12	21	31	The box provides a useful example, but it would be useful if the text could elaborate more on the conditions that made local action possible, and how they differed from other communities in South Africa; hence what could be learnt from this example? (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Paragraph included on local knowledge and local action
392	5	21	12	21	31	This needs to be better tied to managing the risks of extreme weather events. Did their actions increase resilience to drought conditions? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Link to drought included
393	5	21	39	21	41	I didn't understand this sentence. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Part of the sentence moved to previous sentence and rest deleted.
394	5	21	44	21	54	there are many benefits from the CBDRR approach (not mentioned here) - cheaper, more likelihood of ownership of process, more transparent and accountable, more credible to local people, more effective, utilising local information and local histories, And there are many more manuals, handbooks, toolboxes to support CBDRR. e.g. (1). ActionAid – Chiwaka, Ethlet and Yates, Roger (2005) Participatory Vulnerability Analysis: A step-by-step guideline for field staff. London / Johannesburg: ActionAid International. (2). ADPC (2004) Abarquez, Imelda; and Zubair Murshed (2004) Field Practitioners' Handbook. Pathumthani, Thailand: ADPC (Asian Disaster Preparedness Center). http://www.adpc.net/pdr-sea/publications/12Handbk.pdf . (3). Benson, Charlotte; and John Twigg with Tiziana Rossetto (2007) Tools for Mainstreaming Disaster Risk Reduction: Guidance Notes for Development Organisations. Geneva: ProVention Consortium. http://www.proventionconsortium.org/?pageid=37&publicationid=132#132 . (4). EIRD / ISDR (2008) ¡ Aprendamos a Prevenir los Desastres! Los niños y las niñas también participamos en la reducción de riesgos. Juegos y Proyectos. San Jose, Costa Rica: EIRD (ISDR) Estrategia Internacional para la Reducción de Desastres, Unidad Regional para América Latina y el Caribe. And: UNICEF Costa Rica. (5). Falk, Knud (ed.) (2005) Preparing for Disaster – A Community-Based Approach. Copenhagen: Danish Red Cross (2nd ed.) Manila: Philippine National Red Cross. http://www.proventionconsortium.org/themes/default/pdfs/CRA/CBDP_Philippines_Booklet.pdf (6). Oxfam Great Britain, Philippines Programme - de Dios, Honorio B. (2002) Participatory Capacities and Vulnerabilities Assessment: Finding the link between disasters and development. Quezon City: Oxfam Great Britain - Philippines Programme. http://www.proventionconsortium.org/themes/default/pdfs/CRA/PCVA_2002_meth.pdf . (7). Pincha, Chaman (2008) Gender Sensitive Disaster Management: a Toolkit for Practitioners. Mumbai: Earthworm Books, for Oxfam America & NANBAN Trust. http://thinkbeyondboundaries.org/index2.php?option=com_docman&task=doc_view&gid=7&Itemid=38 . (8). ProVention, Community Risk Assessment Methodologies and Case Studies, Geneva: Tools for Mainstreaming Disaster Risk Reduction: Set of 14 Guidance Notes for Development Organisations www.proventionconsortium.org 'Guide to Handbooks and Guidelines'. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	noted and thanks for the references
395	5	21	51	0	0	CBA typically is not about recovery but assessment and promotion of resilience. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	sentence changed to reflect this
396	5	21	53	0	0	Input and being featured are two different issues. Also, this should be put in perspective as few groups get a voice or mention in NAPAs. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	noted
397	5	22	0	0	0	5.3.5.2 Communicating Disaster Risk - Please align contents with case study 9.14 (Hama, Angela Michiko, United Nations International Strategy for Disaster Reduction)	under consideration once Ch. 9 has made final selection
398	5	22	2	0	0	participatory scenario development , see note for p.20, l.42 (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	noted; reference included
399	5	22	6	22	7	Please explain why unintended disempowerment occurs at times when using community based adaptation approaches. The causes are not evident to a reader unfamiliar with the issue (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	sentence clarified--disempowerment occurs when local stories are distorted or not valued sufficiently
400	5	22	12	22	31	Not clear how the example in the box relates to adaptation to extreme events. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	box on p. 21 has now included adaptation
401	5	22	21	22	21	"they argue". Be specific: who argues? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	sentence modified
402	5	22	23	22	24	This is an important caveat given many of the things discussed in this chapter go beyond the community level and its autonomous ability to deal with problems, and remits to other "local" levels such as city, metropolis, municipality etc which are identified as being local by the chapter but not dealt with in such a straight, explicit and far reaching fashion as is stuff in sections 5.2 and 5.3, which refer to "community" as such. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	noted and we've tried to qualify local throughout the chapter
403	5	22	26	22	26	First sentence is tending to be policy-prescriptive; rephrase to be policy-neutral (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Sentence rephrased

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
404	5	22	26	22	26	Sentence "Under climate change ..." is too general and needs a qualification - are all CBA efforts "likely to be beneficial"? (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	clause deleted
405	5	22	28	22	28	What is "positive energy?" (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	question whether comment is in right place
406	5	22	32	22	33	Please provide references. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	reference inserted
407	5	22	35	22	37	Why is a "systematic restructuring" needed and why the focus just on the humanitarian community. What is the latter? (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	noted although comment is out of order
408	5	22	39	24	37	Care is needed to identify what levels of overlap there may be with the chapter 1 discussion of risk communication and elsewhere in other chapters of this study. The section does not ever indicate directly what aspect of the DRM practice is being covered at each discussion point--reduction, preparedness, response, recovery etc. The only mentions are to early warning, preparedness and response but this is done very sparsely. One must assume that communication of risk is relevant for all moments of the risk cycle--before infrastructure, housing, factories, crops etc have been built or established, once an event is imminent, once an event has struck and once recovery is promoted. But this is not dealt with specifically and explicitly in this section and the discussion is rather more generic than specific. This comment is relevant for other sections as well. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	Agree. Clarifying sentence added. As suggested more on this will be needed across all management chapters in the Report.
409	5	22	47	22	48	maybe this generates more "concern", but it is questionable whether it generates more actions and more deferral of gratification (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Agree. Text amended.
410	5	22	52	22	54	The critique of NAPAs seems gratuitous. If you want to take them on, I suggest a more detailed analysis. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	NAPA phrase has been deleted
411	5	23	3	23	3	Please specify: different sources of what? (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	Text amended to ...sources of information vehicles
412	5	23	6	23	8	This is an excellent point. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	thanks
413	5	23	10	23	25	this para concerns mainly information sources external to the community, but this ignores the importance of internal within-communities communication from older to younger, to children, between households, between livelihoods, etc (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Agree. References to Dekens, Orlove and others on internal communications added.
414	5	23	24	23	25	The 'digital divide' is also an issue in urban settings and in developed countries. (Grynszpan, Delphine, UK Health Protection Agency)	Agree. Text amended to include developed countries
415	5	23	26	23	34	This seems to be an opinion, although I am not sure how one proves or disproves it. Not clear to me the anecdotes prove it. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	Disagree. It is grounded in the literature
416	5	23	31	0	0	also, backcasting (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Agree. Text amended to include lessons from previous events
417	5	24	5	24	6	This may be one definition of empowerment but not the only one and certainly not the most comprehensive. Coming back to the fact that up til now in this chapter the authors have only dealt with community as one expression of "local" we should also accept that in a wider context, the notion and workings of empowerment will be different if we are dealing with a municipality, city, metropolis, river basin as the basis of delimiting "local". Should we not be cognizant of this and deal with the challenge it signifies? (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	Agree. This fits with the definition of "community" used in the chapter. A broader discussion across the management chapters is warranted.
