

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
1	9	0	0	0	0	Great idea to present cases studies. However, for example; droughts and its effect have been very well presented in chapter 3(3.5.1) as well as cases such the Sahel (sections 3.1.7, page 36 and 52 in chapter3). Many of chapter's 3 ideas should be introduced here (chapter 9) in order to improve compatibility of chapters or reduce duplication. (Mata, Luis Jose , IMF)	Addressed - In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case study of drought to be only on Syria for example. This has facilitated much closer working with Chapter 3 and allowed the opportunity to reflect the comment here more effectively. . In addition, a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed.
2	9	0	0	0	0	Chapter 9 describes specific case studies. It would be expedient to add to the list of case studies extremely high temperature and drought period on the European part of Russia taken place in summer 2010. Dzud is a very specific phenomenon and it requires more detailed explanation. A synthesis of lessons learned from case studies is provided, which is definitely of great benefit. (RUSSIAN FEDERATION)	Addressed – 1. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case study of drought to be only on heat waves should cover the European heat waves of 2003 and 2006 as there was better evidence published on these that the recent event in Russian in 2010; 2. Dzud is are more explicitly discussed in case study 9.2.4 reflecting this comment; 3. A synthesis of lessons is included as well as helpful Matrix that addressed how the case studies consider lessons identified; In addition, a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed.
3	9	0	0	0	0	It is a well documented chapter presenting cases covering all the areas of extreme events and disasters, from cyclones and heat waves to floods droughts and combination of events in different areas. It describes the cases and focused on the results mainly to population, the lessons learned and the policies received after the events for reducing the severity of their future appearance. Finally, the necessity of an early warning system is stressed together with the benefits by its implementation, while the different contributed parts of the system dedicated to different aspects of the situation (from the forecasting system to the population alert and the decision making) are identified. In general, I would prefer, for its completeness, to add/refer in the presentation of the extreme events, the possible triggering factors that caused them, e.g. easterly waves, SST anomalies, etc). These triggering factors may be changing due to climate change hence affecting the frequency of the extreme events occurrence. (GREECE)	Thank you – Addressed – 1.Where available Early warning systems (and the EWS case study 9.2.11) has been included; 2.The information on triggers has been shared with the other chapters and the causes have been considered and added
4	9	0	0	0	0	It is true that in order to identify the impacts of an event on climate effects on both spatial and temporal scales should be investigated. Although there is a long record of meteorological observations, especially temporal-scale effects of disasters are more difficult to be accurately identified due to uncertainties of historical records as it is noted within the text (page 3 line 38) (GREECE)	Thank you for your support – we agree
5	9	0	0	0	0	The references should be summarised in the end of the chapter (and not after each section) as was done in the previous chapters (GREECE)	Addressed – all references are at the end of the chapter
6	9	0	0	0	0	It is proposed to consider inclusion in the Chapter Assessment of climate related “over-normative loads” for infrastructure in the North-West part of Russia. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Addressed – deleted as Russia is no longer included in the case studies
7	9	0	0	0	0	Significant part of the Russian territory is located within the region of maximum climatic change, observed and predicted. In this context infrastructure including energy sector, transport, and building construction may be the most vulnerable economy sectors. The main climate-related impacts that affect infrastructure are atmospheric loadings (wind, ice snow, air temperature variability) on buildings and constructions. As a rule normative atmospheric loads are taken into account in the process of projecting construction work. Nevertheless recently the notion “over-normative load” has come into existence (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Addressed – deleted as Russia is no longer included in the case studies
8	9	0	0	0	0	Over-normative loads arise in the following way: (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Addressed – deleted
9	9	0	0	0	0	· building standard has changed because of using more accurate climate information but some constructions were built according to obsolete standard; (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	This is a interesting comment – we have considered the infrastructure issues in detail in the 9.2.10 Changing cold climate vulnerabilities: Northern Canada – this is the best case study to reflect this comment we consider
10	9	0	0	0	0	· climate conditions have changed (e.g. climate hazards frequency or climate anomalies have risen), but building standard was not corrected; (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	This is a interesting comment – we have considered the infrastructure issues in detail in the 9.2.10 Changing cold climate vulnerabilities: Northern Canada – this is the best case study to reflect this comment we consider

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
11	9	0	0	0	0	buildings and constructions grow old because of the atmospheric loading, and their durability shortens. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	This is an interesting comment – we have considered the infrastructure issues in detail in the 9.2.10 Changing cold climate vulnerabilities: Northern Canada – this is the best case study to reflect this comment we consider
12	9	0	0	0	0	Over-normative loads are especially dangerous for power generation and transportation industry and house-building as the most vulnerable economy sectors. Projected climate warming will further enhance atmospheric loads. Therefore in MGO additional investigations were conducted in order to determine adaptation strategy. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	This is an interesting comment – we have only considered the infrastructure issues in detail in the 9.2.10 Changing cold climate vulnerabilities: Northern Canada – this is the best case study to reflect this comment we consider
13	9	0	0	0	0	These loads and appropriate climate risks have been estimated for the North-West part of Russia. One of the most dangerous weather events for the power industry facilities could be the whirlwind. The North-West part of Russia could be characterized as whirlwind endangered region (Natural disasters of Russia, 2001). Nevertheless for the last 100 years only 6 whirlwinds were observed on this territory including one event force 1 (middle damage) and others force 0 (slight damage) according to Fugita scale. The first whirlwind was observed 1925, four events took place in the period 1974-1976, the last one was registered 1988. Therefore it was resolved that the whirlwind frequency didn't increase in this region, in contrast to the rest of the Russian territory. Thus climate-related risk of over-normative loads because of whirlwinds is insignificant (10-10) (Kobysheva ets, 2008) as well as dangerous wind speed, because mean and maximal wind speeds were decreasing during last decades (Assessment Report, 2008). Analysis of observation data and simulation results revealed that the most considerable over-normative loads on the power industry facilities in this region can be caused by rising snow and ice loads, more frequent autumn and spring frosts and thaws, and increased air temperature variability. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Addressed but deleted comments about Russia, as Russia is no longer included in the case studies. But for this complex issue in this comment – we have only considered the infrastructure issues in detail in the 9.2.10 Changing cold climate vulnerabilities: Northern Canada – this is the best case study we consider to reflect this comment we consider
14	9	0	0	0	0	Over-normative loads on house-building reduce the buildings durability (about 20%, in St. Petersburg), make worse their energy and heat supply. The damage caused by these reasons accounts in St. Petersburg annually about 100 billion rubles. These loads arise because of frequent autumn and spring frosts and thaws as well as increased air temperature variability (Fifth National Communication, 2010). Air temperature in coldest five days and number of degree days in this region change slightly due to climate change. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Very interesting – but due to space constraints this is not included in this chapter – so in summary it was addressed but deleted as Russia is no longer included in the case studies
15	9	0	0	0	0	The vulnerability of mentioned economy sectors were assessed by engineers together with climatologists. It was resolved that increasing atmospheric loads might be taken into account when building codes reforming in order to reach acceptable risk values. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	This is an interesting comment – we have only considered the infrastructure issues in detail in the 9.2.10 Changing cold climate vulnerabilities: Northern Canada – this is the best case study to reflect this comment we consider
16	9	0	0	0	0	In this way the risk management at the national level can be based on the concept of acceptable risk. The acceptable risk value is a country-specific solution. It differs according to the socio-economic conditions. In Russia this value reaches (10-4 - 10-7): (10-4) - for operating capacity; (10-5) – for designed projects; 10-7 - for nuclear sites (Kobysheva ets, 2008) (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	This is interesting – but due to space constraints this is not included in this chapter – so in summary it was addressed but deleted as Russia is no longer included in the case studies
17	9	0	0	0	0	When climate-related risk exceeds specified permissible value, adaptation measures may be taken including early warning about dangerous weather events; monitoring of anomalous climate conditions; mapping of ultimate behaviour of infrastructure facilities; reforming of Building Standards and Codes taking into account over normative loads. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	This is an interesting comment – we have only considered the infrastructure issues in detail in the 9.2.10 Changing cold climate vulnerabilities: Northern Canada – this is the best case study to reflect this comment we consider
18	9	0	0	0	0	Chapter 9 with case studies is, in my opinion, the weakest part of the special report. The entire structure of this chapter with sub-chapters 9.2.1 to 9.2.13 is not very consistent. In chapters 9.2.1 to 9.2.4 four types of extreme events are presented, in the subsequent three sub-chapters complex disasters are addressed, in chapters 9.2.8 and 9.2.9 critical places and regions are selected, and in the remaining sub-chapters issues of risk transfers, legislation and early warning systems are elaborated. When the authors argue (page 2, line 13-19) that case studies should have a good theoretical basis arising from application of rigorous methodology and comparative multi-case logic, all these considerations are not really apparent in this chapter. Moreover, these so-called “case studies” (the entire term seems to me not really applicable) do not fully capture the complexity of disaster risk and disaster situations, they do not really appeal to a broad audience, and they do not make the most of each single case, as argued in the introduction to this chapter. The minimum for improving this chapter should be a new structure of contents which groups the “case studies” according to the specific selection criteria. Moreover, the synthesis of lessons identified from case studies (9.3) should be more elaborated and linked, in a more systematic way, to the various “case studies”. In the last analysis, this chapter, in a thoroughly revised version, should be placed before the existing chapter 8 which provides a much more conclusive and convincing last part of this report. (Bohle, Hans-Georg, University of Bonn)	Thank you for this valid and important comment. We agreed and in May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case study of single events – where data was available - for clarity and to demonstrate where possible complexity- for example drought in Syria is the only case study on drought and the three other examples were removed. The chapter has been thoroughly revised as a result. In addition, a common structure for the case studies in chapter nine was also been agreed. We have added a matrix which we considered to be the best way to demonstrate more systematically the areas that the case studies cover in the DRR/DRM and CCA domains and this reduced the need, in our view, to expand the synthesis at the end as we had space constraints for the chapter to contend with.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
19	9	0	0	0	0	This is a very important chapter with a lot of very good cases. A unified structure with a distinct structure level may highlight the key points. (CHINA)	Thank you. In addition, a common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed.
20	9	0	0	0	0	CONSISTENCY WITH CHAPTER 3: There are still several case studies where careful attention needs to be given to ensuring any statements regarding physical changes in extremes are 100% consistent with the assessed observations and projections given in Chapter 3. The information given in Chapter 3 is based on carefully assessed, multiple lines of evidence, and it is crucial readers are not confused by conflicting statements given in other chapters. We have noted these instances in the detailed comments, and generally offered suggested chapter-3 based rewording for any problematic statements, but we also encourage further cross-checking to be completed with the Chapter 3 authors. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – chapter 3 has commented on all the case studies and has been closely with us
21	9	0	0	0	0	REFERENCING: Referencing style needs to be made consistent throughout all the case studies. There is some quite random and unnecessary use of footnotes noted in some case studies. Reference to IPCC assessment reports need to cite a specific chapter or SPM where ever possible. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed , all footnotes removed, and IPCC AR4 in particular referred to often
22	9	0	0	0	0	LINKING WITH OTHER CHAPTERS: Many of the case studies discussed in Chapter 9 still appear to be more or less unrelated to any of the underlying Chapters. There needs to be an effort to improve the linking between the assessments in Chapters 1-8 with the case studies provided in Chapter 9. This effort has to include both, linking/referring to Chapter 9 from Chapter 1-8 and linking/referring to Chapter 1-8 from Chapter 9. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – all the other chapters have worked with us except Chapter 7 international – they stated explicitly they did not want to link to the case studies
23	9	0	0	0	0	These case studies have great potential, but many do not live up to that. They should be linking chapter 2-3-4 information (but with its interpretation in a specific decision-making context) to the risk management issues discussed in 5, 6 and to some extent 7 and 8 (as in the SPM table). (International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC))	Thank you for this valid and important comment. We agreed and in May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case study of single events – where data was available - for clarity and to demonstrate where possible complexity- for example drought in Syria is the only case study on drought and the three other examples were removed. In addition, a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed. We have added a matrix which we considered to be the best way to demonstrate more systematically the areas that the case studies cover in the DRR/DRM and CCA domains and this reduced the need, in our view, to expand the synthesis at the end as we had space constraints for the chapter to contend with. The Matrix explicitly links to the SPM messages. Finally all the the other chapters have worked with us except Chapter 7 international – they stated explicitly they did not want to link to the case studies.
24	9	0	0	0	0	Cases or references about the drought in Chile and the Chilean Agricultural Insurance are not present or included (CHILE)	Unfortunately we were limited for space and could not include this suggestion
25	9	0	0	0	0	Main concerns: (CARLINO, HERNAN, UNIVERSIDAD TORCUATO DI TELLA)	N/A
26	9	0	0	0	0	1. The structure, length, and components in each case study differ widely. Length varies, some case studies are almost global in scope, other are regionally located, others are sub-national. In some case studies reference on how to manage the events are provided, other make concluding remarks, while others end with lessons learnt. Stronger coordination on structure, and overall approach to cases may improve the overall outcome. (CARLINO, HERNAN, UNIVERSIDAD TORCUATO DI TELLA)	Thank you for this valid and important comment. We agreed and in May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on case studies - a common structure in chapter nine was also been agreed – all were required to be less than 3,000 words long.
27	9	0	0	0	0	2. The organization of the chapter may benefit from a different taxonomy of the cases, aggregating them under major impacts categories. If that is already done the rationale is not clear. (CARLINO, HERNAN, UNIVERSIDAD TORCUATO DI TELLA)	Thank you for this valid and important comment. We agreed and in May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on case studies - a common structure in chapter nine was also been agreed – all were required to be less than 3,000 words long.
28	9	0	0	0	0	3. Section 9.2.9 on SIDS and LDCS merits a stand alone section. As such it is not a case study but an exploration on impacts and limits to adaptation in those countries. (CARLINO, HERNAN, UNIVERSIDAD TORCUATO DI TELLA)	Thank you for this valid and important comment. We agreed and in May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on case studies – unfortunately it was agreed that we could only have SIDS included so the LCDS have been dropped as we did not have enough space for both.
29	9	0	0	0	0	4. Section 9.2.10 on risk transfer have been dealt with in previous chapters and the information an examples should be transferred to the relevant chapters. It duplicates the treatment of the issue with a slightly different approach and the instruments and approaches described here would enrich the treatment in Chapter 7, where these inputs could help the underlying debate on the relevance and feasibility of the available instruments and current practices. (CARLINO, HERNAN, UNIVERSIDAD TORCUATO DI TELLA)	Addressed – by working closely with Chapters 6 and 7 colleagues who have added material from their chapter to our Risk Transfer case study so the material – as in this case study’s depth in only included once – it was considered to be important for the other Chapter’s (1-6 and 8) to link as well.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
30	9	0	0	0	0	5. Section 9.2.11 on education, training, and public awareness also seems misplaced, as the conceptual approach could best be framed in previous chapters. (CARLINO, HERNAN, UNIVERSIDAD TORCUATO DI TELLA)	Thank you for this comment. We agreed and in May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM including education – by discussion with the other chapters it was agreed that a case study on education should be retained in Chapter 9.
31	9	0	0	0	0	6. Section 9.2.12 on legislative approaches also merits the same observation. (CARLINO, HERNAN, UNIVERSIDAD TORCUATO DI TELLA)	Thank you for this comment. We agreed and in May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM including legislation – by discussion with the other chapters it was agreed that a case study on education should be retained in Chapter 9.