418	5	24	11	0	0	more refs on participatory video for DRR REFS.(1) Baumhardt, Fernanda; Ralph Lasage; Pablo Suarez; and Charles Chadza (2009) Farmers become filmmakers: climate change adaptation in Malawi. Participatory Learning and Action 60, 129-138. http://www.iied.org/pubs/display.php?o=14573IIED . (2). Plush, Tamara (2009) Amplifying children's voices on climate change: the role of participatory video. Participatory Learning and Action 60, 119-128. http://www.iied.org/pubs/display.php?o=14573IIED (3) JKPP (Jaringan Kerja Pemetaan Partisipatif - Indonesia Community Mapping Network) and YRBI (Yayasan Rumpun Bambu Indonesia - Center for People Economic Development) (2006) Community Mapping in Tsunami Affected Areas in Aceh, Indonesia. (15-minutes) http://www.iapad.org/aceh.htm . (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	References added (Baumhardt et al, 2009; Plush 2009)

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
419	5	24	19	24	22	many more refs. on participatory mapping and participatory GIS including dynamic or interactive GIS for CBDRR See REFS IN: (1) McCall, Michael K. (2008) Participatory Mapping and Participatory GIS (PGIS) for CRA, Community DRR and Hazard Assessment. Geneva: ProVention Consortium, CRA Toolkit, Participation Resources. http://www.proventionconsortium.org/themes/default/pdfs/CRA/PGIS_Sept08.pdf http://know.brr.go.id/dc/assessment/20080400_Mapping_GIS_PGIS_DRR_Community_Risk_Hazard_Assessment.pdf . (2) Kienberger, Stefan (Complier) (2008) Toolbox & Manual. Mapping the Vulnerability of Communities. Example from Búzi, Mozambique. Salzburg: Salzburg University, Centre for Geoinformatics (Z_GIS) (Supported by Munich Re Foundation, Munich; INGC, Maputo; and CIG-UCM, Beira. http://projects.stefankienberger.at/vulmoz/wp-content/uploads/2008/08/Toolbox_CommunityVulnerabilityMapping_V1.pdf . (3) Peters, Graciela; Michael K. McCall; and Cees van Westen (2009) Coping Strategies and Manageability: How Participatory Geographical Information Systems can Transform Local Knowledge into Better Policies for Disaster Risk Management. London: Aon Benfield UCL Hazard Research Centre Disaster Studies Working Paper 22. http://www.abuhrc.org/Publications/Working%20Paper%2022.pdf (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	References added McCall 2008)
420	5	24	30	24	31	biggest requirement is "trust" and confidence (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Agree. Trust and confidence added to earlier text
421	5	24	36	24	37	Please present evidence and references to support this general statement about enhanced capacity. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Most of IPCC 2007 Working Group II. See for example Chapter 17 and the literature therein
422	5	24	36	24	37	Why just short-term disasters? Like the comments above for chapter 1, the comparison here between short-term coping and long-term adaptation seems a bit artificial and ignores the attention to resilience and risk reduction that bridges between the two in any case. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	Agree. However much of the literature has made this appear dichotomous in the past. The present sentence seeks to re-emphasize the artificial nature of that separations, and that there is a need for more information on how to think about long-term risks. This is not an artificial separation of the two, but rather an effort to highlight how conceptualizations of climate change require expanded thinking.
423	5	24	36	24	37	The last sentence of the paragraph seems to stand alone and a bit out of context as the previous sentences do not necessarily lead to such a statement. (Ammann, Walter J., Global Risk Forum GRF Davos)	The previous sentence makes the point of engaging in a seamless suite of responses across emergency management and adaptation. The concluding sentence simply builds on this and draws from IPCC 2007 where it was discussed in detail
424	5	24	45	24	46	It would be very interesting and helpful if a few examples were given here of how empowerment has been done and what steps or actions or requirements are there for successful empowerment. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	done
425	5	24	48	24	54	there is easily a contradiction here re "building trust". Giving more voice to women and eg disabled, is desirable, but it is clearly an intervention / interference into the community, and may not enhance trust overall. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Not sure how to respond to this. We understand the concern expressed but surely interveners should not reinforce unjust status quo in communities. Also there is no literature to support this point that we could find
426	5	25	1	25	5	issue of 'ownership', raises again the issue of what is 'community', and more precisely. "who speaks for the community?" (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	The issue of community was already addressed earlier in the chapter. We could not find literature to support the reviewer's point, so have simply added a sentence to make the point that external agencies should not just take over in post-disaster settings without some sensitivity to the local context
427	5	25	2	25	5	Ownership of the issue is certainly a key element of empowerment. Again, here it would be very interesting and helpful to have some practical examples that would give the reader an idea of how the ownership of the issue is given to the community. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	Hard to find examples in the literature. Have added a sentence re: ownership of post disaster assessment citing Pelling.
428	5	25	17	0	0	important point - the implication is that existing social norms, and existing social capital might be antagonistic to "empowerment", such as empowerment of women, or of certain castes, religious groups, etc See below lines 32-34 (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	This point was left standing as it since it was suggested as an important one.
429	5	25	18	25	19	in sri lanka's tsunami, on southern coast, fisher men drowned at the beach, whilst women had been sent home (by chance to safety) out of public gaze. In other places, women drowned at home because they could not leave a private space (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Example was included
430	5	25	32	25	35	The argument that informal networks may become "self-referential and insular" needs further elaboration examples. This may be true, but it appears as a too sweeping and general argument. It could also be argued that many networks have shown an ability to regenerate and innovate. (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	The issue was nuanced in the text
431	5	25	34	0	0	the existence of (strong) social capital can also be used as justification for external authorities, govt. etc. not to engage in support "there is no need to offer assistance", = a dereliction of 'duty of care'. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	There is no literature to support this idea that we are aware of.
432	5	25	48	25	50	important to consider differences between traditional customary leaders, and modern local leaders like elected local govt. officials - with respect to influence, credibility, etc (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Point was added

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
433	5	26	6	26	8	Further to the point that social networks are being undermined by the dissolution of traditional ways of life, it is worth highlighting that the 'adaptation measure' of migration can lead to negative effects for those left behind, reducing the size of the networks they have to draw on and reducing their sense of trust in them as they become anxious or suspicious that others around them are going to leave as well. See the in-depth and longitudinal social reserach study by Rickards (2008) into how farming families in the northwest of Victoria, Australia, were experiencing and responding to the recent drought, for an illustration of this kind of social fragmentation occuring as a result of the climate extreme (and predictions of climate change).I will email it: Rickards (2008) Critical Breaking Point? The effects of drought and other pressures on farming families. (Rickards, Lauren Amy, University of Melbourne)	This point and reference were added.
434	5	26	11	0	0	This section is important, but does not in my view do justice to the wealth of local knowledge that exists and have been documented around the world. Most of the references relate to indigenous peoples, which excludes the knowledge of non-indigenous populations (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Section was modified with more documentation added.
435	5	26	11	26	49	It would also be good to include some points about integrating local knowledge with other types of knowledge, such as climate change scenarios and modeling data. Maybe an example as well drawing on the IFRC case presented on p. 21. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	Point was added.
436	5	26	11	26	49	In highlighting the importance of integrating local knowledge, the authors may also explore the possibility of "re-engineering" local knowledge to better adapt to changing climate. In India and elsewhere traditional adobe technology is being upgraded to stabilised earth technology for houses in arid areas now receiving almost regular rainfall. (Gupta, Manu, SEEDS)	point noted and added.
437	5	26	13	26	17	community participatory mapping of disaster risk, hazards, vulnerability, coping and adaptation mechanisms, and impacts of climate change are essential to understand local knowledge & experiences. See REFS in Comment on p.24, lines 19-22. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	noted and some references included.
438	5	26	17	26	18	what is "it" in this sentence? (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Editorial issue to do with RefWorks
439	5	26	21	26	21	I suggest to add the following sentences, in order to show that research on the conditions under which the integration of local and scientific knowledge can avoid to be instrumental, or represent a factor of acculturation etc.: "Research on the types of integration of scientific and traditional/local knowledge showed that this requires to conceive of the different forms of knowledge represented by local or indigenous and science-based communities as the integration of epistemological communities (Haas 1992 & 2004). As there are fundamental differences between interacting epistemic communities it is important to conceive of the process of integration as part of a collective learning process that aims to co-produce new knowledge that is at the same time targeting specific collective action related to risk management and co-create the epistemological ground for integrating the diverging individual epistemologies (Rist & Dahdouh-Guebas 2006, Healy 2003, Fals-Borda 2003). This means for the practice that integration of scientific and indigenous forms of knowledge should be understood (Rist et al. 2006) and implemented (Rist & Delgado 2009) on the basis of dialogue between different epistemological communities in which each partner should ideally have the same conditions for making explicit converging and diverging features of his interests and the related epistemological foundations. Fals Borda O. 2003. Context and diffusion of knowledge - A critique of Eurocentrism. Action Research 1 (1) 29-37. Haas PM. 1992. Introduction: Epistemic Communities and International Policy Coordination. International Organization 46 (1) 377-403. Haas PM. 2004. When does power listen to truth? A constructivist approach to the policy process. Journal Of European Public Policy 11 (4) 569-592. Healy S. 2003. Epistemological pluralism and the politics of choice. Futures 35 689-701. Rist S, Dahdouh-Guebas F. 2006. Ethnoscience - A step towards the integration of scientific and non-scientific forms of knowledge in the management of natural resources for the future. Environment, Development and Sustainability 8 (4) 467-493. Rist S, Delgado F. 2009. Strengthening endogenous knowledge production through intercultural dialogue, in: Hoffmann, V, Christinck, A, and Lemma, M (eds). Rural Extension Manual - Revised 3rd edition. Hohenheim, University of Hohenheim, GTZ, CTA Margraf publishers, p.346-353. Rist S, Wiesmann U, San Martin J, Delgado F. 2006. From scientific monoculture to intra- and intercultural dialogue - endogenous development in a North-South perspective, in: COMPAS (eds). Moving Worldviews - Reshaping sciences, policies and practices for Endogenous Sustainable Development. Soestenber, COMPAS, p.320-339. (Rist, Stephan, Centre for Development and Environment (CDE))	point noted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
440	5	26	25	26	32	more references on indigenous and local people's experience and recognition of climate change impacts. REFS: (1) Jennings, Steve; and Magrath, John (2009) What Happened to the Seasons? Paper given at Future Agricultures Consortium International Conference on Seasonality, Seasonality Revisited. Brighton, IDS, July 2009. (2) Monica Wehbe, Hallie Eakin, Roberto Seiler, Marta Vinocur, Cristian Ávila, and Cecilia Marutto (2006) Local Perspectives on Adaptation to Climate Change: Lessons From Mexico and Argentina. Washington DC: AIACC Working Paper No. 39. www.aiaccproject.org (3) Glwadys Aymone Gbetibouo (2009) Understanding Farmers' Perceptions and Adaptations to Climate Change and Variability. The Case of the Limpopo Basin, South Africa. Washington DC: IFPRI Discussion Paper 00849. (4) Buechler, Stephanie (2009) Gender, water, and climate change in Sonora, Mexico: implications for policies and programmes on agricultural income-generation. Gender & Development 17 (1). (5) Reid, Hannah; Mozaharul Alam; Rachel Berger; Terry Cannon; and Angela Milligan (eds) (2009) Community-Based Adaptation to Climate Change. London: IIED, Participatory Learning and Action PLA No. 60. http://www.iied.org/pubs/display.php?o=14573IIED&n=2&l=445&c=part (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	we feel this material is covered in the revision
441	5	26	26	0	0	Section 5.3.5.5 Reference to the use of locally-gathered information in drought early warning systems would be useful here. Jerney Swift "District level drought contingency planning in arid districts of Kenya" in J Morton ed Pastoralism, Drought and Planning: lessons from Northern Kenya and elsewhere, NRI, Chatham 2000, is a possible reference (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	considered earlier in the chapter in the FEWS box
442	5	26	42	0	0	therefore, need to set up modalities for local communities to exchange (indigenous) knowledge across climate gradients (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	point considered
443	5	27	0	28	18	Papers by Agrawal and Perrin, and Anderson, Morton and Toulmin, both in Norton and Mearns 2009 may be relevant here for discussions on the role of local institutions in coping/adaptation (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	Have included Agrawal chapter--unfortunately the refs listed don't relate specifically to local government, which is the focus of this section
444	5	27	1	28	18	There should be mention of disaster risk management plans in this section and more mention of addressing climate change and other disaster risks in the context of broader local development plans. This is mentioned more thoroughly in chapter 8 but should also be mentioned here. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	done
445	5	27	3	0	0	This opening sentence should not just focus on responses but also on addressing risk in development more generally. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	Has been addressed
446	5	27	3	27	37	peers effects also has something to with networks and how the way they are emerging. One more time remittances from migrants should be mentioned as a way to help local communities to develop, for instance learning from emigrant place institutions and mixing different administration cultures. When migrations are temporary, feedbacks and learning from the host country is even more probable. (leblouis, antoine, CIREF)	This comment has been addressed in the section on social transfers (was 5.5.2)
447	5	27	3	27	4	In addition to what has been said, it can also be referred to the Global Assessment Report on DRR (ISDR 2009) which states that "global disaster risk is highly concentrated in poorer countries with weaker governance" (one of the key findings, page 3). (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	agree and have included reference
448	5	27	3	28	18	Here is an explicit case where in a section named community based DRM the topic is rather of a municipal or local government nature which certainly includes community but is not defined by it. Communities have their own internal organizational features and collective ways of dealing with things and these are different, if complementary to local government--should these levels, rather than local government, be dealt with here in a section on community? But we come back always to the fact that if local is defined by so many different territorial levels and circumstances as is done so in the chapter introduction then we should deal with each point raised in the chapter at the different levels. This is almost impossible so it would be best that the chapter and the sections make clear that they are dealing with one definition and level of "local" and that is the local "community" level, and avoid the reader saying over and over "where is stuff on city, metropolis, river basin... DRM based practice? (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	comment recognized--section title has changed
449	5	27	4	27	5	I would suggest that the statement that current climate change management practices have tended to be centralized would be specified some. Is this the case everywhere? (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	have reworded
450	5	27	5	27	5	This might give a too positive idea that decision making and management would always be based on rational choices. The fact that management practices are mainly centralized might be due to power structures and old practices and cultures and not a result of rational and objective planning and decision making processes (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	have added phrase addressing concern
451	5	27	24	27	24	The example with ICLEI (Local Governments for Sustainability) could also be mentioned. ICLEI is an international association of local governments as well as national and regional local government organizations who have made a commitment to sustainable development. The program promotes long-term strategic planning processes linking international goals and local action - such as The UN Framework Convention on Climate Change. (Asphjell, Torgrim, Climate and Pollution Agency (Norway))	done

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
452	5	27	26	27	37	Something is very wrong in the Birkman article. Several of the cities listed do not have adaptation plans as yet. Further, it is inaccurate that most strategies are led by mayor's offices. Perhaps supported by most, but there is wide variability in where these initiatives are situated and in who leads. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Text has been adjusted to indicate that the studies are both formal and less formal research plans. Phrase about Mayors' office has been deleted
453	5	27	27	29	39	The question of wealth dynamics and poverty traps (M. Alesina (2005), "risk, insurance and poverty" S. Dercon (2005) Oxford University Press, Carter and Zimmerman, 2000 and 2003) should be mentioned here since capital accumulation and vulnerability are the principle mechanisms that trap households into a poverty status constrained by subsistence needs. Social and environmental scientists speaking about resilience to shocks, that often depends on installed (or social capital and norms enhancing capabilities as mentioned in the section 5.4.1.5 called livelihoods and the next section) capital and buffer stocks or income. (Leblois, Antoine, CIBER)	unclear how comment related to text
454	5	27	31	27	34	Local Authorities do not usually listen seriously to local (indigenous) knowledge about DRR (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México)	agree, have added phrase
455	5	27	34	27	35	Please clarify the sentence "Although they aim to be integrated..." What or who are they and what is to be integrated? (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	changed to "Despite the intention that city adaptation responses aim at an integrative approach..."