32	9	0	0	0	0	7. If there is no space for restructuring, at least the case studies should be divided in case studies on extreme events and case studies on means, instruments, tools, mechanisms and institutional arrangements to foster adaptation and facilitate disaster risk reduction. (CARLINO, HERNAN, UNIVERSIDAD TORCUATO DI TELLA)	Thank you for this comment. We agreed and in May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – we believe our final choice has been the most useful one for our colleagues in the other chapters1-8
33	9	0	0	0	0	The synthesis of lessons identified at the end of the chapter is too succinct (rather a colophon) and requires further elaboration, given the extent of cases included, their relevance and scope. (CARLINO, HERNAN, UNIVERSIDAD TORCUATO DI TELLA)	Addressed - We have added a matrix which we considered to be the best way to demonstrate more systematically the areas that the case studies cover in the DRR/DRM and CCA domains and this reduced the need, in our view, to expand the synthesis at the end as we had space constraints for the chapter to contend with
34	9	0	0	0	0	The Case Studies have been nicely developed, providing very good collective examples pertinent to both DRR and CCA. The selectio is very good reflecting a wide variety of countries, types of countries, human habitats and specific functional aspects of risk reduction and adaptation practice. The standard and quality of presentation is now much more uniform and of a higher standard than earlier versions. While obviously the content and emphasis of individual case studies vary, taken as a whole the Chapter is a useful and indeed important Chapter for the SREX document. The spread is considerable, but most importantly the case studies demonstrate both what can be done and has been done with considerable variation and multiple considerations, contexts and emphasis. The cases also demonstrate the wide variety of participating authorities and institutions involved too, underlining a crucial requirement for future DRR and CCA as being involved with and through many different organizational, sectoral, and institutional instruments. (Jeggle, Terry, University of Pittsburgh)	Thank you for this comment. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – we believe our final choice has been the most useful one for our colleagues in the other chapters1-8
35	9	0	0	0	0	Le chapitre 9 est très intéressant par les cas sélectionnés pour éclairer treize problématiques dont la cause d'entrée est : - pour cinq un aléa : cyclone, vague de chaleur, sécheresse, inondations et suites complexes, feux suite à sécheresse et chaleur - pour quatre une situation d'exposition et/ou de forte vulnérabilité : système de santé déficient, mégacités des deltas, petits Etats insulaires - pour quatre des actions spécifiques : transfert de risques, éducation-sensibilisation-préparation, renforcement de la gouvernance, système de vigilance Dans l'ensemble les actions relèvent de la RRC éclairée ou activée par l'ACC particulièrement dans quatre cas ; l'adaptation au changement climatique joue un rôle majeur dans un cas. - cyclones : les cas sont exemplaires ; le CC n'ayant pas une incidence claire (par rapport à l'exposition), sert de sensibilisation. - Vagues de chaleur en zone urbaine : cas exemplaire de DRR dans la perspective de réchauffement (BOURRELIER, PAUL-HENRI, AFPCN)	Thank you

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
36	9	0	0	0	0	Suite - Sécheresses : la perspective climatique, pas toujours claire, peut s'ajouter. La DRR comporte le management des ressources en eau (y compris éducation, le dialogue social, l'information) des actions santé ; les migrations (p 20 ligne53) sont citées comme impact alors qu'elles peuvent constituer, sous certaines conditions d'organisation, un élément rationnel de solution - Suites complexes à inondations : le cas du Mozambique, avec ses suites sanitaires, résulte d'une suite d'aléas où interviennent en plus des inondations des sécheresses et des cyclones. - Grands feux liés à des sécheresses et des températures élevées : le rôle joué par les modifications culturelles et les extensions de l'urbanisation n'est pas suffisamment souligné. - Pays très froids : les deux cas sont spécifiques et fort différents : problèmes d'infrastructure (fusion du permafrost notamment) pour le Canada, impacts sur les troupeaux de la succession de sécheresses d'été et d'hivers froid pour la Mongolie. - Vulnérabilité aux épidémies quand le système de santé est déficient. - Cités des deltas : plusieurs villes sont citées dont la Nouvelle Orléans mais il n'y a pas d'exemple véritable de réponse en raison de la diversité des cas et peut-être aussi parce que l'exemple des Etats-Unis avec Katrina n'est pas probant. Curieusement la subsidence et le risque cyclonique sont cités alors qu'il n'est pas fait état de l'élévation du niveau marin. La discussion entre « soft defense » et « hard defense » est réelle mais quand on a dit cela , et parlé de stratégie, toute la recherche reste à faire. Y a-t-il des cas où il faudrait évacuer ? Bref un problème majeur pour le monde et balbutiement des réponses. - Petits Etats insulaires : une problématique sans cas de solution. - Transfert : le rapport ne donne que des pistes (microcrédits, index de comparaison) et reconnaît qu'elles ne sont manifestement pas à la hauteur. Effectivement. - Education, préparation, sensibilisation : des exemples mais globalement mêmes doutes sur l'efficacité des applications du cadre de Hyogo. - Gouvernance : idem, toujours par référence au cadre de Hyogo : il n'y a pas de case study de bonne gouvernance en général (on en a indiqué face à certains aléas ou certaines vulnérabilités). (BOURRELIER, PAUL-HENRI, AFPCN)	Thank you for your comments – my French is not very good – but I think you requested more examples - in May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – we believe our final choice has been the most useful one for our colleagues in the other chapters1-8 and we have been limited in space and have been reduced to only have mostly single examples in each case study
37	9	0	0	0	0	The case studies seem well chosen and we appreciate the range and depth of the literature synthesis. 2. From a policy maker perspective, it does seem a little difficult to get a good handle on the key policy points. One striking impression is that the length and sheer size of the report makes it perhaps a little unwieldy when it comes to picking out key points. 3. We would recommend moving the section “synthesis of lessons identified” to the front of the chapter, expanding it to make it easier to grasp the implications of the findings: for example, has it suggested key lines of a systematic enquiry for research? 4. Since this chapter is long, an executive summary at the start might be beneficial to capture the points not within the “synthesis of lessons identified”, if it is felt there are any 5. This chapter is only referenced in one paragraph of the summary for policymakers. This may mean that people miss important lessons, perhaps this would place this chapter at lower priority if a policy maker uses the summary for policymakers as a guide to what chapters to focus on. Is it worth reviewing the relevance of the case studies and key lessons from them to the summary for policymakers? 6. Is there a possibility of creating a case study data bank as a viable resource in parallel with this report? As it stands this chapter is difficult to manage and search. This set of case studies could be a really useful resource if it were more malleable from a policy user perspective. A way to search and a way to find what you need more quickly would be useful. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	1 - Thank you; 2 - Addressed in the structure of each case study as lessons identified; 3 - Rather than a synthesis at the front of the chapter we have added a matrix which identifies the points considered in each case study; 4 - Addressed – an executive summary is included; 5 - Thank you – we have been working closely with the SPM and we consider that this is now addressed; 6 - the idea of a case study bank is interesting – we addressed this in the Synthesis by adding a developing research tool for this purpose
38	9	0	0	0	0	A few examples of 'integrated' case studies would be useful. For example: Hall JW, Dawson RJ, Walsh CL, Barker T, Barr SL, Batty M, Bristow AL, Burton A, Carney S, Dagoumas A, Evans, S, Ford AC, Glenis V, Goodess CG, Harpham C, Harwatt H, Kilsby C, Köhler J, Jones P, Manning L, McCarthy M, Sanderson M, Tight MR, Timms PM, Zanni AM. (2009). Engineering Cities: How can cities grow whilst reducing emissions and vulnerability? Newcastle University, October, 2009. (ISBN 978-0-7017-0225-0) [http://www.ncl.ac.uk/ceser/downloads/2009/tyndallcitiesreport.pdf] or City of New York (2007) sets out the research, whilst the GLA's adaptation plan implements policy etc (http://www.london.gov.uk/climatechange/strategy), PlanYC: A greener, greater New York, City of New York (http://www.nyc.gov/html/planyc2030/html/downloads/the-plan.shtml, link verified 18th January 2011); or Golder Associates (2010) eThekwini Municipality Integrated Assessment Tool for Climate Change, Golder Associates Report 10290-9743-13. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Thank you - In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case study. A synthesis of lessons is included as well as helpful Matrix that addressed how the case studies consider lessons identified. In addition, a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed. However there is a space constraint for this chapter and we are only allowed 14 case studies and these do not fit with the references suggested here

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
39	9	0	0	0	0	This chapter seems particularly disjointed, and has more general grammatical errors than any other section, which at times make it difficult to understand. This is particularly the case in 9.2.5. More time needs to be taken checking and clarifying these sections. The whole chapter would benefit from greater inclusion of points common to the findings in all case studies. Although this is attempted in the introduction, there is much more pertinent information that could be added, or what exists could be presented more clearly. For example lessons identified and concluding remarks from all sections could be concatenated to provide a strong case for managing risk from a development planning perspective, and to elucidate further the importance of vulnerability and the focus needed on vulnerable groups. This is particularly the case for the health impacts which emerge from all findings. The interlinkage between extreme events, for example that flood risk can also relate directly to drought risk needs to be highlighted up front, as this too is important in terms of focussing action in vulnerable areas with history of severe events in both categories. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Addressed – Chapter 9 has addressed these comments by: 1 - In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case studies best representing this requirement by Chapters 1-8; 2 - A synthesis of lessons is included as well as helpful Matrix that addressed how the case studies consider lessons identified; 3 - In addition, a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed.
40	9	0	0	0	0	The Introduction to Case Study 9.2.6, and the first half of the Case Study (the part focused on the Canadian North) are weak. They do not draw sufficiently on the available primary literature, relying instead on a very few government reports (and one Powerpoint presentation) rather than the primary literature sources contained within those reports. This section of the case study on Arctic Canada does not relate well to the subject of this report (climate extremes, adaptation to extremes and disaster risk management); rather, it discusses infrastructure impacts in the Canadian North in the context of adaptation more generally (an extremely important issue that will be addressed extensively in the AR5). The emphasis of this case study should be shifted towards discussing what extreme events and disasters are expected in the Canadian Arctic that might impact on infrastructure (if the focus is to remain on infrastructure). For the most part permafrost thaw related to climate change is a slow onset event, whereas thaw related to human disturbance can be quite rapid. If there is literature relating the former to disasters in Arctic Canada it should be cited. (CANADA)	Addressed
41	9	0	0	0	0	The case study on risk transfer about the role of insurance and other economic approach to risk sharing is useful for those reader who might be interested to further information on these aspects of integrated risk management. One concern might be about redundancies or inconsistencies on this topic between the report itself, FAQs and this case study. This important concern is also linked to the unprecise scope of the report; obviously focusing on developing countries, but intending to provide universal statements. To that extent, the existing situation and characteristics in developed countries, is not reflected with enough care to meet with universality. (NUSSBAUM, Roland, Mission Risques Naturels)	Addressed – Chapter 9 has addressed these comments by: 1 - In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case studies best representing this requirement by Chapters 1-8; 2 - A synthesis of lessons is included as well as helpful Matrix that addressed how the case studies consider lessons identified; 3 - In addition, a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed.
42	9	0	0	0	0	This chapter on case studies appears overall quite weak. With some sections, like the drought one 9.2.3 need more work and should draw on wider evidence and examples. Lessons should draw on case examples and be clearer. (Nightingale, Katherine, Christian Aid)	Addressed – Chapter 9 has addressed these comments by: 1 - In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case studies best representing this requirement by Chapters 1-8; 2 - A synthesis of lessons is included as well as helpful Matrix that addressed how the case studies consider lessons identified; 3 - In addition, a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed.
43	9	0	0	0	0	The table of contents for this chapter (or a separate table) should list the actual case studies (e.g. place and year/name of event) rather than simply the type of climatic event. The introduction should explain the basis of the cases selected. Even if the basis is that the authors picked examples they knew most about, the readers should be told. Otherwise, a reader is left wondering why (for example) there is no discussion of the particular extreme event with which the reader has familiarity. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Thank you - addressed by re- titling the case studies where appropriate with place and date
44	9	0	0	0	0	Additional efforts should be made for a logical ordering of the sections, perhaps with some grouping or segues between the sections. The sections each need to be useful to someone who picks up with a given section, but they also should consider those who read the chapter from beginning to end. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed – Chapter 9 has addressed these comments by: 1 - In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case studies best representing this requirement by Chapters 1-8; 2 - A synthesis of lessons is included as well as helpful Matrix that addressed how the case studies consider lessons identified; 3 - In addition, a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
45	9	0	0	0	0	Most of the subsections have ineffective introductions that fail to explain what the case study will talk about, and why a reader from outside the region discussed would find the information useful. If a particular case study is used elsewhere in the report, that should be evident from the introduction. If a particular case study is not used elsewhere, then either it should be cut from the report or an effort is necessary to integrate it into the other chapters. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed – Chapter 9 has addressed these comments by: 1 - In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case studies best representing this requirement by Chapters 1-8; 2 - A synthesis of lessons is included as well as helpful Matrix that addressed how the case studies consider lessons identified; 3 - In addition, a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed.
46	9	0	0	0	0	The subsections entitled "concluding remarks" could be folded into the introductions in several cases, and simply cut in other cases. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed – Chapter 9 has addressed these comments by using a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed.
47	9	0	0	0	0	The case studies would benefit from a more uniform structure to create a pattern that will help readers. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed – Chapter 9 has addressed these comments by using a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed.
48	9	0	0	0	0	Stronger introductions to each case could explain why the examples within sections relate to that case study and what the section as a whole illustrates. Some choices do not seem to relate as clearly, such as including Ethiopia in the small island developing states section. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed – Chapter 9 has addressed these comments by: in May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case studies best representing this requirement by Chapters 1-8 – redundancy has been excluded by this means
49	9	0	0	0	0	Need to lay connect this chapter more cleanly with the elements laid out in chapters 1 and 8. Perhaps a summary table could be developed to illustrate how each of the cases illustrate one or more of the principles/elements introduced in these earlier chapters. The cases themselves break out into three emphases hazard-oriented (.1 - .7), adaptive capacity-oriented (.8 and.9), and instruments of risk management (.10-.13) so the whole flow is a little difficult to follow. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed – 1 - links to chapters 1-6 (not 7) and 8 have been achieved by working further with colleagues from these chapters; 2 - A matrix has been added to provide the summary table requested by this comment; 3 - in May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case studies best representing this requirement by Chapters 1-8 – redundancy has been excluded by this means
50	9	0	0	0	0	If appropriate consider to have an Executive Summary in this chapter as well drawing on the information from the case studies. (NORWAY)	Addressed- executive summary now added
51	9	0	0	0	0	Throughout the chapter, there are subsections with italicized or underlined titles that are not numbered. Per the SREX style guide, these subheadings need to be numbered. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
52	9	0	0	0	0	Throughout the chapter, where trends in extreme weather or climate events or in hazards are described, the descriptions in this chapter need to consider and cite relevant assessment findings and sections in chapter 3. Chapter 3's assessments assume several forms that should not be conflated here: some projections of trends in extreme events or hazards are made with high confidence (and with assigned likelihoods); in a few cases, projections of no change are made with high confidence (and with assigned likelihoods); and some projections cannot be made with confidence, so trends cannot be assumed in one direction or another. Chapter 9 case studies can consider extreme events and resulting impacts that fall into any of these categories, but their discussions should be clearly consistent with the state of understanding for the relevant extreme events, as assessed and presented in chapter 3. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – close cross working between Chapter 9 and 3 has achieved this
53	9	0	0	0	0	Throughout this chapter, careful attention is needed to ensure that each case study tells a cogent story. Some of the case studies include a loosely connected set of examples that do not form a coherent whole. The scope and purpose of each case study needs to be carefully considered and clarified where appropriate. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case study of drought to be only on Syria for example. This has facilitated much closer working with Chapter 3 and allowed the opportunity to reflect the comment here more effectively. . In addition, a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed
54	9	0	0	0	0	Cross-chapter Consistency: Disaster Risk Management v. Disaster Risk Reduction. It should be ensured that usage of the terms disaster risk management and disaster risk reduction, throughout this chapter, is consistent with the definitions provided in the glossary and described in chapter 1 and with the usage in other chapters of the SREX. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
55	9	0	0	0	0	Please do not use footnotes if they only provide references. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
56	9	1	45	0	0	Section 9.1: This introduction should much more explicitly address what will be discussed in the individual case studies that follow. It should not only highlight the usefulness of Case Studies per se, but also provide the framing for what is to come, provide the reasoning behind the selection of these particular 13 Case Studies (why those examples, but not others), explain why it is useful to combine these 13 particular Case Studies as part of the SREX. More concrete, we could see the introduction to be extended to include text similar to what is provided in Editorials to Special Issues of journal publications, where one or more Editors lay out what this special issue is all about. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case study of drought to be only on Syria for example.. In addition, a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed. And the introduction in 9.1 explains why the case studies were chosen and with the matrix now included in 9.1 this links to the SPM messages for each case study.