456	5	27	43	27	45	This is inaccurate, so likely drawing from an outdated article. In the domain of local adaptation, 2006 is far too dated to be reliable. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	changed to past tense; refers to paper so disagree that it is inaccurate
457	5	27	45	27	46	Please explain in more detail or give an example of participatory approaches to generate integrated assessment at local level of vulnerabilities+ (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	sentence deleted
458	5	27	46	0	0	positive examples from Istanbul et al. REFS IN: ProVention Community Risk Assessment Methodologies and Case Studies www.proventionconsortium.org/pageid=43 . Follow links to Compendium of Case Studies. Geneva: ProVention, IFRC (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México)	link doesn't work; can't find case study example
459	5	27	50	27	52	This sentence does not make sense. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	have deleted
460	5	27	50	27	52	The last sentence starting with "Instead of the scaling up..." is somewhat unclear, please revise or explain in more detail. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	have deleted
461	5	28	1	28	18	Again disregards the private sector including businesses and professions. (Wright, Richard, American Society of Civil Engineers)	recognize point; have included private sector in some places
462	5	28	4	28	5	Where is adaptation centralized at the national level? In the US it seems to be mainly at the state and local levels, although the federal gov't is getting more involved. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	rephrased
463	5	28	6	28	7	It would be good to give an example of a multi-stakeholder partnership, including local government, community organizations, and the private sector and also to mention the role of local champions in establishing and maintaining those partnerships. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	have included NYC example
464	5	28	10	28	10	Local was defined as being all that is subnational at the beginning of this chapter--ie all below provincial and departmental level. But here a distinction is made between local and subnational "planning levels", but we don't know to what definition of local and subnational they are referring--clearly it is not the same as the way the chapter defines local otherwise subnational planning would be equivalent to local planning. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	local changed to district

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
465	5	28	15	28	15	Decentralisation is indeed an important still neglected feature in climate change adaptation. However I think it would be good to point to the fact that decentralization for climate change adaptation should be take stock of the experiences made in the domains of natural resource management by adding the following (after last word in line 15): "In order to fully take stock of the potentials of the still incipient role that decentralisation plays in climate change adaptation it is important to consider the limitations emerging from the rather closely related limitations of linking decentralisation to the management of natural resources. Ribot (2002) analyzed numerous decentralization projects around the globe and identified the following nine "principles for effective decentralisation": 1) Work with local democratic institutions, 2) Transfer of sufficient and appropriate powers; 3) Transfer of powers as secure rights, 4) Support equity and justice, 5) Establishing minimum environmental standards; 6) Establish fair and accessible adjudication, 7) Support local civic education, 8) Give decentralisation time, 9) Develop indicators for monitoring & evaluating decentralisation and its outcomes. Additionally, Geiser and Rist (2009) suggest to consider the following risks related to decentralization policies: On the basis of eight case studies it was shown that decentralisation programmes often follow standardised procedures that encounter social, political, economic and ecological complexities and heterogeneity; the latter cannot be easily made compatible with the generally top down designed and rather homogenising policies. This implies that decentralisation is not primarily a managerial challenge (i.e. to introduce improved governance mechanisms), but is inherently political, influenced by interests and agency, and thus contingent. The challenge for researchers and practitioners is to support adequate social processes that allow decentralisation to give local complexities more room, without fuelling local competition over the scarce resources offered by decentralisation. Without considering these aspects the risk is high that decentralization ends up in recentralizing the whole process (Ribot et al. 2006). Geiser U, Rist S. 2009. Decentralisation Meets Local Complexity: Conceptual Entry Points, Field-level Findings and Insights Gained, in: (eds). Decentralisation Meets Local Complexity: Local Struggles, State Decentralisation and Access to Natural Resources in South Asia and Latin America. Berne, Geographica Bernensia / Swiss National Centre of Competence in Research (NCCR) North-South, p.15-55. Ribot JC. 2003. Democratic decentralisation of natural resources: Institutional choice and discretionary power transfers in sub-Saharan Africa. Public Administration And Development 23 (1) 53-65. Ribot JC, Agrawal A, Larson AM. 2006. Recentralizing while decentralizing: How national governments reappropriate forest resources. World Development 34 (11) 1864-1886. (Rist, Stephan, Centre for Development and Environment (CDE))	comments have been considered and paragraph revised to include some of the challenges with decentralization
466	5	28	17	28	19	The first sentence, which is reasonable, contradicts the prior paragraph. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	disagree
467	5	28	21	0	0	Education is missing. Urbanization is as well missing. Rural areas -I consider- another entity. (Yasseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	Education is included indirectly in gender and wealth sections; urban and rural are included under human settlements
468	5	28	21	32	9	Gender, age, entitlements, etc. Don't necessary reflect a local level of analysis, these conditions are common to most of the localities, the point would be in what distinguishes a local human and natural environment that is not severely hit by disasters from another that does (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	noted
469	5	28	23	28	25	The section that follows under 5.4 doesn't really get too much into the development aspect that is mentioned under #1 in this text. This aspect should be more thoroughly developed. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	disagree; don't want too much overlap with chapter 2
470	5	28	24	28	24	disaster prevention and mitigation could be mentioned as DRM to maintain the use of concepts (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	changed
471	5	28	25	28	25	Instead of "all-hazards" aproach a "multi-hazard" aproach is more commonly used (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	changed
472	5	28	25	28	25	Please define the term all-hazards approach (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	changed to multi-hazard
473	5	28	26	28	28	the problem with this concept is its gigantism - it is all-encompassing, over ambitious, unwieldy, trying to bring about all progressive change, The danger is that it becomes just 'visions' and 'missions' with no practical outcomes focussed on DRR management. . (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	sentence deleted
474	5	28	28	28	29	The last sentence is a bit unclear. To what is referred by "each" and how does it relate to adaptation to climate extremes (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	clarified
475	5	28	35	28	37	More than ninety years might be said, if we consider Prince's theory of post disaster social change earlier as 1917 (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	noted
476	5	28	45	28	51	(i) a well documented example during the Kashmir earthquake in Pakistan might be interesting to add. "The 2005 Kashmir Earthquake: A perspective on Women's experiences". Published in the Mountain Research and Development Vol 27 No 4 Nov 2007: 296-301 doi:10.1659/mrd.0945, www.bioone.org/doi/pdf/10.1659/mrd.0945. (ii) In addition, the published documentation on "DRR: a gender and livelihood perspective" by Clot and Carter in the Focus gives a good overview about gender in the context of DRR. Publication separately sent or can be downloaded at eldis: http://www.eldis.org/assets/Docs/44530.html (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	references added
477	5	28	45	28	54	Some of this information is repeated elsewhere in the chapter. (IPCC WGII TSU)	section was eliminated from p. 18 along with box and incorporated here
478	5	28	48	0	0	not only the socialised gender factors, "caregiver roles", but different sexual patterns especially in child bearing and rearing. Some material differences like average stature (male) and endurance (female) are significant. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	sentence modified to include point
479	5	28	49	5	50	Exposure and vulnerability (as well as hazards) are part of Risk, so seems redundant the mention all three, maybe just disaster risk could be enough (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	noted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
480	5	29	5	29	14	Analysis of age seem superficial. Are elderly naturally inclined to choose to live in hazardous locations? (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	disagree..this is what the literature suggests. Also, elderly make voluntary locational choices often to warmer climates, which in the US, means along the hurricane coasts
481	5	29	10	29	10	Lack of declining hearing? (IPCC WGII TSU)	rephrased
482	5	29	22	29	24	important also that children have their own knowledge of hazards, hazardous places, vulnerability that is often different from adults More REFS. (1) Johnson, V. (ed.) (1996) Children's Participation. Participatory Learning and Action, PLA Notes 25: Special Issue (IIED). (2) 26. Plush, Tamara (2009) Amplifying children's voices on climate change: the role of participatory video. Participatory Learning and Action 60, 119-128. http://www.iied.org/pubs/display.php?o=14573IIED . (3) 12. Gaillard, J. C.; and Pangilinan, M. L. C. J. D. (2010) Participatory mapping for raising disaster risk awareness among the youth. J. of Contingencies and Crisis Management 18: 175-179. (4) 10. EIRD / ISDR (2008) ¡Aprendamos a Prevenir los Desastres! Los niños y las niñas también participamos en la reducción de riesgos. Juegos y Proyectos. San Jose, Costa Rica: EIRD (ISDR) Estrategia Internacional para la Reducción de Desastres, Unidad Regional para América Latina y el Caribe. And: UNICEF Costa Rica. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	point noted and some of the references included
483	5	29	29	42	42	Intersectionality is a horrible and unnecessary word (Morton, John, University of Greenwich)	agree but this is how it is used in the literature; omitted
484	5	30	1	30	14	The example is excellent, but some hints would be helpful: What should have been done to adapt? Prior to the event in after the event? (Bardt, Hubertus, Cologne Institute for Economic Research)	box expanded
485	5	30	3	0	0	How does this box illustrate heightened vulnerability of particular groups? (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	expanded to include this point
486	5	30	3	30	12	Box is too terse (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	expanded
487	5	30	3	30	12	Of the approximately 20 million people displaced by climate-related sudden-onset disasters in 2008, approximately 7.4 million were evacuated either as a preventive measure before a disaster or as palliative measure after a disaster. See OCHA and IDMC/NRC, 2009, Monitoring Disaster Displacement in the Context of Climate Change, available at http://www.internal-displacement.org/8025708F004BE3B1/(httpInfoFiles)/12E8C7224C2A6A9EC125763900315AD4/\$file/monitoring-disaster-displacement.pdf The 1998 UN Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement apply as a legal instrument and stress non-discrimination and participation. After Hurricane Katrina hit New Orleans, the Human Rights Committee received reports that the poor, and in particular African-Americans, were disadvantaged because the rescue and evacuation plans were based on the assumption that people would use their private vehicles, thus disadvantaging those not owning a car (CCPR/C/USA/CO/3). During displacement, pre-existing patterns of discrimination are often exacerbated, putting vulnerable groups at further risk of human rights abuses. In the context of Hurricane Katrina, the Human Rights Committee highlighted the importance of ensuring that the rights of the poor, and in particular African-Americans, are fully taken into consideration in the reconstruction plans with regard to access to housing, education and healthcare (CCPR/C/USA/CO/3). While evacuation or relocation to safer areas in consultation with the affected, can and should be encouraged and facilitated, forced evacuation or relocation is only permissible on certain conditions. Freedom of movement includes a right to stay. In the context of climate change and disasters, this means that the authorities must make real efforts to implement other adaptation and disaster risk reduction measures to make the areas safe enough so people can choose to stay. Involuntary relocation and resettlement rarely leads to improvements in the quality of life of those who are moved, so moving communities in anticipation of climate change may precipitate vulnerability more than it avoids it. While consultation and participation of affected people may be difficult or even impossible during the emergency phase of a disaster, it is particularly important, with regard to return, resettlement and recovery. Experience indicates that while there is investment in building houses at the relocation and resettlement sites, there is often not sufficient focus on the creation of livelihood opportunities and the provision of basic services such as water, sanitation, education and health. According to the Representative of the UN Secretary General on the Human Rights of Internally Displaced Persons, problems relating to housing, property and livelihoods result in most cases from an inadequate legal and budgetary framework, and the fact that the affected often come from marginalized sectors of society that continue to be marginalized. (Kolmannskog, "Dignity in disasters and displacement – exploring law, policy and practice on internal displacement, relocation and return in the context of climate change" Paper presented at the Global Environmental Change and Human Security Synthesis Conference, 22-24 June, 2009, University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway, available at http://www.nrc.no/arch/_img/9429376.doc ; and the report Kolmannskog, Climate Changed: People Displaced, NRC, December 2009, available at http://www.nrc.no/arch/_img/9448674.pdf) (Kolmannskog, Vikram, Norwegian Refugee Council)	while we agree with the main point, this should be addressed in Chapter 6 national and in Chapter 7 international
488	5	30	12	30	12	New Orleans has not been depopulated. I read recently that the wealthy areas of New Orleans have seen an increase in population since Katrina. It is the poorer areas where there has been a population decline. (IPCC WGII TSU)	this is incorrect; The city is 2/3 of the 2005 population, based on 2010 population estimates.
489	5	30	19	30	37	The livelihoods section is insufficient: this is a key area of intervention at the community level, in terms of strengthening resilience. (Kull, Daniel, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC))	this section was revised to provide more emphasis to local and community-level adaptation
490	5	30	22	30	23	"...in areas where extreme climates are expected to increase in duration and frequency..." needs to be revised to add specificity and qualifiers consistent with the assessment provided in Chapter 3 (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	noted--addressed in the text

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
491	5	30	23	30	23	"increase in duration and frequency" what about magnitude? (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	noted and addressed in the text
492	5	30	24	30	24	Please explain the term sustainable livelihoods in this context and give some more detail of how it will build adaptative capacity (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	addressed
493	5	30	27	30	37	livelihoods are particularly threatened, often destroyed, when there is rapid sequence of disaster events with too little time for recovery in between (as is increasing under climate change) e.g. REF Peters, Graciela; Michael K. McCall; and Cees van Westen (2009) Coping Strategies and Manageability: How Participatory Geographical Information Systems can Transform Local Knowledge into Better Policies for Disaster Risk Management. London: Aon Benfield UCL Hazard Research Centre Disaster Studies Working Paper 22. http://www.abuhrc.org/Publications/Working%20Paper%2022.pdf (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	agreed--text revised to incorporate this argument
494	5	30	36	30	37	Please specify of what kinds of interventions to catalyze adaptation are meant here and how is effective adaptation understood in this context. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	text was revised to make argument clearer
495	5	30	42	30	43	Please explain why extreme climate events generally lead to entitlement decline - the causes are not evident to a reader not familiar with the dicipline. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	a short example was provided
496	5	30	42	30	46	Post disasters is excellent opportunity for lands and natural resources and their entitlements to be stolen by rich and powerful, cf. the shock doctrine. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	noted
497	5	30	52	30	52	Please explain and possibly give examples of why and how community institutions regulate the access to adaptation resources. Is this always the case? (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	text was revised to make it clear how institutions can control access to resources
498	5	31	1	31	3	The sentence starting with "Entitlement protection.." is difficult to understand to a reader not familiar with the discussion/dicipline. Please give examples, if possible, of adaptive types of institutions. Also, please explain the terms local people's agency, and configurations of power relations. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	addressed--text was revised to make it easily understood
499	5	31	10	31	11	I suggest treating the GBD finding of current deaths w/ extreme caution. It is based on modeling (and assumes most of the deaths are because of crop productivity changes), not observations. At best, it is a crude estimate of current mortality from climate change. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	This is an important point and these additions have been added to the text.
500	5	31	12	31	13	The sentence "Mortality rates may increase, and morbidity of a diversity of illnesses can increase. " is vague, and it is therefore unclear what it adds to the paragraph. (Grynszpan, Delphine, UK Health Protection Agency)	This sentence was deleted.
501	5	31	13	31	14	I would suggest using the term "heatwave" rather than "extreme temperature/ heat" because heatwaves relate the extreme temperatures to the average that a given community is used to. High temperatures have a greater health impact on populations that are not acustomed to heat - conversely, populations can increase their resilience to heat. (Grynszpan, Delphine, UK Health Protection Agency)	This is a good point and the language has been changed accordingly.
502	5	31	13	31	14	How direct a causal link is there between extreme temperature and heatstroke and is the extreme temperature the only cause of heatstroke - after all it is only part of population that suffers heatstroke during heat waves. Also, cardiopulmonary problems are linked to shifts in air pollution concentration but that might not be the only cause. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	There is a link between extreme heat and heat stroke, as is suggested by the literature cited. The directness of the link is mediated by social factors, as suggested by subsequent sentences. There is no statement in the text that extreme temperature is the only cause of heatsroke.
503	5	31	15	31	17	Health inequalities in vulnerability to heatwaves can be put into the wider context of inequalities vulnerability to disasters in general. (Grynszpan, Delphine, UK Health Protection Agency)	This is an important point and this addition has been added to the text.
504	5	31	17	31	21	I would recommend using more cautious language here! Climate change may foster local environments that are more suitable to the spread of vector-borne disease, such as malaria and dengue, but the actual spread of the disease is also fundamentally a factor of population susceptibility and availability of vector-control measures. For example, the impact on vector-borne disease of a change in climate may be counter-balanced by improved vector-control through changes to the environment (stagnant water for example) and/or human adaptative measures (bednets/mosquito screens; chemical control measures). Furthermore, the actual impact climate change will have remains debated. Droughts for example could dry out the mosquitos' habitat (Mouchet 196) , but they could also foster the creation of stagnant pools (mosquito breeding ground) (Depradine 2004). Mouchet J, Faye O, Juivez J, Manguin S. Drought and malaria retreat in the Sahel, west Africa. Lancet 1996; 348(9043):1735-1736. Depradine C, Lovell E. Climatological variables and the incidence of Dengue fever in Barbados. Int J Environ Health Res 2004; 14(6):429-441. (Grynszpan, Delphine, UK Health Protection Agency)	The nuance in the potential for climate change to impact increases in vector borne disease rates and reach have been added. Arguments about vector control have been put later as they relate to adaptation measures.