57	9	1	45	0	0	Section 9.1. The introduction should carefully ensure that the case studies are presented as logically as possible. The current description does not clearly present the suite of case studies included in the chapter and does not clearly provide a rationale for their ordering. The order in which the case studies are introduced should reflect the order in which the case studies appear in the chapter. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the chapter to include a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine and the introduction in 9.1 explains why the case studies were chosen and with the new matrix now included in 9.1 this links to the SPM messages for each case study
58	9	1	47	1	47	It seems that "risks" would be a better term here than "threats." (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
59	9	1	47	2	42	We think this is a very useful chapter. However, the reason for including this chapter may be described better. It could provide a background for fact sheets, to exemplify the findings in the previous chapters. As such this could be made clear by cross-referencing. As background for fact sheets, we think the case studies should be more illustrated with figures and images, to make it possible for the reader to fully understand the consequences and reality behind all figures and statistics in the rest of the report. (NORWAY)	Addressed – 1 - In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on choice of case studies to reflect the need to show the best evidence for DRR and DRM – the review recommended to focus on the case studies required by Chapters 1-8; 2 - In addition, a common structure for these case studies for chapter nine was also been agreed; 3 - The case studies are now cross referenced with the other chapters; 4 - A synthesis of lessons is included as well as a Matrix that addressed how the case studies consider lessons identified; 5 - It was agreed that photographs would not be added; 6 - Where possible figures and tables have been added
60	9	1	48	1	48	..extreme WEATHER and climate events.....' (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
61	9	1	50	0	0	I think that the case studies represent the following categories of extreme events (instead of "examing specific extreme events are"), as was defined in chapter 3. (GREECE)	Addressed - deleted
62	9	1	50	1	53	The introduction should list all of the included case studies. It leaves out insurance, disaster risk reduction education, legislation, early warning systems, small island developing states, and coastal mega-cities. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed – now included
63	9	1	51	1	53	In this sentence, the examples are framed as representing "complex combinations" of hazards with resulting "complex" impacts. It would be preferable to avoid using "complex" for "complex combinations" and then to present the list of representative case studies as exemplifying complex impacts and disasters--instead of using "complex" in all locations as is currently done. Additionally, it would be preferable to describe "complex impacts of heat and wildfire" or "complex disasters resulting from heat and wildfire" as opposed to the more ambiguous description of "complex hot situations." (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
64	9	1	53	2	2	The second half of this sentence could be interpreted as potentially prescriptive. It would be preferable to reword the sentence to indicate that early warning systems are considered in a case study. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
65	9	2	4	2	7	It is not at all clear what is meant by "indicator of the resources needed for future disaster risk reduction." Presumably, "this selection" refers to the set of case studies presented in the chapter, but it is not clear why this set should refer only to future disaster risk reduction and not also to climate change adaptation. Additionally, given that the phrasing of the sentence on lines 4 and 5 could be interpreted as potentially prescriptive, it would be preferable to more neutrally indicate how the case studies inform the key findings of other chapters, especially as relates to DRR and CCA in the future. The three sentences here could be revised to indicate more clearly how the case studies provide unifying examples for emergent themes in the report, as well as providing lessons in and of themselves. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
66	9	2	10	2	10	Typo in citation: For Flyjberg (2000), the author's name is spelled differently in the chapter text, as compared to the case study's reference list. Please ensure correct spelling of the author's name in both the text and the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – spelling corected
67	9	2	12	2	12	"...including the 2007 WORKING GROUP II report (Parry et al. 2007) (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – added
68	9	2	12	2	12	This information is repeated elsewhere. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
69	9	2	19	2	19	The author team should clarify what is meant by "need[ing] to make the most of each single case." A rewording to make this bullet syntactically parallel to the first two bullets could make the point more clearly for the reader. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - reworded
70	9	2	19	2	19	What about climate change adaptation? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - reworded

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
71	9	2	23	2	24	rewording suggested: replace "are invaluable in evaluating ..." with "can be useful in evaluating" (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Thank you for your suggestion - addressed
72	9	2	27	0	0	regional is ambiguous and while used here in a sub-national context, it has been used elsewhere in the report in a globally regional connotation. To avoid this possible confusion here, and as below regarding regional food production, it may be better to use an expression like "sub-national". In Latin America I believe the term "territorial" is used for similar sub-national designation. (Jezele Terry, University of Pittsburgh)	Addressed - deleted
73	9	2	32	2	32	Resilience is a determinant of impacts, not of intensity of an extreme weather event. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
74	9	2	39	2	42	These generalizations are not supported by the previous text. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
75	9	2	40	2	42	Rewording needed: to "encourage more solutions" is not in the mandate of a Chapter of an IPCC report -- IPCC reports have to be policy relevant, but not policy prescriptive. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
76	9	3	11	3	12	For UNISDR (2008): The link provided for this reference does not link directly to the document cited. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - corrected
77	9	3	17	0	0	In this chapter case studies, if possible it is better to add some cases of drought, floods, and cold events in China in recent years. (Chen, Xing, Nanjing University)	Thank you for this – but we do not have the space to add these
78	9	3	23	3	36	As a part of China, Taiwan must be cited as "Taiwan province of China" . (CHINA)	The introduction section of this case study is revised and this comment is no longer relevant.
79	9	3	25	3	36	The extended description of Typhoon Morakot and its impacts seems useful but out of place in this introductory paragraph to the case study. The author team should consider moving this detailed example to a subsection of the case study, as for other cyclones considered, or greatly abbreviating its presentation in the introduction. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The introduction section of this case study is revised and this comment is no longer relevant.
80	9	3	28	3	28	I suggest using km/hr consistently instead of m/sec, perhaps with kt in parentheses occasionally, but not habitually. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Done.
81	9	3	31	3	32	The precipitation level cited from Lin et al. (2011), 3060 mm, appears to be incorrect and should be checked and corrected. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The introduction section of this case study is revised and this comment is no longer relevant.
82	9	3	36	3	36	Please provide the source(s) for these numbers. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The introduction section of this case study is revised and this comment is no longer relevant.
83	9	3	38	3	43	The potential effects of changes in SSTs should be also noted here. (GREECE)	The effect of SST on frequency of tropical cyclones is discussed in Chapter 3 (Section 3.4.4) and is now briefly mentioned in the case study.
84	9	3	38	3	43	Where calibrated uncertainty language is used in this paragraph, the terms should be italicized (e.g., "low confidence," "medium confidence," and "likely"). Additionally, the specific relevant section and table in chapter 3 should be cited (e.g., 3.4.4 and Table 3.1) instead of a general citation for the chapter. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Done.
85	9	3	38	3	43	Reference(s) needed. Please use climate change not greenhouse warming. (IPCC WGII TSU)	See response to Comment 84 above.
86	9	3	41	0	0	Should replace "there is medium confidence" with "it is likely that" to correspond with Chapter 3 Executive Summary (Nicholls, Neville, Monash University, School of Geography & Environmental Science)	Done.
87	9	3	46	3	48	Isn't adaptation happening here in the context of disaster risk reduction, not the other way around? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Agree. This is one of the key messages of this case study.
88	9	4	5	4	5	A windspeed of 90-120km/hr does not seem "severe" to this reviewer from the US East Coast, because it would not be a hurricane. I suggest a table showing various classifications of storm severity, including Saffir-Simpson, with speeds in both kt and km/hr. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The sentence referring to a windspeed of 90-120km/hr has been removed and a brief explanation of the Saffir-Simpson categories is now provided. A table showing classifications of storm severity, including Saffir-Simpson, would fit better in Chapter 3.
89	9	4	8	4	8	extreme events' - do you mean these were extreme weather events in a physical statistical sense (ie, the chapter 3 definition), or do you rather mean they were events that had potential for extreme impacts? If you can cite a references that illustrates that Bhola and Gorky were particularly severe then the current wording is OK. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	There were extreme events both in a physical statistical sense and in terms of their impacts (except for Hurricane Stan, which was extreme only in terms of its impact).
90	9	4	21	0	0	The acronym DRR (first time appearing in the text here) should be explicitly referred here and not only on page 81 line 51. (GREECE)	Done.
91	9	4	21	4	21	Please use disaster risk management. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Done.
92	9	4	39	4	45	Another difference between 1970, 1991 and 2007 has been in the observation of tropical cyclones by satellite, and the capabilities of global numerical weather systems to predict the tracks. Numerical guidance from global centres provided skilful forecasts of the track of Sidr (and that of Nargis). Were these used as part of the warning process? If so, this should be acknowledged. If not, it would be appropriate to discuss why. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	The improvements in forecasting and early warning of tropical cyclones cited in the case study are largely due to the enhanced capabilities in the observation of tropical cyclones by satellite, and the capabilities of global numerical weather systems to predict the tracks. The page length limitations do not allow the authors to go into more detail on these specific issues.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
93	9	4	47	4	47	A table listing effective adaptation/drr measures would be very helpful. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Effective adaptation / DRR measures vary greatly from country to country. Except for the obvious early warning and timely evacuation, it is difficult to make general recommendations.
94	9	4	50	4	50	Where have you introduced the terms 'hard' and 'soft measures'? Please briefly define these or refer to a corresponding chapter where further explanation is found. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The sentence including the expressions 'hard' and 'soft' measures has been deleted.
95	9	4	50	4	50	The term "hard and soft measures" used here should be defined. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The sentence including the expressions 'hard' and 'soft' measures has been deleted.
96	9	4	51	4	52	"has reduced the impact of Sidr significantly" -- Please provide the source of this statement. How much is "significantly" and does it carry a statistical meaning? If not replace by, e.g., "substantially". (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Wording has been revised.
97	9	5	4	5	5	It would be helpful to make clear the time frame and spatial extent of coastal reforestation as an intervention and whether this reforestation contributed to reducing the impacts of Sidr's landfall. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Done.
98	9	5	19	5	23	Please check Chapter 3. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment no longer relevant.
99	9	5	21	5	22	Please include a reference to Chapter 3 of SREX within this citation, and also cite a specific IPCC 2007 chapter. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment no longer relevant.
100	9	5	22	5	23	"This means that the Government of Bangladesh should pay even more attention to...." -- Please avoid policy prescriptive statements, consider rewording (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment no longer relevant.
101	9	5	22	5	23	This sentence could be interpreted as prescriptive and must be reworded. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment no longer relevant.
102	9	5	23	5	23	"This means that the government of Bangladesh should pay even more attention to proactive risk reduction measures..." Please provide examples of these measures. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Comment no longer relevant.
103	9	5	28	0	0	It could be worth also mentioning the TC Gonu in June 2007 which strongly impacted Oman. Krishna K.M. (2009) Intensifying tropical cyclones over the North Indian Ocean during summer monsoon—Global warming, Global and Planetary Change, 65, 12–16. (International Petroleum Industry Environmental Conservation Association (IPIECA))	The tropical cyclone Gonu is indeed a very interesting event, and so are several other tropical cyclones in the past 2 decades. However, because of page length limitations, the authors of this case study decided to focus on a limited number of comparative case studies.
104	9	5	28	5	28	The citation for Reale et al. (2009) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Done.
105	9	5	29	5	29	The term "mortality risk" should be clarified. If "mortality" is intended, it would be preferable to use that term instead; otherwise, "mortality risk" should be more explicitly defined. Additionally, the percentages provided for cyclone occurrence and mortality risk presumably pertain to a specific time period, which should be presented. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The term "mortality risk" is now replaced with "mortality".
106	9	5	32	5	37	Here we introduce one paper related with the tropical cyclone Nargis. Ref. Yokoi, S., and Y. N. Takayabu, 2010: Environmental and external factors in the genesis of tropical cyclone Nargis in April 2008 over the Bay of Bengal. J. Meteor. Soc. Japan. 88, 425-435. (Takayabu, Izuru, Meteorological Research Institute)	This reference is now cited in the case study.
107	9	5	39	0	0	Tables 9.1 and 9.3: Surely it is sensible to add this information for Nargis into Table 9.1 The same information for Cyclones Stan and Wilma should also be included. This way, a reader can quickly compare these vital statistics across all cyclones discussed in this case study. Would also be good to add another column which gives the region of interest for each cyclone. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Done.
108	9	5	42	5	47	Most of this paragraph is repeated earlier. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment no longer relevant.
109	9	5	43	5	47	It should be clarified if the Sunderban mangroves and coastal forests were part of the reforestation program described in the first sentence here. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Clarified as much as possible.
110	9	5	52	5	52	"the path of the storm could not have been worse" - this is an important statement - can you expand and explain why this was the case. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	This sentence is now deleted. Comment no longer relevant.
111	9	5	53	5	54	This sentence states that "the intensity of Nargis" was the most important condition in determining the outcome (disaster) of Nargis, but the subsequent discussion suggests that it was, more specifically, "the underestimation of the intensity of Nargis" that was the largest factor in the resulting outcome. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This section is revised. Comment no longer relevant.
112	9	5	54	5	54	Again, there was warning of the track of the cyclone provided by global forecasting centres, even if they did not provide an explicit forecast of the associated storm surge. Some discussion of this might be appropriate. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Point noted. Please provide a reference that the authors could use for discussing this issue.
113	9	6	3	6	4	Is it relevant to this discussion that the newspaper is a "government-owned newspaper and published by the Ministry of information"? If so, please explain why. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Sentence about the newspaper is now modified.
114	9	6	4	6	4	"suggesting that the media underestimated the potential impact of the threat" -- don't understand what you are now trying to convey. Above it is highlighted that the media belongs to the Government, but now the media is blamed for issuing the official Myanmar forecast on page 15 only.... who exactly is now held responsible? What about scientists? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Text for this section is modified. Comment is no longer relevant.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
115	9	6	24	6	24	detailed information on diameter and wind speeds missing for Stan. Please add to be consistent with information available for Wilma. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Wording has been revised. The information provided for Stan and Wilma are now comparable.
116	9	6	24	6	24	This meteorological information should be provided for both hurricanes. It would also help to specify the Saffir-Simpson category. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Done.
117	9	6	31	6	31	The citation for Oswald Spring (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Done.
118	9	6	41	6	42	It would be helpful to clarify how "safer places" are distinct from "shelters" in this sentence. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Wording has been revised.
119	9	6	48	6	48	Why so late? Was Cancun a high priority for Mexico given tourist industry? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Yes.
120	9	7	2	7	4	suggest to avoid spelling out names of individuals, it's enough to mention the government agency involved -- names of individuals no relevant information and privacy should be protected. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Text for this section is modified.
121	9	7	2	7	4	It seems that the identification of a specific person and use of the phrase "had to admit" may editorialize here more than is appropriate. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text for this section is modified.
122	9	7	6	7	13	Need to provide references in support of the statements made in this paragraph. For example it's necessary to provide source(s) for the statement that "Federal attention appears to have been focused on..". Blaming governments (in this case) without providing a solid scientific basis is inappropriate for any scientific assessment report. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Wording has been revised.
123	9	7	10	7	11	It is stated here that the population did not have insurance "due to their high social vulnerability." It seems that vulnerability can result from lack of insurance, and both vulnerability and lack of insurance are correlated with other social factors. However, it is not clear that high social vulnerability "causes" a lack of insurance as is implied here. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text for this section is modified.
124	9	7	11	7	11	..due to..' - Did they not have insurance because of their social vulnerability (as the current wording suggests), or do you mean that not having any form of insurance contributed to, or added to their high social vulnerability? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Wording has been revised.
125	9	7	11	7	11	Lack of insurance is not due to social vulnerability. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Wording has been revised.
126	9	7	23	7	25	This sentence goes beyond the scope of the discussed examples, which describe disaster risk management that did not consider climate-change-related trends in hazards. The sentence here without further citations thus overly generalizes, beyond the evidence provided in the case study. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Wording has been revised.
127	9	7	30	7	33	These sentences go beyond the scope of the discussed examples, which describe disaster risk management that did not consider climate-change-related trends in hazards or incorporate climate change adaptation. The sentences here without further citations thus overly generalize beyond the evidence provided in the case study. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Wording has been revised.
128	9	7	49	7	49	Please reconsider the usage of the CIA factbook 2009 as a SREX reference. Is there an alternative source for this information? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	CIA factbook 2009 is no longer cited in the case study.
129	9	7	51	7	52	For EM-DAT (2010): This listed source is not available at the link provided. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	URL revised.
130	9	8	29	8	31	For Lin et al. (2011): The link provided for this reference does not link directly to the document cited. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Lin et al. (2011) is no longer cited in this case study.
131	9	9	7	9	8	For UNDP (2004): The link provided for this reference does not link directly to the document cited. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	URL deleted.
132	9	9	16	0	0	Case Study 9.2.2: Please note that Chapter 4 (Box 4-3) have material that duplicates what you have in this case study. Please discuss with Chapter 4 to ensure this redundancy is removed, and ensure that anything useful from Box 4-3 is added to your case study here. We feel that Chapter 9 is the most suitable home for this material (not to mention the fact that Chapter 4 is critically over-length). Please also consider extending this case study to cover the 2010 heatwave - see for example, 'The Hot Summer of 2010: Redrawing the Temperature Record Map of Europe' (Barriopedro et al. 2011, Science DOI: 10.1126/science.1201224) (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	In discussion with Chapter 4
133	9	9	16	0	0	Case study 9.2.2. The terms used to describe heat-related hazards should be considered throughout this case study. It seems preferable to refer to "heat hazards" or "heat-related extreme events," instead of "extreme heat hazards," "extreme heat," or "extreme hazards," to maximize consistency with the SREX glossary and terminology used in other chapters. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
134	9	9	16	0	0	Case study 9.2.2. This case study includes too much of the information in Chapter 4. Most of the first two pages can be condensed into a concise summary, as has been done with other case studies, and then refer the reader to the relevant detail in Chapter 4 and other chapters. (IPCC WGII TSU)	In discussion with Chapter 4

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
135	9	9	16	13	21	This case study makes little if any mention of the poor air quality that can accompany urban heatwaves. High ozone levels were a significant factor in the mortality associated with the 2003 European heatwave, and there are emission-control measures that can be taken to reduce atmospheric pollution levels when they become a serious threat. Discussion of this merits inclusion in this case study. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	addressed
136	9	9	16	16	29	This case study should mention the impact of shrinking and swelling of clays during the 2003 heat wave in France. As an input document to this, a report for the French Ministry of Environment investigated the potential costs induced by more frequent heat waves in the context of climate change. PLAT E., VINCENT M. et LENOTRE N. (BRGM), PEINTURIER C., POUPAT B. et DORELON P. (MEEDDM/CGDD), CHASSAGNEUX P. (METEO-FRANCE), KAZMIERCZAK J.B. (INERIS), SALAGNAC J.L. (CSTB), GERIN S., NUSSBAUM R. et CHEMITTE J. (MRN), 2008, Estimation des coûts du changement climatique liés à l'aléa retrait-gonflement – Contribution au rapport final du Groupe de Travail Risques Naturels, Assurances et Changement Climatique. BRGM/RP-56771-FR, 62 p., 28 ill. (MODARESSI, HORMOZ, BRGM)	NOT ADDRESSED – not sufficient space to address in this short case study.
137	9	9	18	13	21	The results from the German klimazwei project can be integrated in this chapter. The outputs represent applicable case studies for adapting urban structures to climate change (GERMANY)	Noted.
138	9	9	18	13	21	The section needs to more carefully address the difference between the entire distribution becoming warmer, and relative extremes becoming more frequent. The experience in Paris provides some support for the idea that warmer conditions by themselves will not increase heat mortality or the need for more adaptation. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	NOT ADDRESSED – not sufficient space to address in this short case study.
139	9	9	20	9	21	Typo in citation: For Kovats et al. (2008), only two authors are listed in the case study's reference list. Please ensure the citation is correct and harmonize the reference in both locations (chapter text and reference list). (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
140	9	9	20	9	32	A few lines should be added referring to the association of heat waves with severe air pollution events, e.g. dust coming from natural sources and potential impacts on climate (radiation, CCN, precipitation) as well as health impacts etc. (GREECE)	Addressed
141	9	9	20	9	32	The terms used to describe heat-related hazards should be considered throughout this paragraph. It seems preferable to refer to "heat hazards" or "heat-related extreme events," instead of "extreme heat hazards," "extreme heat," or "extreme hazards," to maximize consistency with the SREX glossary and terminology used in other chapters. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
142	9	9	23	9	23	Can the reference to BBC be replace with something more robust? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
143	9	9	24	0	0	Please add the reference Ordóñez, C., N. Elguindi, O. Stein, V. Huijnen, J. Flemming, A. Inness, H. Flentje, E. Katragkou, P. Moinat, V-H. Peuch, A. Segers, V. Thouret, G. Athier, M. van Weele, C. S. Zerefos, J-P. Cammas, M. G. Schultz, "Global model simulations of air pollution during the 2003 European heat wave", Atmos. Chem. Phys., 10, 789–815, 2010. (Zerefos, Christos, Academy of Athens)	Air pollution is addressed but the specific paper not included as insufficient space in this short case study.
144	9	9	24	9	25	The calibrated uncertainty language used here ("very likely") should be italicized, and specific relevant sections (3.3.1 and Table 3.1) should be cited, in place of the general reference to chapter 3. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
145	9	9	25	9	25	The reference to chapter 3 is too vague for such a fundamental specific assertion. Moreover, one needs to be clear here--as elsewhere--whether "more extreme" is relative to the future mean or the existing mean condition. Policy intervention in the future would depend on the frequency of extreme temperatures relative to the future norm--but Chapter 3 does not show such extremes to be "very likely" as asserted here. It is very likely that the future will provide more extreme temperatures relative to today's norm. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	In discussion with all Chapters 1-8 to confirm how to reference each chapter's links
146	9	9	26	9	28	Risk as described here is also a function of exposure, and exposure should thus be mentioned in addition to "hazard severity and population vulnerability." Similarly, whether hazards translate into extreme impacts is also a function of exposure. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
147	9	9	35	9	35	It seems preferable, given the discussion in this section, to use the word "physiological" as opposed to "biological" in the title. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
148	9	9	45	9	45	"more likely to be isolated" -- is this "likely" the result of a scientific assessment of uncertainty or just a general statement of knowledge? Please clarify: if the former --> italics; if the latter, change wording. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
149	9	9	45	9	45	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
150	9	9	46	9	46	The citation for Naughton (2002) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
151	9	9	53	0	0	more frequently should be "frequently" (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Addressed

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
152	9	10	2	0	0	The part on the working conditions of the workers is not clear : how are they more vulnerable ? (FRANCE)	Addressed
153	9	10	2	10	3	It would be helpful to clarify what is meant here by "workers"--what kinds of workers, in what contexts? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
154	9	10	8	10	8	What does this sentence mean? What circumstances? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
155	9	10	12	10	15	In addition, there are effects on the scale of a street canyon, e.g. building facades absorbing solar radiation may influence locally the thermal balance within a street canyon altering the air circulation (e.g. Louka et al., 2002 and Santamouris et al., 1999 - see full references below if wished to be used**). References: 1) Louka, P., G. Vachon, J-F. Sini, P.G. Mestayer, J-M. Rosant (2002), Thermal Effects on the Airflow in a Street Canyon - Nantes '99 Experimental Results and Model Simulation. Water, Air and Soil Pollution: Focus, 2, Issue 5-6, 351-364. 2) Santamouris, M., N. Papanikolaou, I. Koronakis, I. Livada, D. Assimakopoulos (1999), Thermal and airflow characteristics in a deep pedestrian canyon, under hot weather conditions. Atmospheric Environment 33, 4503-4521. (GREECE)	Addressed and references quoted – thank you
156	9	10	12	10	15	The logical connections among the examples presented in the sentence need to be considered and clarified--for example, it seems that "local heat production" does not affect the "surface reflectivity," etc. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
157	9	10	15	10	15	add reference to Chapter 3 when discussing physical science basis of the urban heat island effect (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – chapter 3 considered this but do not consider they need to link to this
158	9	10	25	10	25	Some work? Please replace with wording like 'several studies' (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
159	9	10	25	10	25	Typo in citation: For Konopacki et al. (2001), only two authors are listed in the case study's reference list. Please ensure the citation is correct and harmonize the reference in both locations (chapter text and reference list). (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
160	9	10	27	10	31	Reference(s) needed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
161	9	10	30	10	30	Do you mean to use 'likely' here as a formal calibrated IPCC likelihood term? If not, please replace with an alternative word. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
162	9	10	30	10	30	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. Additionally, it would be helpful to clarify what is meant by "lower margins" on this line--presumably the difference between maximum capacity and baseline use is intended? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
163	9	10	40	11	5	Could mention in this paragraph that the 2003 European heat wave is one of the few extreme weather events to be statistically linked to anthropogenic climate change. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	We will ask the author to consider this
164	9	10	42	10	42	How do you define 'historical norms'? A citation is needed here. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	We will ask the author to include a reference here
165	9	10	43	0	0	"InVS 2000" should be INVS, 2003 (Incecik, Salahattin/Selahattin, Istanbul Technical University)	Addressed
166	9	10	48	10	48	Not clear where Chapter 3 discuss the death toll and costs relating to the 2003 heatwave - this is not within the scope of their chapter. Do you mean to cite another SREX chapter? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
167	9	10	48	10	48	The citation to chapter 3 seems that it should be removed given the content of the chapter 3 SOD. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
168	9	10	53	10	53	Do you mean to use 'likely' here as a formal calibrated IPCC likelihood term? If not, please replace with an alternative word. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
169	9	10	53	10	53	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
170	9	10	53	10	53	Typo in citation: For Levick (1859), the publication year differs in the case study's reference list. Please determine the correct year for the publication and harmonize the reference in both locations (chapter text and reference list). (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
171	9	11	9	11	9	2003 and 2006 are the wrong way around in this line. (Trewin, Blair, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	Addressed
172	9	11	9	11	9	In the "although" clause of this sentence, the two heatwaves appear to be switched--i.e., the 2006 heatwave lasted a few days longer than the 2003 heatwave. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
173	9	11	9	11	10	Although the 2003 heatwave lasted a few days longer than the 2006 one, it was less intense and did not cover as large a geographical area." This statement seems to suggest that the 2003 heatwave was less intense and did not cover as large an area as the 2006. Is that accurate? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed
174	9	11	13	0	0	I guess that the word "only" is not necessary here. (GREECE)	Addressed
175	9	11	15	11	15	"it has been hypothesized" -- by whom? Provide reference/source. This is needed as further down you state that (page 11, line 52) "there is very limited evidence on the effectiveness...." (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
176	9	11	17	11	23	Maybe, here, there should be a reference on the alarm systems that have been developed in some European countries and are part of METEOALARM activity (a EUMETNET effort) - http://meteoalarm.eu/ . In the framework of this activity, every day weather forecast is associated with a potential risk (e.g. heat wave, flash flood), according to the thresholds that have been set by the different countries based on their climatic values. In this way, different categories of risks/alerts are identified for the different meteorological parameters/conditions (e.g. air temperature, precipitation/storm/snow). (GREECE)	Addressed
177	9	11	37	11	37	The citation for Akbari (2001) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
178	9	11	40	11	44	The last paragraph said that temperatures in 2003 were 35-40 degrees. Now in a paragraph about 2006, we learn that the temperatures in 2003 were 40-44 degrees. It would be better to consolidate all the 2003 information into the paragraph about 2003. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed
179	9	11	42	11	43	The use of "likelihood" in the context of exposure could be more fully elaborated here for the reader, indicating why "likelihood of exposure" is used instead of, for example, simply "exposure." (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
180	9	11	42	11	50	These programs are very similar. Please combine and provide an assessment of key components of early warning systems. (IPCC WGII TSU)	EWS vary – an additional EWS approaches have been added at request of reviewer comment 176 – the CLAs consider the value of sharing different EWS to be helpful
181	9	11	48	11	48	The citation for WHO (2009) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
182	9	11	52	11	52	The use of "limited evidence" here, if intended as a summary of evidence per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, should be italicized. If it was not intended as calibrated language, the author team should consider use of summary terms for evidence and agreement, per the Guidance Note, in this section. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
183	9	11	52	11	53	A reduced impact? Please specify what you mean here and provide reference (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
184	9	11	53	12	1	It would be preferable to more explicitly indicate what the decrease in medical emergency services may be attributable to. The sentence seems to imply that, if the difference cannot be entirely attributed to differences in the heatwaves, it may be partially due to interventions. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
185	9	12	1	12	2	"may have reduced mortality rates by 2.6 lives per day during heat events" -- how useful (and appropriate) is it to quantify such a statement when starting with "may have"? May have is extremely vague ... Or could you translate this into a formal IPCC uncertainty statement (using evidence/agreement - confidence - likelihood)? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
186	9	12	5	12	5	The citation for Cadot (2007) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
187	9	12	7	0	0	No need to say that Philadelphia is in Pennsylvania unless the chapter discusses policies of the state of Pennsylvania, which does not seem to be the case. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed
188	9	12	11	12	11	The clause stating that heat preparedness programs may contribute to vulnerability needs clarification. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed
189	9	12	16	12	16	missing references!!! (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
190	9	12	16	12	16	The missing reference needs to be supplied. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
191	9	12	20	12	20	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
192	9	12	22	12	22	The citation for Semenza (2006) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
193	9	12	26	12	27	This result could reflect one of two things - either there has been an improvement in response to heatwaves or there is a flaw in the model. I don't have ready access to the paper cited, but do note that the 2006 heatwave (compared with 2003) was distinguished by a very long period of hot conditions (and hence very high monthly average temperatures), but never reached the extreme intensity that occurred in 2003. Also, the numbers quoted do not match the 2-8% decline in mortality quoted at page 15 lines 6-7. (Trewin, Blair, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	ADVICE PLEASE we cannot find what Blair is concerned about - no page 15 for example
194	9	12	26	12	39	The location of the paragraph "Communication and Education" is not suitable. This can be replaced with Assessing Heat Mortality starting from line 42 to page 13, line 2. (Incecik, Salahattin/Selahattin, Istanbul Technical University)	Addressed
195	9	12	28	12	39	Missing references from Scott Sheridan. Also, saying preparedness should center around engaging communities can be considered policy prescriptive; please rephrase. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
196	9	12	44	12	54	Please condense and refer to relevant sections in Chapter 4. (IPCC WGII TSU)	In discussion with Chapter 4

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
197	9	12	45	12	45	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
198	9	13	7	13	8	"With climate change, heatwaves are very likely to increase in frequency and severity in many parts of the world (SREX chap 4)." Is it possible to include specific pages within the chapter for readers to more quickly reference? It may also be helpful to supplement this with additional references to other works. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	In discussion with all Chapters 4 to confirm how to reference each chapter's links
199	9	13	7	13	8	This statement should reference specific sections and assessment findings in chapter 3, and the term "very likely" should be italicized since it is calibrated uncertainty language per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed -Chapter 3 have linked to this statement – it is now linked to 3.3.1
200	9	13	7	13	8	Please delete this sentence. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Not addressed – we consider that Chapter 3 support is all that is needed for this comment – please see response to comment 199
201	9	13	7	13	21	The assessment findings presented in this summary section could potentially be characterized by calibrated uncertainty language, especially summary terms for evidence and agreement and levels of confidence, per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties. We encourage the author team to consider assigning such calibrated language to findings here. The degree of certainty in some findings may not be completely clear to the reader and could be clarified with the use of calibrated language, thereby strengthening the clarity of the section overall. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
202	9	13	7	13	21	It would be beneficial to increase the specificity of the lessons presented in these concluding paragraphs. Ideally, they would clearly follow from and synthesize the material presented in the case study. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
203	9	13	8	0	0	"chap. 4" should be "chap. 3" (Nicholls, Neville, Monash University, School of Geography & Environmental Science)	Addressed
204	9	13	8	13	8	You should be citing Chapter 3 here, not chapter 4. Exact citation should be (Chapter 3, Section 3.3.1) (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
205	9	13	8	13	9	The mention here of urban heatwaves in developed, as opposed to developing, countries would benefit from a citation or from further explanation since it goes beyond the assessment provided in earlier sections of the case study. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
206	9	15	37	17	29	Consider adding references and examples of solution to this discussion (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Not fully addressed in lessons identified but is addressed higher up now
207	9	16	32	0	0	Case Study 9.2.3: Please note - The clarity of the English language in this case study needs careful attention in order to avoid confusing the reader. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
208	9	16	32	0	0	This case study on drought is generally poor. Comments below focus on two specific bits, but it would be helpful for more work to be done on the entire case study. (Hillier, Debbie, Oxfam)	Addressed - Comment is correct. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on droughts and recommended to focus on the case study of drought in Syria. In addition, a common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed.