505	5	31	17	31	21	Delete as this is not relevant. There should be a discussion of diarrheal diseases, including cholera outbreaks, after flooding events. There also should be mention of mental health. The references in this paragraph are old, with lots of newer and more relevant publications. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This section was edited to include other reviewer comments, new literature and other diseases.
506	5	31	23	31	24	The sentence starting with "The disaster literature..." is unclear - are there possibly word(s) missing? (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	This phrasing was changed for clarity.
507	5	31	23	31	29	There are lots of more recent and relevant publications. A Medline search would be in order. (IPCC WGII TSU)	included more recent refs
508	5	31	31	31	35	Delete as this is not relevant to the section. (IPCC WGII TSU)	moved to section 5.6

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
509	5	31	31	31	36	1) Mortality is usually the 'tip of the iceberg' in most disaster situations, hiding higher morbidity (illness, injury, mental ill-health) and disruption to the health infrastructure (which can restrict access to medical care and lessen resources). 2) In referring to seasonal hazards (what is termed here "climate-sensitive hazards") it may also be important to keep in mind that cold weather is generally associated with significantly higher mortality than hot weather, even in times of heatwaves. The statement made here may therefore not actually be pointing to a potential effect of global warming. For a reference comparing winter and summer excess mortality, see for example: Rousseau D. Heatwave related mortality and excess winter mortality in France. Climatologie, vol 3, 2006: p43-54. (Grynszpan, Delphine, UK Health Protection Agency)	noted
510	5	31	38	32	9	Characteristics and differences between rural and urban are not threatened with enough detail, for example differences in the level of investment, response capabilities, organization, resources, types of losses. (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	agree; text added
511	5	31	38	32	9	In this section, few is said in a very important area - cities and towns. Maybe it is needed to dedicate more space to deal with the subject. (Yasseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	agree; text added to cover this point
512	5	31	40	31	41	Please explain in a bit more detail why rural livelihoods and poverty are the drivers of disaster risk. This is not evident to a reader not familiar with the literature/discipline. Also, it is not evident why "this (referring to what?) will intensify under climate extremes". Please give examples, if possible. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	reader is referred to section 5.4.1.4 where more detail has been added
513	5	31	40	31	43	population growth patterns (absolute numbers) should receive more attention in this section (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	disagree--it is not the absolute growth that is important here for local places, but where such growth is occurring (e.g. rural, suburban, or urban places)
514	5	31	40	31	43	Physical (in-)accessibility is a real and serious constraint on rural DRR management - in preparedness as well as in post disaster situations (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	noted
515	5	32	4	32	5	It would be important to make a distinction between places like Bogota where such success have been reached and the many other places in the world where local governance and planning have not yet been successful in this respect. (O'Donnell, Ian, Asian Development Bank)	point is not supported in the literature we reviewed
516	5	32	5	32	5	Please explain the term structural mitigation (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	done
517	5	32	5	32	9	another place where population growth should figure in this discourse (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	done
518	5	32	7	32	7	Please explain tipping point and specify in relation to what have many megacities reached their tipping points. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	word deleted so as to not confuse
519	5	32	12	34	28	As chapter 4 has a section on costs etc care should be taken in identifying what is there and what is here and assuring compatibility and non repetitiveness. As measuring loss at the local level is difficult to achieve, a lot of what is said here is not local so questions can be raised as to whether this should be in this chapter or not--certainly given the community bias of the chapter there is nothing community based here that would justify it being in this chapter without creating a contradiction in terms of levels of analysis throughout the chapter. Moreover, if cost is analysed with reference to impact then it would seem reasonable to think that investment in terms of community based reduction should also be dealt with if the concept of local and DRM are taken to their full extent and one deals with local in the framework of reduction, preparedness, response, impact and recovery. On the local information front some reference should be made to the DESINVENTAR data base which is used by ISDR and GAR to measure extensive risk. Although there are strong limitations as regards info on costs of local impacts etc, some reference to what can be and what maybe achieved in the future using such instruments could be made here. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	Discussed with chapter 4 authors and the nonlocal components are either moved to Ch. 4 or deleted. We also discuss local scales other than community and included subnational levels such as provincial/state
520	5	32	12	34	28	Since there is not much information on costs at the local level, seems that this section could be more useful on chapters 6 and or 7. Costs of disasters, economic impacts and cost of DRM measures are mostly referred to cases inside the US, impacts in developing countries are dramatic as shown by several evaluation documents prepared by ECLAC since 1972 for Latin America and the Caribbean. (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Nonlocal sections were moved to Ch. 4 or deleted. We see a lack of published peer-reviewed papers on developing countries, and point to this as a research gap to be addressed
521	5	32	16	32	16	Strobl, 2009 ("The economic growth impact of hurricanes: Evidence from US coastal counties") could also be mentioned to appreciate the impact on GDP. (leblois, antoine, CIRED)	done
522	5	32	17	32	21	Another example is Japan. Cost- benefit ratios of flood control projects of recent ten years in Japan are from at least 2 to 5 (Homepage of Japan ministry of land, infrastructures, transport and tourism) which means the one unit of investment gives 2-4 units of benefits by reduction of flood damage cost. (morisugi, Hisayoshi, Nihon University)	this is not peer-reviewed and ministries have a tendency to say what they do is cost-effective. We are hesitant to include this reference, but recognize it is consistent with estimates from the US in flood mitigation savings
523	5	32	26	0	0	"Cost of impacts" is preferably rephrased by "Economic loss impacts", since the concept of opportunity cost has been emphasized in previous chapters. (Kondo, Masahide, University of Tsukuba)	done
524	5	32	26	32	26	An issue not raised in this section is the problems with using aggregated estimates of cost. According to the US Bureau of Economic Analysis, the economic damage of Hurricane Katrina was 0.69% of US GDP in 2005. It was 33% of GDP for Mississippi and Louisiana. Ebi wrote a paper for the Pew Global Change Center on Social Vulnerability that has these numbers. (IPCC WGII TSU)	done

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
525	5	32	28	32	28	General comment: it is quite striking that Hurricane Katarina is quite often used as an example in chapter 5. There are many other disasters which occurred the last few years or even very recently (Haiti, Pakistan etc.) which would be worth mentioning and which also caused major economic set-backs. Maybe this would also contribute to a better balance of examples between developing and industrialized countries. (Clot, Nicole, Intercooperation)	we tried to avoid earthquake examples for this climate extremes report
526	5	33	0	0	0	Section 5.4.2.2 - This section should be updated to reflect more refined measures and approaches to estimating adaptation costs. This is a rapidly changing area and there are a number of publications from 2010 (e.g., see the NYAS publication for an update on NYC methods and materials from Chicago as examples). It is not that this discussion is wrong, just that there are newer analyses and the shifting nature of methods, models, and links to adaptation measures should be reflected in the discussion. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	updated
527	5	33	2	33	2	This section is not well tied to the local scale (IPCC WGII TSU)	section was restructured to make the tie more explicit (e.g. city scale, etc.)
528	5	33	4	33	4	Please explain what is meant by baseline scenario here (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	deleted
529	5	33	15	33	16	Do you believe that it makes sense to not implement adaptation until more information is available? Under all circumstances? (IPCC WGII TSU)	paragraph modified to exclude this point
530	5	33	46	33	46	Not sure what is meant by 'Pessimistic climate change scenario' - are you able to give any more detail on the scenario used? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	paragraph modified to exclude this point
531	5	33	49	34	6	Even developed countries have the different adaptation between urban and rural areas. Because damage in Japanese urban areas is several hundred times more than that of rural areas, government should select hard and soft wares countermeasures depending on cost-benefit view. (Kazama S., Sato A., Kawagoe S., (2009) Evaluating the cost of flood damage based on changes in extreme rainfall in Japan, Sustainability Science, Vol.4, Iss.1, pp.61-69. (Kazama, So, Tohoku University)	noted and included
532	5	34	31	35	37	Section is difficult to follow (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	section simplified
533	5	34	33	35	37	This is a topic that is dealt with in various other parts of the study and again we need to assure non repetitiveness. Also it seems to be a very short and focussed analysis whereas the topic allows for a far greater number of considerations. So, should the section not deal specifically with limits to adaptation at community level given this is the major topic dealt with in this chapter at the local level? (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	addressed with more focus to the local level
534	5	34	33	35	37	Limits of budget, international aid, human resources should be described here. (Kazama, So, Tohoku University)	lack of financial resources was discussed
535	5	34	35	35	2	These is information on impacts that is distracts from the point: lack of capabilities or limits to adaptation: budget, education, organization, institutions, knowledge, environmental degradation, etc. (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	text revised to cover this
536	5	34	48	34	48	The term "natural disasters" appears frequently in the chapter, moreover appears in almost every single chapter of the book. Disturbing when one thinks on how long has been argued and demonstrated that nature is not the cause of disasters and hence they are NOT natural (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	noted
537	5	35	4	35	16	The information in this paragraph is useful, but quite general and repetitive - most of these issues that have been discussed earlier in the chapter; for example the sentence "Improving community access to information ..." (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	noted and addressed
538	5	35	7	35	8	Some qualifications would be appropriate for this statement. Is this true everywhere over all time scales? (IPCC WGII TSU)	noted, the situation is specific to drought-prone areas in Africa
539	5	35	16	35	16	Maybe "to manage risks and disasters" could be more consistent with the conceptual framework (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	sentence deleted
540	5	35	24	35	24	The good argument of this chapter is not enough explicit. I therefore suggest to add the following sentences: " As the above aspects show the main challenge is to find a good balance of measures simultaneously addressing fundamental issues related to local the enhancement of local collective actions, and the creation of adequate and subsidiary structures at regional, national and international societal structures. This means that in Southern, as well as in Northern countries the politically identified relative emphasis that is given on mitigation and adaptations widely sets the type, frequency and extremeness of climate related natural hazards and risks. This means that we should not forget to see increase of climate related risks and hazards are also the localized expressions of the limitations of the marco-structures and underlying capitalist ideologies (Magdoff & Foster, 2010, Seis 2001). Consequently it is also important to insist in tackling the management of climate change borne hazard and risks through a critical revision and debate of the capitalist foundations of currently prevailing societal organization. Magdoff F, Bellamy Foster J. 2010. What Every Environmentalist Needs to Know About Capitalism. The Monthly Review 61 (10). Seis M. 2001. Confronting the Contradiction: Global Capitalism and Environmental Health. International Journal of Comparative Sociology 42 (1-2) 123-144. (Rist, Stefan, Centre for Development and Environment (CDE))	noted, text revised to reflect some of these conclusions
541	5	35	25	35	37	Examples are for developed countries (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	noted
542	5	35	35	35	35	Please give SI-units, too (\$ / square metre) (Rock, Joachim, Johann Heinrich von Thuenen-Institute)	done
543	5	35	40	0	0	Sharing responsibilities between community members and executive responsables in successive stages of management might need more attention. (Yasseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	noted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
544	5	35	40	39	27	This section on management strategies is too highly concentrated on financial and risk transfer mechanisms, particularly insurance which takes up almost half the section. Moreover, these insurance topics have been dealt with extensively in other chapters and here the specific local nature of the discussion does not come out clearly, and much of what is said is repeated in more general discussions of these topics in other chapters. One way or another, when dealing with community based insurance some mention could be made of the Bolivian highlands Yapachuri led scheme for poor indigenous agricultural communities and also the Manizales city insurance scheme for poor urban communities. There are so many more management strategies out there which are specific to communities or localities seen in other terms, which means this section is rather incomplete. Moreover, it only really deals with post impact considerations--how to pick up the pieces- and little is there in terms of strategies for risk reduction ex ante. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	we disagree, but have truncated some of the financial and risk transfer sections
545	5	35	42	35	51	Exposure is assumed here as synonym of risk and even hazard; this is not the case for the rest of the draft report and most of the literature. Risk is a function of hazard, vulnerability and exposure. The text is referring to hazards on numeral 1), not risk or exposure (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	will articulate with the glossary group to clarify; there are different views on this
546	5	35	47	0	0	Section 5.5.1 - It might be useful to link adaptation assessments to this discussion (keeping in mind the emergent nature of these assessments) to provide a comparison between what each approach offers. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	done--a new paragraph was inserted
547	5	35	47	36	32	Methods, models and assessment tools are really not management strategies but, rather, instruments for formulating strategies and measures. They don't achieve risk reduction as such only facilitate it. One way or another there is no similarity in concept with regard to methods as such and something like risk transfer which is a strategy backed up by concrete types of instrument. The section leaves out a vast amount of work done on assessment in southern countries. Not mentioning the IFRC work on vulnerability analysis at the community level or World Visions use of COVACA analysis for example seems a major omission here. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	done
548	5	35	51	35	51	Exposure is depicted as being risk. This is contradictory to the definitions being used in other places where risk is a result of hazard interacting with exposed but vulnerable elements. (Lavell, Allan, Programme for the Social Study of Risk and Disaster (FLACSO))	will articulate with the glossary group to clarify; there are different views on this
549	5	35	54	36	1	a focus on damages only neglects the analysis of possible opportunities due to climate change (Guenther, Edeltraud, Technische Universität Dresden)	point noted
550	5	36	1	36	1	Could add that scenarios or narratives need to include climate change; much visioning work right now does not. You also could add that it is important to include all relevant actors when developing scenarios. (IPCC WGII TSU)	reference to scenarios was deleted
551	5	36	5	36	9	A reference to chapter 2 is needed as this chapter covers the exposure and vulnerability assessment theories, which is redundant in this chapter. (Ammann, Walter J., Global Risk Forum GRF Davos)	done
552	5	36	35	36	35	Section 5.5.2 should have an introduction describing what it is covering and how it is organized (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	intro sentence provided and a subheading made more descriptive
553	5	36	37	38	36	Social transfers/protection is not treated here as a mean to DRM at the local level, its implementation depends on decisions taken at the national level. Political advocacy is a very important strategy for poor communities to get their voices heard (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	noted
554	5	36	47	37	21	The text describing social protection could go more effectively in a Box as was done for the same material in Chapter 6, Box 6.6. Need to decide if this text and the related Figure is needed in both Chapters. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	deleted
555	5	37	2	37	2	Table 5.4 is identical to Table 6.5. Could one of these be removed? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	deleted here
556	5	37	15	37	15	Cash-for-food in larger famine prevention programmes could also be mentioned. (Ilebois, Antoine, CIRED)	noted
557	5	37	36	39	15	Insurance is treated at the national level also and has been included extensively in chapter 6, there is a serious overlap here (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	text altered and articulated with chapter 6
558	5	37	51	37	52	Does this data on insurance premiums include all property insurance including auto insurance, life insurance, and home owners insurance (which includes protection against theft.) So not all of this has to do with protection against natural hazards (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	we believe it includes all forms of insurance
559	5	38	30	38	31	Interesting, but no citation (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	reference added
560	5	38	50	38	51	Is use of "catastrophic" justified? (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	yes
561	5	38	51	38	52	Sentence is speculative and should be more specific (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	disagree; based on the literature
562	5	39	18	39	27	Section 5.5.2.3 is underdeveloped when compared with other subsections, for instance the previous on insurance (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	added text
563	5	39	25	39	27	important policy and ethical issue, which deserves more treatment (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	added text
564	5	39	30	40	11	"Adaptation as a process" or "Adaptation on the basis of DRM". The truth is that what has already been done and tested at the local responds to DRM and Disaster Response measures; adaptation has emerged as it was a new practice but it's not. Is something that develops on the basis of humans dealing with disasters since Noah's ark or before (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	recognize point and have adapted into sentence to include experience with disaster response
565	5	39	40	39	41	Is Figure 5-4 normative or positive. Does it describe what is observed or what the authors think should happen. Please clarify. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	unclear about the comment; no response

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
566	5	40	0	0	0	Section 5.6 - It is useful that you bring this to local needs for information and data. As the previous point and others in this review suggest, it would help to make the links to climate action clear in this final section. You have spend a good deal of time discussing adaptation so this may be a point where you can add just a bit to develop ideas on the links between CCA and disaster mitigation, preparedness, response and recovery. (Carmin, JoAnn, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)	Section was infused with more specific language to focus on local needs for data and information.