209	9	16	32	0	0	Case study 9.2.3. The examples discussed in this case study should be carefully considered. Currently, the rationale for the selected sample of droughts described is not clear. Ideally the presentation of each example would follow a similar structure so that the reader can easily compare across examples and start to draw conclusions based on the differences that emerge. Additionally, the rationale for the information included in the drought effects section is likewise unclear. The information presented in this section should relate to the preceding section of the case study, as well as to that which follows. Finally, the section on drought management seems oddly abbreviated and focused on one geographic region. In sum, this case study needs reformulation to present a more cogent and perhaps focused story. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - Comment is correct. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on droughts and recommended to focus on the case study of drought in Syria. In addition, a common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed.
210	9	16	32	22	43	The case study on drought is very limited in scope and cursory in treatment. The section on Ethiopia is over-focused on health impacts, and neglects importance sources such as Lautze, Aklilu et al. (2003) Risk and Vulnerability in Ethiopia, report for USAID. The section on drought effects is heavily unbalanced toward the issue of dust storms. Morton and de Haan http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/templates/lead/pdf/e-conf_06-10_drought.pdf is just one source for a wider view of impacts - and already cited in AR4. Benson and Clay in the Willhite volume deal with macro-economic impacts. the section on drought management greatly underestimates the work done under recent World Bank projects, e.g. in Kenya, Ethiopia, Morocco (Morton, John, Natural Resources Institute, University of Greenwich)	Addressed - Comment is correct. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on droughts and recommended to focus on the case study of drought in Syria. In addition, a common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
211	9	16	32	22	43	The drought case study mentions costs of impacts in the USA and effects on the North American Great Plains. Several recently completed research projects highlight the significant effects of droughts in Canada. Over 40 severe droughts have occurred in the Canadian Prairies over the past 200 years. Also 7 out of 11 of the most expensive Canadian disasters have been drought events, with the 2001-2002 drought costing \$5.8 B (CDN) in direct losses (Wheaton et al., 2007, 2008, Etkin, 2010). Several key lessons were learned from the national assessment of the 2001-2002 drought. Several adaptation measures were suggested and used, however many were costly and disruptive. Many adaptations proved insufficient to deal with an intense, large geographic-area and persistent drought, underlying Canada's overall vulnerability to severe drought events. References: Wheaton, E., G. Koshida, B. Bonsal, T. Johnston, W. Richards, and V. Wittrock, 2007. Agricultural Adaptation to the 2001-2002 Drought in Canada. Prepared for the Government of Canada's Climate Change Impact and Adaptation Program, Project A932. Saskatchewan Research Council, Saskatoon, Saskatchewan; Wheaton, E.W., S. Kulshreshtha, V. Wittrock and G. Koshida, 2008. "Dry Times: Hard Lessons from the Canadian Droughts of 2001 and 2002", Canadian Geographer, 52(2):241-262; Etkin, D. (ed.), 2010. Canadians at Risk. Institute for Catastrophic Loss Reduction Technical Report Series No. 48. ICLR, London, Ontario, Canada. Available on-line at: http://www.iclr.org/canadiansatrisk.html (CANADA)	Addressed - Comment is correct – but only drought in Syria is included to give the sharper focus recommended by the reviews. Therefore this comment no longer applies.
212	9	16	36	16	36	This first clause about recorded history needs a citation, or perhaps citations to the beginnings of recorded history from a few different cultures. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed - deleted
213	9	16	36	16	37	The meaning of this second clause is not totally clear, but it seems to be suggesting that the only remarkable thing about the survival of our species is how we dealt with drought. That assertion seems incorrect, and would certainly need several citations. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed - deleted
214	9	16	36	16	37	It would be preferable to delete the word "only" here or perhaps the second half of the case study's first sentence. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed deleted
215	9	16	37	16	37	"considered by many to be" -- who is many? Be specific or delete. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
216	9	16	38	16	38	There must be many more recent references that could be used here -- Hagman 1984 was published 27 years ago! (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted and updated references now included
217	9	16	38	16	41	Something is missing in this sentence. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
218	9	16	49	16	50	do you mean that the 'most significant severe drought WAS in the early 1970s' or do you mean that it 'began' in the early 1970's? From the next paragraph it seems this severe drought lasted 1970-1990. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed- deleted
219	9	16	52	16	52	"...vulnerable to impacts from OTHER extreme events.." (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
220	9	16	52	16	54	It would be helpful to clarify the time frame relevant to the changes in vulnerability and population described--were these changes confined to 1970-90, or did they (or do they) continue to persist? Also, it should be clarified what is meant by "extreme events" on the first line--extreme events other than drought? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
221	9	17	4	17	5	delete "According to the report of" which are spelling out a reference; just provide the reference. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
222	9	17	4	17	6	Is the reference reliable? Are the assumptions realistic? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
223	9	17	8	17	8	THERE ARE divergent views about....' (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
224	9	17	8	17	10	This sentence is unclear. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
225	9	17	12	17	12	What do you mean '...that GLOBALLY the Sahel drought is real....'? Do you mean that the Sahel drought has global impacts or has featured a global response to the problem? Please clarify. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
226	9	17	12	17	13	This sentence needs to be clarified. What is meant by "globally" and "the Sahel drought is real"? Does the latter phrase indicate that the drought still persists or that it existed from 1970-90? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
227	9	17	13	17	15	The described projections should be more fully elaborated--what are the modeled ranges of outcomes, and what are the sources of uncertainty? The sentence also should reference relevant sections of chapter 3 (e.g., 3.5.1). (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
228	9	17	14	17	14	Please cite a specific IPCC chapter. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted – chapter 3 SREX now cited – AR5 cited
229	9	17	14	17	14	"is very uncertain to" -- "uncertain too" or "uncertain to...."? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
230	9	17	15	17	15	The citation for Giannini et al. (2008) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
231	9	17	18	0	0	In the section on Ethiopia, it is quite astounding that there is no mention of the increasing impact of drought on pastoralism or the drylands. Ethiopia in particular has seen a clear shift in drought induced disasters from the highland, agricultural producing areas during the 70s and 80s to the lowlands in the later 90s and since. The same trend has happened in both Kenya and Uganda. There should, therefore, be at least a paragraph in the introduction specifically on pastoralism e.g. "Livelihood systems such as nomadic and transhumant pastoralism are particularly adapted to arid and semi-arid environments and coping with drought. However these livelihood systems rely on a number of key factors for their survival i.e. the ability to move with their livestock over vast areas, careful management of natural resources particularly strategic grazing areas and water points at a landscape level via strong traditional institutions and practices. In recent years these survival mechanisms have become increasingly under threat due to unsupportive government policies, the effects of decades of economic, political and social marginalization, as well as population increases and insecurity and conflict. Hence drought episodes that would have previously been normal seasonal fluctuations in rainfall now cause large loss of lives and livelihoods. The effects of such hazards in future can only be mitigated in the long term by addressing the underlying causes of vulnerability in these areas." (Hillier, Debbie, Oxfam)	Addressed - Comment is correct. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on droughts and recommended to focus on the case study of drought in Syria.
232	9	17	20	17	33	Very wild paragraph structure, jumping topics and timeframes, e.g. confusing statements about 1999: Below average rainfall with big rains lasting into the harvesting period in 1999? Drought? Please restructure and make this paragraph clearer. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
233	9	17	23	17	24	"the small rains failed and the big rains lasted into.." -- what are small, what are big rains? Clarify what you mean by "failed rains"? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
234	9	17	24	17	25	Given that the drought was in 1999-2000, is the elevated death rate during 1998-1999 due to rainfall instead of drought or due to both rainfall and drought? It would be helpful to clarify this point. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
235	9	17	28	17	28	This is not the correct name for CDC. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
236	9	17	29	17	33	Reference(s) needed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
237	9	17	32	17	32	What are 'traditional infectious diseases'? Please list some examples. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
238	9	17	36	17	39	Please provide more information on all these numbers! CI? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
239	9	17	37	17	38	It would be helpful to indicate what is meant by "CI" to ensure clarity for the reader. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
240	9	17	41	17	41	...due to influx of non-immune malnourished people'? Not immune against what? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
241	9	17	44	17	48	The percentages given here would be clearer if number of deaths were unambiguously specified in each case. For example, the first percentage, 70.3%, presumably corresponds to 206 of 293 total deaths before and after intervention? Then, the percentages given in the three bullet points seem to correspond to the percentage of total deaths before intervention and the percentage of total deaths after intervention--the percentages and corresponding number of deaths (X deaths out of Y deaths before interventions, etc.) should be clarified in each case. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
242	9	17	50	17	51	Why did infections increase after interventions? Suggesting it was an influx of malnourished individuals is only a partial explanation at best. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
243	9	17	51	17	51	It should be clarified what is meant by "all" here. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
244	9	18	1	21	4	These pages need significant editing to highlight key issues in the case studies, to remove material that is not relevant for the case study, to add citations for sections of Chapters 3 and 4 where the reader can go for more information, to add references, etc. It also needs an English language edit. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - Comment is correct. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on droughts and recommended to focus on the case study of drought in Syria. In addition, a common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed.