567	5	40	0	0	0	there is no discussion in this chapter on EIA (environmental impact assessment). EIA is a highly developed methodology, with decades of applications locally, nationally and globally, and deeply embedded in most national policy and planning procedures. DRR development can learn from EIA approaches, methodology and planning procedures. REF. ProVention, Community Risk Assessment Geneva: Tools for Mainstreaming Disaster Risk Reduction: Guidance Note No.7. Environmental Assessment. http://www.proventionconsortium.org/themes/default/pdfs/tools_for_mainstreaming_GN7.pdf (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Noted, but we disagree as to its central relevance for DRM and CCA
568	5	40	6	40	7	Please specify and give examples, if possible, of what is meant by fostering better adaptive capacity. Also, some examples of how this will accelerate future adaptation would be very helpful. (Kankaanpää, Susanna, HSY Helsinki Region Environmental Services Authority)	examples are provided in the references cited.
569	5	40	14	0	0	no comment (Yaseen, Adel, Ain Shams University - Institute of Environmental Research and Studies)	noted
570	5	40	14	0	0	Useful section, but seems misplaced as a conclusion to the chapter. It could instead be used as a way to frame the chapter (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	Disagree. Section was modified to include more text that was conclusion and recommendations for research.
571	5	40	14	40	14	I had a hard time picking out the key research gaps from this narrative. The discussion was interesting, but I didn't get a sense of what research could fill critical gaps in knowledge in the short term, and what was needed in the long term. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text re-edited to highlight key research, data and knowledge needs
572	5	40	14	42	5	The final section seems to be filled with a lot of opinion. Is this appropriate? Also the discussion addresses other topics besides information, data, and research gaps. Perhaps the section should have a different title or be rewritten to address the title. (Smith, Joel, Stratus Consulting Inc.)	The statements are grounded in the previous literature and across decades of hazards and disaster management and climate and decisionmaking literature
573	5	40	32	40	35	Please reword so this sentence does not imply that storms etc are a consequence of climate change, but rather events that may be influenced by climate change - eg, ".....floods, droughts storms and other events that are anticipated to be influenced by climate change". (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Sentence reword
574	5	41	1	41	2	Adaptation strategies also involves natural resource protection, environmental protection, sustainable livelihoods, local organization, institutional strengthteiong, education, budge allocation; seems that restricting adaptation to four elements (two of them linked to response) is not the right idea to transmit to politicians and decision makers (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Agree.
575	5	41	7	41	36	I suggest reframing to more clearly identify research gaps and move the discussion to relevant sections earlier in the chapter. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Agree. Text reworded to indicate research gaps more clearly
576	5	41	9	41	14	of course "local and community-driven" is essential (and often under-valued), but it reintroduces the question of what and who is community? People are rapidly more mobile and migratory, in South as well as North countries, so communities are not culturally, socially, demographically unchanging. Who speaks for the community internally, and into the future? Do the diaspora of villagers or tribal / clan networks have the right to be involved (in DRR management) in their former home areas with which they are still linked? What about recent in-migrants - are they part of the traditional community to be included in CB-DRR? (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Agree on the multiple dimensions. The characterizaion of "community used in this chapter is introduced in earlier sections
577	5	41	15	41	21	yes, hazard maps must be participatory and differential for different actor groups. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Agree
578	5	41	22	41	25	again, (like p. 41, lines 9-14 above) seems to be an implicit belief that rural (south) people are immobile, unchanging, will live their lives out in the same location. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Agree. However the text is rferring to people at risk-whether long-standing or recent arrivals who have moved from other palces of risk
579	5	41	26	41	27	"Local disaster risk management" has been an important research topyc since 2003 in Central America and 2009 in South America. Sources are in Spanish!! (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	Noted
580	5	41	39	41	40	even more significant for this chapter is the development of Participatory GIS by and for local comunites.to deal with their own risks, See REFS in Comment on p.24, lines 19-22. (McCall, Michael, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico)	Agree. References added to earlier text in the chapter
581	5	42	1	42	2	The example seems too simple, maybe could be of more impact to take into account the effet of depleting higher lands of watersheds (Romano, Luis, Centro Humboldt)	The example is illustrative-sentence amended to and other corrosives or the decline of upstream watershed conditions that affect the livelihoods downstream communities
582	5	50	38	50	40	Wrong title of the chapter in reference - should be switched with what is now referred to as the title of the book (Naess, Lars Otto, Institute of Development Studies)	noted
583	5	62	0	0	0	Table 5-2. The category "Mass movement (wet)" needs explanation - as is provided in the footnote of the original Red Cross version of this table. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	table deleted
584	5	62	0	62	0	Check Chps 3 and 4, but I think table 5.3 is included elsewhere and is not needed in this chapter. (IPCC WGII TSU)	table deleted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
585	5	64	0	0	0	Box 5-1 and Table 5-1 provide an excellent description of the process used by Chapter 5 for assessing grey literature, such that the addition of Figure 5-1 is perhaps not necessary. While chapter 5 may well have used such a rigid procedure, this figure unfortunately may not apply to other SREX chapters and may leave other chapters open to criticism. If it is to remain included, I would suggest the following minor changes - change the final dark green boxes in all instances to read 'include for further assessment'. The current wording used in these boxes gives the misinterpretation that once something (either peer or non-peer reviewed) makes it into the report, its findings are taken as fact. In reality, the assessment and evaluation of the material put into the report is ongoing even after publication. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	figure deleted; box reduced
586	5	64	0	64	0	I suggest deleting this figure unless this is exactly the process used. (IPCC WGII TSU)	figure deleted
587	5	66	0	66	0	I could not look at this figure and immediately understand the point. You might consider revising so that it can be understood as a stand-alone. How do enabling, participatory differ from partnership? What is meant by partnership? Why does resilience go back to impacts? What does the diagonal arrow mean? What is the paradigm shift? (IPCC WGII TSU)	figure deleted
588	5	467	6	467	16	Adding to comment on P57/L21-23 one can also stress the following. In regions such as the Sudano-Sahelian zone of Africa, food deficits, poverty, and recurrent conflicts are elements which reinforce local communities vulnerability to climate hazards, particularly drought. On the other side, hazards and disasters common to this area aggravate conflicts, by limiting access to natural resources (land and water mostly) for which competition is high and already source of tension between and within communities. (Ben Mohamed, Abdelkrim, University of Niamey)	noted
589	5	472	42	472	44	There is another aspect of community empowerment which could address the issues mentioned in previous comment on P467/L6-16. This is based upon interdependence between : (i) the level of vulnerability of the populations, and (ii) risks of crisis bearing in mind that conflicts increase vulnerability and hence risks of disasters. On the other hand, hazards and disasters, by limiting access to natural resources generate tensions and/or feed existing conflicts. So, the solution could be based upon poverty reduction by reinforcing the capacity of national institutions and community stakeholders in preventing and managing socio political conflicts and disasters mainly through two specific objectives: (1) support the reinforcement of the capacity of the institutions and community stakeholders in the prevention and management of socio political conflicts taking into account gender issues, and (2) support the reinforcement of the capacity of the institutions and community stakeholders in the prevention and management of socio political conflicts through reduction of risks taking into account gender issues. (Ben Mohamed, Abdelkrim, University of Niamey)	noted
590	5	474	11	0	23	A good description of integrating local knowledge but not enough guidance about HOW to do this and how it can be replicated. I believe the key issue at this level to be 'what are the knowledge tools' to implement the Hyogo Framework for Action (HFA). The key issue should be 'effective knowledge management to implement HFA'. (Young, Ronald, Young International Ltd / Knowledge Associates International Ltd)	noted
591	5	488	44	488	52	Research gaps at local level to improve disaster mitigation should also include investigations of the roots of the problems. For example, there will be a need to investigate on: - how sustainable are community based livestock management practices in the context of changing climate and associated with it environmental conditions; - how rationally do communities use water, and most importantly in drought prone areas, harvest water; - how also these communities restore and protect from degradation already affected areas; - what adaptation options are the best to integrate gender issues in the sectors of water resources management, agriculture, forestry, livestock management and habitat. (Ben Mohamed, Abdelkrim, University of Niamey)	noted