245	9	18	3	18	3	Am confused - where does the other ~30% of water come from then if not from rainfall? Do you mean perhaps that 'Direct rainfall runoff represents 68.5%? This would make more sense, with the remainder coming from lake storage, ground water reserves etc. Please clarifv. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
246	9	18	3	18	26	The English in this paragraph about droughts in Syria needs careful attention. The language is rather confusing at places (not even names are consistent: Dier ez-Zor vs. Dair El Zohr, assuming those are the referring to the same regions) (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – reworded to reflect comment
247	9	18	5	18	5	"vegetation cover has been declined"...By whom/what? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – reworded to reflect comment
248	9	18	6	0	0	Grammatical errors in the sentence (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Addressed – reworded to reflect comment
249	9	18	6	18	7	It should be more clearly indicated what time frame the 12 and 24 years reflect--from 1986 to 2009?? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – reworded to reflect comment
250	9	18	9	18	9	Please provide references supporting this increased drought frequency. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Consulted with Chapter 3 - addressed

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
251	9	18	9	18	9	It is unclear what is meant by "drought frequency" with respect to the two mentioned agricultural seasons--is the author team indicating that drought frequency increased from 2004 to 2010? If so, what does drought frequency mean in this context? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - reworded to reflect comment
252	9	18	10	18	10	Should "immigrate" be changed to "emigrate". The sentence makes more sense if it is changed in this way. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Addressed - deleted
253	9	18	12	18	20	The specific details described here do not seem to speak to emergent themes that could be learned from this drought example. Abbreviating these details would be preferable. It would be better to discuss broader trends across the longer mentioned period from 2004 to 2010. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – reworded to reflect comment
254	9	18	15	18	15	clarify what is meant by "poor rainfall" (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - reworded
255	9	18	17	18	17	Why are you citing Chapter 3 here? Chapter 3 do not discuss these impacts. Please remove and cite the more appropriate chapter, eg, Chapter 4 perhaps. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - reworded
256	9	18	22	18	25	The time frame relevant to the described impacts should be specified more clearly in both of these sentences. In particular, what is the time frame relevant to the increase of 380%? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – reworded to reflect comment
257	9	18	25	18	26	The sentence about "toxicity of coarse particles" seems completely out of context. Why is this relevant here? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
258	9	18	25	18	26	The connection of this sentence to the described trends in the paragraph should be specified: do droughts lead to greater prevalence of coarse particles, for example? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed- deleted
259	9	18	31	0	0	climactic events on of which has a grmmatical error (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Addressed- deleted
260	9	18	31	18	39	The causes of drought in South America and impacts associated with El Nino are assessed carefully in Chapter 3. This material is not needed here, is not well written, and is not supported with any scientific references. Please delete. This section should begin from line 39: "During the 1997/1998 El Nino.....". (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed- deleted
261	9	18	31	18	40	This description of ENSO events should consider and cite relevant sections and material from chapter 3. Overlap should be considered, with redundancies reduced as appropriate. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed- deleted
262	9	18	31	19	10	These paragraphs begin with a focus on droughts related to ENSO, but the described 2005 drought resulted from other climate conditions. It would thus be preferable to begin the section with a description of drought in South America that encompasses all of the examples provided in the section. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed- deleted
263	9	18	40	18	40	The citation for World Meteorological Organization (2009) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed- deleted
264	9	18	42	18	42	The citation for Naumann et al. (2008) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed- deleted
265	9	18	43	18	44	A citation should be provided for this sentence on losses due to water deficits. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed- deleted
266	9	18	46	19	2	The source of information in this paragraph should be more clearly specified--for example, is Marengo et al. (2007) the source of all information in the paragraph? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed- deleted
267	9	18	47	18	47	The citation for Marengo et al (2007) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed- deleted
268	9	18	50	19	1	Scientific references are needed in relation to these listed causes of the 2005 drought, and reported air temp observations. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed- deleted
269	9	18	53	19	1	Reference needed in relation to this temperature statement. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed- deleted
270	9	19	4	19	10	References are needed to support the information given in this paragraph. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed- deleted
271	9	19	4	19	10	You must provide references for the statements you make here. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed- deleted
272	9	19	4	19	10	Citations for information in this paragraph should be provided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed- deleted
273	9	19	7	19	7	The citation for Meteorological Weather Service of Argentina (SMN) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed- deleted
274	9	19	13	20	13	In the section of "drought effect", there is too much description on the "dust storm" and other effects of drought such as poverty, while famine receives little attention. It is suggested to add a specific case. (CHINA)	Addressed- deleted to reflect comment
275	9	19	15	19	26	How confident are you about the precision indicated in the numbers provided here: 41.82%, 38.87%, 4.62%, 81.11%, 26.69%, 2.57%, 0.14% (!)? Suggest round these numbers unless you can scientifically justify the level of precision provided. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed- deleted
276	9	19	15	20	13	These paragraphs shift in focus from drought impacts in general to dust storms in particular. It would be preferable to maintain focus more clearly on the full set of drought impacts, including drought-related dust storms as one of these impacts. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed- deleted to reflect comment
277	9	19	16	19	17	Specific relevant sections in chapter 4 should be referenced here, in place of the general reference to chapter 3. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
278	9	19	17	19	17	Why are you referring to ch03? Don't you mean ch04? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
279	9	19	25	19	25	The citation for Squires (2001) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
280	9	19	25	19	26	What 'sequences of actions and reactions' are you referring to? Please specify (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
281	9	19	28	19	29	Provide references. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
282	9	19	28	19	31	This description of drought would benefit from consideration and citation of relevant sections and material in chapter 3. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – Chapter 3 have contributed to this case study and sections from Chapter 3 are cited
283	9	19	28	20	13	Why do you focus so heavily on dust storms? What about the other effects from drought. You don't clearly make a link between the Amazon dependence on Sahara dust and drought. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
284	9	19	35	19	35	What is the purpose of praising the importance of Aeolian geomorphology here? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
285	9	19	38	19	39	The linkage between dust storms and epidemics should be more clearly explained. Can the mentioned bacterial cells be linked to epidemics as is implied? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
286	9	19	38	19	41	The increased occurrence of meningitis associated with dry and dusty conditions in Africa could be mentioned here. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Addressed - deleted
287	9	19	40	19	41	The time frame of the "greatest mass of Asian dust" should be clarified, and it would be helpful for the reader to define the acronym PM. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
288	9	19	41	19	41	what are "PM surface levels"? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
289	9	20	1	20	13	The purpose of this case study is not the importance of dust transport to South American rainforests... Please link with drought. Are you wanting to illustrate this as a positive effect of drought? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
290	9	20	5	20	7	delete the sentence starting with "Placed in a narrow..." -- this is not relevant for this report. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
291	9	20	9	20	13	It seems the detailed information here does not add to the discussion. It would perhaps be preferable to end with the first half of the sentence, deleting the information after the semicolon. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
292	9	20	10	20	13	delete text starting from "...the mean particle radius..." -- this is not relevant for this report. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
293	9	20	16	0	0	The drought management section and the lessons learned are very poor. Much more work is required to bring this up to an acceptable standard. At the very least, there needs to be considerable mention of drought cycle management, which is used in the Horn of Africa with considerable success. As follows: How to conceptualise and operationalise drought management in the Horn of Africa In the Horn and East Africa drought affects more people, more frequently than any other disaster. In Kenya for example, drought accounts for 8 out of the 10 top disasters in the last 20 years with the other 2 being floods) and has affected more people and led to more deaths and economic losses than any other hazard. REF: http://www.preventionweb.net/english/countries/statistics/?cid=59 Approaches such as Drought Cycle Management (DCM) are designed to effectively adjust both long term and short term programming to drought conditions and ensure that livelihoods are saved as well as lives. The Cycle starts with Normal Stage, when rainfall is good and water and pasture are plentiful. At this time development and/or mitigation interventions should be implemented such as infrastructure development (water points, grain reserves, roads and healthcare facilities) and building the capacity of local organisations to lobby and secure their rights. The next stage is the alert/ alarm stage, when pasture, water and other resources start to deteriorate, and drought preparedness activities are needed such as livestock vaccinations and destocking (buying up animals before they get too weak; stockpiling cereals/grains; repairing old water boreholes etc. The next stage is emergency, where most resources are scarce and cannot sustain the people and their livestock no longer cope on their own without external support. At this point relief assistance is required for both people and their livestock including food aid and animal feeding programs; emergency healthcare (for humans and animals); trucking in water. When it eventually rains, water and pasture become available and people rebuild their livelihood. This stage is recovery and reconstruction activities are implemented including restocking animal and repairing water infrastructure such as dams and boreholes. Drought Cycle Management needs to be built into programs and donors need to provide long term flexible funding to ensure its implementation. There is a useful schematic of drought cycle management - I can't work out how to include this in this excel format, but it can be found here The Drought Cycle Management Approach IIRR, Cordaid and Acacia Consultants. 2004. Drought Cycle Management: A toolkit for the drylands of the Greater Horn of Africa. International Institutes of Rural Reconstruction, Nairobi; Cordaid, The Hague; and Acacia Consultants, Nairobi (Hillier, Debbie, Oxfam)	In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on droughts and recommended to focus on the case study of drought in Syria. Since the case study is about Syria we considered that the UNISDR, 2011: Global Assessment Report on Disaster Risk Reduction. Geneva, Switzerland: United Nations International Strategy for Disaster Reduction. http://www.preventionweb.net/english/hyogo/gar/2011/en/home/download.html to be more helpful as a reference in this instance with its special case study on Syrian drought to be more relevant than Drought cycle management - A toolkit for the drylands of the Greater Horn of Africa
294	9	20	16	20	32	Given the wide range of droughts considered, it seems odd that the discussion here of drought management is so abbreviated and focused on one geographic region. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - Comment is correct. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on droughts and recommended to focus on the case study of drought in Syria.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
295	9	20	18	20	32	this paragraph is all based on grey literature and does not provide an assessment, just a summary of what these ACSAD is doing... (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – ACSAD is referenced where needed
296	9	20	18	20	32	The US program NDIS could be mentioned. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – paragraph deleted
297	9	20	20	20	20	Is it Wilhite or White? (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Addressed - corrected
298	9	20	20	20	20	Are "Wilhite 2005" the same as "White"? Is "White" meant to be a reference? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - corrected
299	9	20	20	20	20	The citation for Wilhite (2005) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – corrected and reference added
300	9	20	22	20	24	Is it necessary to mention here that the "Arab Center works closely withfor empowering..." -- how relevant is it for the report to get all this information about institutions? Suggest to shorten text. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - corrected
301	9	20	26	20	32	Sentence needs restructuring - currently too unclear. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - corrected
302	9	20	35	21	4	suggest to rename this section to "conclusions" or "concluding remarks" -- what is presented in the bulletized are basically conclusions of the assessment by the author team, rather than "lessons" (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed. – with lessons identified - which are the lessons now
303	9	20	35	21	4	The previous sections to "Lessons Identified" in this section on drought largely focus on the consequences of drought. Integrating examples of how the selected droughts were managed comparatively or over time would help the reader better understand how the lessons were identified as well as how they might be used in context. Similar problem exists in the case study on Cholera on p. 44 (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed - common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed. – with lessons identified - which are the lessons now
304	9	20	37	20	39	The (high confidence) here appears very random, because assigned confidence and uncertainty terms are not used in the remaining bullets or elsewhere in Chapter 9. Here it is not clear if this high confidence is only in relation to environmental flows, or all of the preceding sentence. If you really do wish to assign confidence here or elsewhere, this must be carefully assessed and based on multiple lines of independent evidence (please refer to IPCC uncertainty guidance document for more details) (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – reworded to reflect comment
305	9	20	37	20	41	It is unclear how this is relevant to the case study. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
306	9	20	37	21	4	The assessment findings presented in this summary section could potentially be characterized by calibrated uncertainty language, especially summary terms for evidence and agreement and levels of confidence, per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties. We encourage the author team to consider assigning such calibrated language to findings here. The degree of certainty in some findings may not be completely clear to the reader and could be clarified with the use of calibrated language, thereby strengthening the clarity of the section overall. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties used where relevant
307	9	20	39	20	39	The placement of the term "high confidence" is difficult to interpret--does an assignment of high confidence pertain only to environmental flows? If so, what does this mean and how should confidence in the other categories mentioned be interpreted? If calibrated uncertainty language is retained here, the terms should be italicized. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
308	9	20	39	20	39	Since salinization of soils has not been extensively considered in the case study, it would be helpful to provide a citation here. It would also be helpful to clarify the phrasing of the sentence to make clear that salinization is another stress on water resources, if that is the intended meaning. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
309	9	21	7	22	43	The entries in this reference list are not always in the right alphabetic order. Please rearrange the list to make sure all entries are in the right alphabetic order. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – reviewed and corrected
310	9	22	4	22	5	"...active observational hydro-meteorological measurement in Mozambique had been rare." Such developing countries would benefit most from use of paleo/proxy data in evaluating the magnitude and frequency of floods and other natural hazards. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This relates to the FLOOD CASE STUDY and should have been listed as page 24 not 22 – this is addressed separately
311	9	22	14	22	15	For Olsson, L., et al. (2005): All author names should be listed here for this reference, without use of "et al." Please add the other author names to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – comment noted and applied to references generally – this citation deleted
312	9	22	26	22	27	For Taye A, et al. (2010): All author names should be listed here for this reference, without use of "et al." Please add the other author names to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
313	9	22	33	22	34	For USDA (2010): This listed source is not available at the link provided. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – revised
314	9	22	35	22	35	The author's name here should be "Sanford" instead of "Stanford." (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
315	9	22	46	0	0	Case Study 9.2.4: Please note - The clarity of the English language in this case study needs careful attention. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
316	9	22	46	0	0	Case study 9.2.4. The examples discussed in this case study should be carefully considered. Currently, the rationale for the selected sample of floods or flood-like events is not clear. Ideally the presentation of each example would follow a similar structure so that the reader can easily compare across examples and start to draw conclusions based on the differences that emerge. This case study should be reformulated to present a more cogent and perhaps focused story. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on floods and recommended to focus on the case study of floods in Mozambique. In addition, a common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed. This approach made it possible to focus on more detailed study of selected cases of floods with the successive presentation of the investigations, as well as provide a more detailed history of each case of floods, including the measures taken during and after flooding to reduce the risk of catastrophic natural disasters.
317	9	22	46	0	0	Case study 9.2.4. This case study needs an English language edit. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. English language was edited.
318	9	22	46	22	47	The section actually seems to be about riverine flooding (as distinct from storm surge) (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Indeed, this study focuses on river flooding. Given the reviewer's comment, as well as taking into account the decisions of the fourth meeting of the leading authors (May 2011) the section name was corrected. In addition, the edited section examines only the cases of floods in Mozambique in 2000 and 2007.
319	9	22	46	22	47	This title is too long. The section actually seems to be about riverine flooding (as distinct from storm surge) (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed
320	9	22	49	22	51	What time period is this statement from MunichRe based on? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The time period is from 1950 till 1999.
321	9	22	49	22	51	This statistics are somewhat unsuitable here. The section is about riverine flooding, while the statistics quoted appear to include both riverine and storm surges. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Comment is correct. The represented statistics was deleted from the edited version of section.
322	9	22	49	27	18	The German research project RIMAX should be mentioned as a good example of extreme flood risk management. (GERMANY)	In the edited version of section case studies of floods in Mozambique in 2000 and 2007 are investigated only.
323	9	22	51	22	51	perhaps refer to Chapters 2/4 when mentioning vulnerability and exposure as key determinants of risk? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct. In the edited version of section the sentence about key determinants of vulnerability and exposure in disaster risk was deleted because this thesis is discussing in Chapter 2 in detail.
324	9	23	5	23	7	This statement should be reworded to avoid prescriptive interpretations. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct and accepted by the authors. The text is adjusted in accordance with the recommendation of the reviewer in such way: "Mozambique is located in the bottom current of the rivers before their confluence into the ocean. Therefore the development and operating of early warning system and flood control system in Mozambique depend on a close collaboration with other countries of the Southern Africa Development Community (SADC)"
325	9	23	20	23	22	For the phrase "85% of all of patients," it would be helpful to clarify which patients are being considered overall--all patients seen during the 2000 floods in Mozambique? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct and accepted by the authors. The text is adjusted in accordance with the recommendation of the reviewer in such way: "Epidemiological research during the flood in the most affected area in the middle of the south of Mozambique found infections in 85% of all those who applied for medical patients".
326	9	23	33	23	33	It is unclear what source Environmental Agency (2010) corresponds to in the case study's reference list, given multiple references for this author and year in that list. Please revise the citation so that its corresponding reference is unambiguous. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. Source Link (Environmental Agency, 2010) is removed from the text because the text in lines 31-36 is the original text of the authors of this section.
327	9	23	33	23	42	To the extent possible, citations should be provided to indicate which statements originate from the literature. It is currently not clear which statements reflect assessment conclusions and which ones are directly traced to underlying sources. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct and accepted by the authors. The text is adjusted in accordance with the recommendation of the reviewer.
328	9	23	35	23	39	The prose here reads like recommendations in a training manual rather than the more neutral tone of most IPCC reports. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Comment is correct and accepted by the authors. The text is adjusted in accordance with the recommendation of the reviewer.
329	9	24	4	24	10	The second two bullet points need citations. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Comment accepted. Relevant references are included in the text.
330	9	24	12	24	12	suggest to smoothen language: "Mozambique's government learned some lessons from..." (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct and accepted by the authors. The text is adjusted in accordance with the recommendation of the reviewer.
331	9	24	12	24	22	It would be helpful to tie the discussion in this paragraph to the problems described in the preceding bullets. (IPCC WGII TSU)	In response to comments by a reviewer can say that we tried to discuss the measures taken by the Government of Mozambique to overcome the problems that were highlighted in the points on the line from 1 to 10 (page 24).

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
332	9	24	12	24	45	The paragraphs starting on lines 12 and 45 can be combined. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Paragraphs starting on lines 12-22 consider the actions taken by the Government of Mozambique after the floods in 2000 in order to reduce damage from flooding in the future. At the same time, in paragraphs starting on lines 25-40 new cases of floods in Mozambique in 2007 was investigated. Therefore, paragraphs 12-22 and 25-40 are marked in two different subsections.
333	9	24	19	24	19	Please provide more details about the Buzi Early Warning system, otherwise there is no point mentioning it. BTW, is it Buzi or Búzi? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct and accepted by the authors. A more detailed explanation of Búzi Early Warning system has been made. Also made corrections in the name of the river (instead of Buzi corrected to Búzi)
334	9	24	27	24	40	So the 2007 event was a combination of flooding from extreme rainfall and also a storm surge from the cyclone? Please clarify. And also clarify differences to year 2000 flood. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The mechanism of floods formation in Mozambique in 2000 and 2007 was complex and similar. The initial phases of both floods have been linked to heavy rains that resulted in a sharp increase of river water levels, including the expense of dumping water from reservoirs. Further, the situation has worsened with the release of tropical cyclones Eline and Gloria (in 200) and tropical cyclone Favio Cyclone (2007).
335	9	24	27	24	40	For the two event summaries for the 2000 and 2007 floods, it would be helpful to provide comparable statistics to facilitate the reader's comparison and to support the first sentence here on lines 27 and 28. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Key statistics on the floods 2000 in Mozambique were included in section 3.1. Statistics on floods 2007 were represented in section 4.1.
336	9	24	47	24	47	Typo in citation: For Loster et al. (2007), only two authors are listed in the case study's reference list. Please ensure the citation is correct and harmonize the reference in both locations (chapter text and reference list). (IPCC WGII TSU)	Reviewer's comment is quite right and the authors have made appropriate adjustments to the text.
337	9	25	1	25	10	It would be helpful to specify the time frame of the activities described here. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct and accepted by the authors. The text is adjusted in accordance with the recommendation of the reviewer. It is noted that these steps have occurred during the flood period.
338	9	25	7	25	8	What do WFT and INGC stand for? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct and accepted by the authors. These abbreviations are explained in the text.
339	9	25	13	26	50	suggest to rename this section to "Information from other flood events" -- you don't present "lessons identified", rather you add additional evidence/information from more regions that add to and strengthen the conclusions that could be drawn from the Mozambique floods alone. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct and accepted by the authors. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on floods and recommended to focus on the case study of floods in Mozambique. As a result, other cases of flooding were excluded from this section.
340	9	25	22	25	24	It would be helpful to indicate the duration for which 82 mm hourly rainfall persisted. (IPCC WGII TSU)	During the period from 11 to 12 July 2006 in the Gyeonggi - province maximum total precipitation recorded Meteorological Service of the Republic of Korea amounted to 399 mm and a maximum intensity of precipitation for the period from 11 to 12 July 2006 amounted to about 82 mm. According to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "South Korea: Impact Determined by State of the Environment" was not included in Case study on Floods.
341	9	25	25	25	28	It would be helpful to specify what is meant by "better prepared"--for example, does this mean that programs to control soil erosion were implemented in such areas? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. Erosion control programs have been conducted since 1907 in Korea. Over this time, erosion control techniques have improved along with technological developments. According to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "South Korea: Impact Determined by State of the Environment" was not included in Case study on Floods.
342	9	25	30	25	34	The first sentence says the event was not a major disaster, then says it was. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. The authors would like to emphasize that although the total amount of damage the case could not be classified as a "major event", but he had severe consequences, especially for ecosystems and infrastructure of the region. According to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "South Korea: Impact Determined by State of the Environment" was not included in Case study on Floods.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
343	9	25	38	0	0	A case study for Istanbul, Turkey flood can be added. Such as: "Heavy rainfall and floods impacted Istanbul of Turkey. The city received its heaviest rainfall over a 48-hr period in 80 years on 8-9 September 2009. The worst flooding in the city occurred in the European part of the city. Floods swept through west parts of Istanbul and killed 33 people. More than 35,000 people have been affected. Total damage has been about 80 million USD (Toros et. al, 2010). Ref: Toros H, Geertsema G, Cats G, 2010. Evaluation of HIRLAM and Harmonie precipitation forecasts for the Istanbul flash flood event of September 2009. HIRLAM Newsletter 56:37-46 (Incecik, Salahattin/Selahattin, Istanbul Technical University)	Comment is correct. The authors would like to thank the referee for useful comments. In accordance with the decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors cases of floods in Mozambique are included only in the final version of section on Floods.
344	9	25	39	0	0	The Caucasus disaster is a useful addition, but the lessons learnt from this event can be much better examined here. The real key lesson (which is well published in a number of papers) coming from this Caucasus case study is that a sequence or chain-reaction of natural events can lead to a disaster much greater and further reaching than any of the individual events would have created on its own. According to the Haeberli et al. 2005 paper, managing such events "require integrated consideration of complex chains of processes, a task that must be undertaken by correspondingly qualified groups of interdisciplinary experts". The first sentence (line 41) should be better worded to reflect this key lesson. The initial ice/rock avalanche was not a 'disaster' on its own, but became a disaster much further downstream through a chain-reaction of events. In addition, the Caucasus disaster is often referred to as an example of a historically unprecedented event - such that might become more common in high mountain regions as a result of climate change, permafrost melt, and glacial lake formation. Finally, an ongoing lesson from this case study, has been the successful application of remote sensing to monitor the new lake that was formed in this event (see the Kaab et al. reference). You might even consider contacting Christian Huggel (a CA for Chapter 3 and an expert on this event), to help strengthen this valuable case study. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct. The authors would like to thank the referee for useful comments. Indeed, the case of a disaster in the Republic of North Ossetia (Russia) in 2002 is very complex and requires a detailed and comprehensive review. However, due to limitations in the volume of manuscripts of the Special Report according to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia" was not included in Case study on Floods.
345	9	25	39	25	39	The title of the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia" appears incomplete and inconsistent with the other titles given as part of this Case Study. Perhaps the "effects of many small disasters" point could be highlighted in the title? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct. According to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia" was not included in Case study on Floods.
346	9	25	41	25	41	It seems that the disaster described here is not the result of many small disasters. Instead, it seems to have resulted from a complex interaction among many factors, each of which may not have caused detrimental impacts and disaster on its own. The potential for severe accumulated impacts from multiple small disasters is discussed in several other chapters with reference to multiple independent events happening in succession, as opposed to complex interactions contributing to one event (as described here). (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. But according to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia" was not included in Case study on Floods.
347	9	25	41	26	14	Is the event described a glacial lake outburst flood, as defined in the glossary and discussed in chapter 3? If so, it would be preferable to use the term here to identify the event as such. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. But, according to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia" was not included in Case study on Floods.
348	9	25	43	25	53	There seem to be some inconsistency here with the numbers you report. From Huggel et al., it is clear that the initial avalanche/debris flow travelled for 20 km, and then the subsequent mudflow travelled a further 15 km. Alternatively Haeberli et al, give these values as 18km and 15km respectively. Please be clear, consistent, and cite the relevant source for the numbers you give here. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct. This section contains data in accordance with studies of C. Huggel, S. Zraggen-Oswald, W. Haeberli, A. Kaab, A. Polkvoj, I. Galushkin, and S. G. Evans. (The 2002 rock/ice avalanche at Kolka/Karmadon, Russian Caucasus: assessment of extraordinary avalanche formation and mobility, and application of QuickBird satellite imagery. Natural Hazards and Earth System Sciences (2005) 5: 173–187. SRef-ID: 1684-9981/nhess/2005-5-173. European Geosciences Union). But according to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia" was not included in Case study on Floods.
349	9	25	43	25	53	These paragraphs can be combined and made consistent. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. According to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia" was not included in Case study on Floods.
350	9	25	49	25	49	formatting note - should be 100 x 106 m ³ (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is accepted. It is the technical error (not 100.106 m ³ , but 100*106 m ³)
351	9	25	49	25	49	The precision of the cited figure (100.106 m ³) is at odds with its qualification of "about." (IPCC WGII TSU)	But according to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia" was not included in Case study on Floods.
352	9	25	53	25	53	This should be 5,000,000 or 5 x 10 ⁶ m ³ , ie, 5 million, NOT 500 million. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is accepted. This should be 5 million.
353	9	26	1	26	1	The citation for Kaab (2003a) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. But according to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia" was not included in Case study on Floods.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
354	9	26	4	26	4	Some scientists? Please provide references. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct. But according to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia»" was not included in Case study on Floods.
355	9	26	4	26	4	Please delete "according to the investigations of some scientists" and provide an assessment with references. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. But according to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia»" was not included in Case study on Floods.
356	9	26	6	26	6	Please provide details about these 'special climatic and meteorological conditions' (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The summer of 2002 was especially rainy on the North Caucasus. As a result, a great amount of water must have accumulated in and under the Kolka Glacier. From 1995 to 2002, the summer air temperatures were higher than average, and for the four years preceding 2002 glacier melting exceeded the norm by 1.5–2 times. Thus, the firn field located high above the right side of the glacier was included in the runoff. Very intensive melting may have played a role in the formation of the firn and ice falls. An impetuous outburst of the glacier could have occurred if a particularly large volume of water had accumulated under the glacier, due to anomalous melting of ice and snow in the high-altitude zone of the whole Caucasus area during the previous 4 years (Kotlyakov V.M., Rototayeva O.V., Nosenko G.A. The September 2002 Kolka Glacier Catastrophe in North Ossetia, Russian Federation: Evidence and Analysis. Mountain Research and Development Vol 24 No 1 Feb 2004, pp. 78-83).
357	9	26	6	26	6	What are the special conditions? (IPCC WGII TSU)	According to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia»" was not included in Case study on Floods.
358	9	26	8	26	8	Geothermal activity' might be a better description than 'volcanic activity' which tends to suggest an eruption. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The term "volcanic activity" as a possible cause of the disaster was used as described in Kotlyakov V.M., Rototayeva O.V., Nosenko G.A. The September 2002 Kolka Glacier Catastrophe in North Ossetia, Russian Federation: Evidence and Analysis. Mountain Research and Development Vol 24 No 1 Feb 2004, pp. 78-83. According to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia»" was not included in Case study on Floods.
359	9	26	13	26	13	The citation for Kotlyakov (2004) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The citation for Kotlyakov, Rototayeva, Nosenko is in the reference list. But according to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia»" was not included in Case study on Floods.
360	9	26	14	26	14	change Huggell to Huggel (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct. But according to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia»" was not included in Case study on Floods.
361	9	26	14	26	14	The citation for Huggell (2005) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. According to decision of the fourth meeting of the leading authors the section "Russia Republic of North Ossetia»" was not included in Case study on Floods.
362	9	26	19	26	19	Would it be better to change "unprecedented" to "without precedent in the historic record" or some such phrase? Did the Pitt Review rule out the occurrence of heavier rainfall prior to the period of instrumental record? (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Comment is correct. But section "England to Wales: The Impact of Heavy Rainfall" was not included in the last version of Case study on Floods.
363	9	26	27	0	0	Is the figure needed? (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Comment is correct. But section "England to Wales: The Impact of Heavy Rainfall" was not included in the last version of Case study on Floods.
364	9	26	27	0	0	Figure 9.1: Is this figure about absolute precipitation levels necessary? What key messages are coming from this case study? Does this figure help to illustrate these key messages? Not really. BTW, the UK MetOffice logos need to be removed when reproducing these figures. The UJ MetOffice can be acknowledged in the caption. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct. But section "England to Wales: The Impact of Heavy Rainfall" was not included in the last version of Case study on Floods because of volume limitation.
365	9	26	35	26	35	Typo in citation: For Whitely (2007), the author's name is spelled differently in the chapter text, as compared to the case study's reference list. Please ensure correct spelling of the author's name in both the text and the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. It is a technical remark. But section "England to Wales: The Impact of Heavy Rainfall" was not included in the last version of Case study on Floods because of volume limitation.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
366	9	26	41	26	41	It is unclear what source Environmental Agency (2010) corresponds to in the case study's reference list, given multiple references for this author and year in that list. Please revise the citation so that its corresponding reference is unambiguous. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. But section "England to Wales: The Impact of Heavy Rainfall" was not included in the last version of Case study on Floods because of volume limitation.
367	9	27	1	27	18	Unclear how these conclusions have been derived from what is provided above? Please clarify what the individual conclusions are based on, e.g., by referring back to the specific examples provided in the Case Study. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct. In the edited version the text in line 1-18 (p.27) was reworded with reference to case study of floods in Mozambique and according to remarks of reviewers.
368	9	27	3	27	4	First, this sentence should consider and reflect the assessment findings of chapter 3, as summarized for example in Table 3.1. Second, the sentence seems to move beyond the lessons demonstrated in the section, for example because climate change adaptation has not been extensively considered in the case study. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. In the edited version the text in line 1-18 (p.27) was reworded with reference to case study of floods in Mozambique and according to remarks of reviewers.
369	9	27	10	27	10	The citation for EEA (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. The reference list was corrected in the edited version of section.
370	9	27	11	27	11	Better wording - '...risk management in response to climate change becomes very apparent...' (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct. In the edited version the text in line 1-18 (p.27) was reworded with reference to case study of floods in Mozambique and according to remarks of reviewers.
371	9	27	11	27	18	These three bullets are quite general conclusions, not conclusions related specifically to flooding. As such they could be moved elsewhere in the report. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Comment is correct. In the edited version the text in line 1-18 (p.27) was reworded with reference to case study of floods in Mozambique and according to remarks of reviewers.
372	9	27	15	27	18	The focus in this bullet should be maintained on the hazard considered in this chapter: floods involving complex interactions. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. In the edited version the text in line 1-18 (p.27) was reworded with reference to case study of floods in Mozambique and according to remarks of reviewers.
373	9	27	34	27	34	Referring to a website only is not appropriate; please cite correctly (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Comment is correct. The reference list was edited.
374	9	28	0	35	0	The Case Study 9.2.5 does not add value to the report and should be deleted. The different elements of the case study, i.e the Victorian heat wave, the Black Saturday bushfires and the Europe and Asia examples are confused with no clear or comprehensive management/adaptation lessons emerging from any. The lessons Identified section is largely irrelevant to the heading of 'reducing wildfire suppression costs and ecological disasters.' Many important lessons for adaptation were learnt from the Melbourne heatwave and bushfires including around early warning systems, the 'stay or go' policy, building standards, zoning laws, the classification rating of bushfire events, hazard reduction etc, these are not adequately addressed in the case study. (AUSTRALIA)	The Case study has now been re drafted to better focus on the events of January and February 2009 and draws extensively from the findings of the Victorian Bushfires Royal Commission to highlight the key lessons.
375	9	28	34	28	36	For Whittle R, Medd W, Deeming H, Kashefi E, Mort M, Twigger Ross C et al.: All author names should be listed here for this reference, without use of "et al." Please add the other author names to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Comment is correct. But in edited version of section this reference was deleted.
376	9	28	44	0	0	Case Study 9.2.5: Formal IPCC uncertainty terminology such as 'likely' and 'very likely' are used throughout this case study, but is not clear if these instances are intended as a formal assessment and if so, this assessment must be based on robust cited evidence. If not, then alternative terms should be used. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Removed all Likely 's except for a direct quote from the Victorian Bushfires Royal Commission where the term is used in its normal English sense.
377	9	28	44	0	0	From the headline one could assume that this section is dealing with Australia. On P31 L10-51 there is, however, a subsection about other parts of the world. I find this a bit confusing. (Koppe, Christina, Deutscher Wetterdienst)	Addressed – the title has been reworded
378	9	28	44	0	0	Case study 9.2.5. This case study should cite Box 4-1 in chapter 4 as appropriate and consider reducing overlaps between the two discussions. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Chapter 4 link has been requested
379	9	28	44	0	0	Case study 9.2.5. In this case study, fires in Melbourne are the primary focus, also with limited discussion of fires and associated conditions in Europe and Asia. This material on fires in Europe and Asia is not well integrated into the case study and is at odds with the title of the case study. The material pertaining to Europe and Asia should only be included if it contributes to the scope and purpose of the case study. If retained, it needs to be more thoroughly integrated into the case study, including into the Management and Lessons Identified subsections. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed -. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on hot weather and wildfires to retain information on other fires but after comment from the Review Editors it was agreed to only include the Victoria Fire incidents. A common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed.
380	9	28	44	28	45	The title of this case study should perhaps be broadened to encapsulate the range of examples considered, which extend beyond Victoria. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - reworded
381	9	28	44	33	10	This sub-chapter should be carefully reviewed by a native speaker. Several sentences do not make sense and / or are incomplete, the grammar needs checking (especially tenses and cases). (Rock, Joachim, Johann Heinrich von Thuenen-Institute)	Addressed
382	9	28	49	28	49	Climate change does not increase temperature and change rainfall patterns. Increased temperatures and altered rainfall patterns are intrinsic parts of climate change. Climate change is not a causative agent. Increased emission of greenhouse gases is. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Addressed - deleted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
383	9	28	49	28	54	These statements should consider and cite relevant assessment findings and sections in chapters 3 and 4, as well as other appropriate sources, in providing an introduction that is as concise as possible. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – link to Chapter 3 in place
384	9	28	50	0	0	Including droughts in this sentence is problematic. Chapter 3 only identifies a few areas where there is medium confidence that droughts will intensify in the future. (Nicholls, Neville, Monash University, School of Geography & Environmental Science)	Addressed – discussed with Chapter 3
385	9	28	50	28	50	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
386	9	28	51	28	51	effects may vary by....' should be 'effect WILL vary by...' (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - reworded
387	9	28	51	28	54	You can not say in such general terms that the listed changes in extremes (i - III) are expected. What assessed evidence do you have to suggest these changes are expected? You can not list these expectations without being specific about which region, which time frame you are considering, and most importantly these projections must be consistent with the assessment given in chapter 3, and chapter 4 in the case of linking with wildfires. We suggest you rewrite this paragraph giving projections for Australia based on the information provided in chapter 3, especially Table 3.3. Please consult with the Chapter 3 authors to ensure your text here is accurate. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - reworded
388	9	29	5	29	37	This section is very confusing. Please refer to the appropriate sections in Chapter 3, remove most of the text, and clarify the rest. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – link to Chapter 3 in place
389	9	29	7	0	0	Should this be central Victoria, rather than Central Australia (which generally does not include Victoria)? (Chambers, Lynda, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	Addressed - reworded
390	9	29	7	0	0	The term "hot dry conditions" is problematic, as increased drought is only projected (with medium confidence) in a few localities, whereas the projection of hotter conditions is more certain. (Nicholls, Neville, Monash University, School of Geography & Environmental Science)	Addressed - deleted
391	9	29	7	29	7	Should "in some regions" be added at the end of the opening sentence. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Addressed – deleted
392	9	29	7	29	7	Again, this statement concerning hot dry conditions is not accurate. Do you mean this statement to be specific for Australia? If so, then yes, it is 'Very likely' hot conditions will become more frequent, but you can not say the same for dryness. There is low confidence in drought projections for Northern Australia, and medium confidence for Southern Australia. Please consult chapter 3 (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
393	9	29	7	29	7	This opening sentence needs to clearly reflect the assessment findings and relevant sections of chapter 3. In addition, the term "very likely," assuming it is being used as calibrated uncertainty language per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, should be italicized. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
394	9	29	7	29	15	Was 2010 and the start of 2011 wet enough over southeastern Australia to merit comment here? (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Not addressed as not specific to the case study of 2009-2010
395	9	29	7	29	37	The heading is "Effects.." but the section is mostly about climate. Moreover, the reader is left wondering why the section is discussing the two locations under consideration. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed – deleted
396	9	29	10	29	10	Victoria has been the warmest on record' - what period does this refer to? (Trewin, Blair, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	Addressed – deleted
397	9	29	10	29	10	The citation for DSE (2008) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
398	9	29	10	29	11	This sentence makes no sense. Please rephrase. (Rock, Joachim, Johann Heinrich von Thuenen-Institute)	Addressed - deleted
399	9	29	17	0	0	This case study is titled 'Victoria Australia'. Why do you suddenly here divert and provide physical climate projections for southern Europe/MED? For improved focus and clarity of this case-study, these lines should be deleted. In addition, the projections you give here are not accurate (see further comments). You do not provide similar projections for Asia, another region for which you discuss wildfires on page 31, so it is not clear why you decided to include this strange section for southern Europe/MED. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
400	9	29	17	29	17	A reader who picks up with section 9.2.5 has not idea what SEM means. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed – deleted
401	9	29	17	29	18	The projection you give for dry spells in SEM is NOT consistent with the assessment given for this region in Chapter 3. I.e, they don't say 'likely', but rather state 'medium confidence' for an increase in dryness. If you insist on keeping this SEM material in the case study, you must ensure consistency with the Chapter 3 assessment, and refer appropriately to Chapter 3. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
402	9	29	17	29	21	What does SEM mean in this context? (Rock, Joachim, Johann Heinrich von Thuenen-Institute)	Addressed – deleted
403	9	29	17	29	21	The relevance of the SEM material to what is ostensibly a Victorian case study needs to be made clearer. (Trewin, Blair, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	Addressed – deleted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
404	9	29	17	29	22	First, the acronym SEM if retained must be defined. Second, it is not clear why Europe and the Mediterranean are being discussed here in a case study about Victoria. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
405	9	29	17	29	28	Text seems out of place. May be better in case study 9.2.3 on droughts. (Chambers, Lynda, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	Addressed – deleted
406	9	29	17	29	37	The terms "likely" and "very likely," if being used as calibrated uncertainty language per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, should be italicized. If the terms instead are being used casually, this usage should be avoided. Additionally, all statement pertaining to trends in hazards should reflect and cite the assessment findings and sections of chapter 3 as well as chapter 4 as appropriate. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
407	9	29	20	29	21	What are the likelihood statements you give here for precipitation and wet days based on? IPCC 2007? Please also cite a specific IPCC chapter. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
408	9	29	24	29	28	And now you suddenly go back to talking about Australia within the same paragraph. Really, it is completely unclear why in lines 17 - 24 you include a random section on SEM. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – reworded
409	9	29	26	29	27	Why does elevation influence aridity? Please explain and provide references. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
410	9	29	31	29	31	The citation for Allen et al. (2002) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
411	9	29	31	29	31	The citation for Noss et al. (2006) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed- added to reference list
412	9	29	36	29	36	The citation for Westerling et al. (2006) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
413	9	29	36	29	37	The citation for Gillett et al. (2004) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
414	9	29	37	29	37	The citation for Kasischke and Turetsky (2006) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
415	9	29	37	29	37	The citation for Girardin (2007) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
416	9	29	40	29	40	It is unclear why a section on "Impacts of Extreme Weather-Induced Disasters" follows a section on "Effects of Extreme Weather-Induced Disasters" (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	A common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed
417	9	29	40	33	10	These sections are very hard to follow. A lot of information is included that doesn't appear to have relevance for the case study. And an English language edit would help with clarity. References also are needed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - reworded
418	9	29	42	29	43	This sentence is a word-by-word repetition of l30 same page. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
419	9	29	46	29	47	The additions on the European and Korean Fire examples does not add anything to the Case Study. It rather diverts the reader and breaks the flow of the Case Study. Suggest to delete this part. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
420	9	29	52	29	52	Trewin and Vermont (2010) is the incorrect reference to this - should be Bureau of Meteorology (2008), same reference as comment 9 above. (Trewin, Blair, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	Addressed – deleted
421	9	29	52	29	52	The citation for Trewin and Vermont (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
422	9	30	1	30	2	There is something strange about this sentence - why would the winter of 2009 be relevant to fires which occurred earlier in 2009? Also, the statement about rainfall around Melbourne is incorrect - it was only slightly below average in the winters of both 2008 and 2009. Has this been confused with long-term (multi-year) rainfall deficits? (Trewin, Blair, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	Addressed – Corrected and reworded
423	9	30	5	30	6	Here is an example of where you use a likelihood statement (very likely) but do not cite any literature upon which this statement has been based. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
424	9	30	5	30	7	It seems that the described contamination will reduce available water supplies, but this effect is not the same as drought as discussed earlier in the paragraph. It would be clearer to refer to this effect as "water shortage" as opposed to "severe drought" to better distinguish the outcomes. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
425	9	30	6	30	6	'Water shortages' is probably better wording than 'drought' here. (Trewin, Blair, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	Addressed – deleted
426	9	30	6	30	6	The use of "very likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
427	9	30	9	0	0	Needs a year (2009) (Chambers, Lynda, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	Addressed – deleted
428	9	30	9	30	10	This sentence is unclear. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – reworded

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
429	9	30	41	0	0	intensity and speed a bushfire should be "intensity and speed with which a bushfire" (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Addressed - reworded
430	9	30	46	30	46	What does it mean for the FDI to reach 120 to over 200? Please provide more information in order to put this into context. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
431	9	30	48	30	49	Please reword sentence with correct english. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – reworded
432	9	31	4	31	5	In these two lines, it is not clear how "2030 houses" compare to "2000 properties"--are these figures essentially equivalent? If so, should one mention be removed? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
433	9	31	10	31	10	The case study refers to Victoria Australia according to the title on page 28 line 44, but here we have a section on wildfires in Europe and Asia. Concentration on Victoria might be more appropriate for a case study, with the other material on wild fires included earlier in the document. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Addressed – deleted
434	9	31	10	31	50	The additions on the European and Korean Fire examples does not add anything to the Case Study. It rather diverts the reader and breaks the flow of the Case Study. Suggest to delete this part. We note that the vast majority of the discussions of management options and of lessons learnt provided hereafter are all based on the Australia Fires anyway. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
435	9	31	12	31	12	The acronym SEM must be defined. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
436	9	31	12	31	13	Typo in citation: For San Miguel and Camia (2009), the author's name is spelled differently in the chapter text, as compared to the case study's reference list. Please ensure correct spelling of the author's name in both the text and the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
437	9	31	17	31	20	The trends described here could be further clarified. "Maximum values" could be specified more clearly, what is meant by "followed suit with some delay" could be indicated more precisely, and the reasons for the differing observed trends in European and North African countries could be discussed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
438	9	31	22	31	23	Please reword sentence and specify 'some areas' (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
439	9	31	23	31	23	It would be preferable to indicate which countries or regions are meant by "some areas." (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
440	9	31	23	31	23	Typo in citation: For San Miguel and Camia (2009), the author's name is spelled differently in the chapter text, as compared to the case study's reference list. Please ensure correct spelling of the author's name in both the text and the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
441	9	31	24	31	25	The time frame of the described event in Bulgaria should be specified. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
442	9	31	24	31	26	Give a year for the Bulgarian and Greek fires. (Trewin, Blair, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	Addressed – deleted
443	9	31	25	31	26	The heat wave discussed for Greece needs to be characterized more clearly--which heat wave, when? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
444	9	31	30	31	30	It should be specified what is meant here by "distances to towns or roads." (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - reworded
445	9	31	34	31	35	The citation for Tolika et al. (2007) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
446	9	31	37	31	37	Resilience domain'? Do you mean resilience level? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
447	9	31	42	31	42	What is meant with 'high soil erosion rates are irreversible at ecological timescales'? How long is the ecological timescale? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
448	9	31	42	31	43	What is the "ecological time scale"? Ecology is about e. g. relationships between organisms, populations and their environment, but has no finite time scale. (Rock, Joachim, Johann Heinrich von Thuenen-Institute)	Addressed – deleted
449	9	32	0	32	0	This page could be more closely tied to the rest of the discussion about fires, if the focus really is meant to be fires, which the section heading implies. If the broader range of Melbourne's vulnerability is the focus, then more of the impacts need to be discussed earlier on. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed - reworded
450	9	32	3	32	4	First sentence makes no sense. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – deleted
451	9	32	3	32	35	The scope of this section ideally would be broadened to more fully consider examples for other regions discussed in the case study, beyond Victoria. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The Case study has now been re drafted to better focus on the Australian events of January and February 2009.
452	9	32	5	0	0	1 800 000 liters is only a small quantity of water for Melbourne; Check the unit: M3 would fit better (FRANCE)	Addressed - reworded
453	9	32	19	0	0	Needs a year (2009) (Chambers, Lynda, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	Addressed – 2009 has been added
454	9	32	19	32	19	It would be preferable to specify the relevant year for the date "7 February" (2009 presumably), as well as on line 23. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – 2009 has been added
455	9	32	33	32	35	Delete the sentence starting with "The Korea government" -- The addition of the Korean Fire example does not add anything to the Case Study. It rather diverts the reader and breaks the flow of the Case Study. Suggest to delete this part. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	We agree – this case study is now focused on the Victoria, Australian January – February events

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
456	9	32	40	0	0	Lines 22-23 mention the weakness of the system that initiated in 2006 but did not work properly when needed. This is an important lesson which is missing in this section. (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	This is no longer relevant with the refocus of the article to the Australian fires.
457	9	32	40	32	42	You should make it clear that the projection you are giving here is not an assessed projection coming out of SREX. You should reword to begin: "A local report by CSIRO (2009) has indicated that by 2030, average annual temperatures.....". This is subtle, but important. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
458	9	32	40	33	10	Your 'lessons identified' are all in relation to the Australian wildfires. What was the point of including the additional section on European and Asian wildfires if you don't also draw lessons from these examples? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – reviewed and reworded – all fires that are not the Australian event have been removed
459	9	32	40	33	10	The scope of this section ideally would be broadened to more fully consider examples for other regions discussed in the case study, beyond Victoria. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – reviewed and reworded – all fires that are not the Australian event have been removed
460	9	32	42	32	42	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
461	9	33	4	33	4	Sentence duplicate p31 142; please remove. It appears to be out of context here anyway. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
462	9	33	4	33	10	This concluding paragraph needs revision to improve language: "Political issues...should be committed...?", "create extreme related plan", "effective risk management...should keen in focus." (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	reworded
463	9	33	24	34	26	The references for Bureau of Meteorology 2009 and National Climate Centre 2009 are the same publication. (Trewin, Blair, Australian Bureau of Meteorology)	Bureau of Meteorology removed – well spotted!
464	9	34	49	34	50	For TNC (The Nature Conservancy) (2004): The link provided for this reference does not link directly to the document cited. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
465	9	35	14	0	0	Case Study 9.2.6: This title is misleading because you combine a case-study of a region, with a case-study of a certain extreme impact/phenomenon. Mongolia is far from the Arctic Circle so this makes little sense. It might be better to simply use: 'Complex Cold Climate Impacts - The Arctic and Mongolia'. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed -. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on cold and recommended that the case study be split into Dzud and cold vulnerabilities in Northern Canada (see Case Study number 9.2.10. In addition, a common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed. This approach made it possible to focus on more detailed study of selected cases of cold.
466	9	35	14	38	32	This discussion does not appear to be about extreme events. It seems to be mostly about a shift in the climatic norms. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed -. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on cold and recommended that the case study be split into Dzud and cold vulnerabilities in Northern Canada (see Case Study number 9.2.10. In addition, a common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed. This approach made it possible to focus on more detailed study of selected cases of cold.
467	9	35	18	35	27	This paragraph does not properly reflect the demonstrated and documented resilience of northern communities to historical climate variability. There is an abundant literature testifying to this, including major assessment reports, references therein and studies published in recent years. A starting point could be Furgal and Prowse (2008), which also includes positions of northern aboriginal organizations regarding adaptation and resilience. Concern about the pace of climate change in recent years and about projected climate changes are real, as are the challenges these pose for adaptation, but this paragraph should present a more balanced perspective on the resilience of northern communities. (CANADA)	Addressed

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
468	9	35	18	38	22	The case study component on "The Canadian North" requires several improvements. First, authors should ensure the elimination of factual errors. For example, it states that "The northern territories in Canada have witnessed the demise of several ice roads – important transportation arteries that ensure supplies and contact with the rest of the country..." (page 35, lines 31-33). Ice roads are a mode of transport only common in the Northwest Territories. Authors may be extending the definition of "northern Canada" to northern portions of provinces, some of which have networks of WINTER roads, not ice roads. Second, significant improvements in referencing are necessary. References to climate science and other observations of natural science disciplines attributed to NRTEE, 2009 are misleading. The National Round Table on the Environment and the Economy is a policy advisory agency and would not have generated projections of climate parameters, for example, We would have summarized these projections, citing their original sources. The NRTEE's original contribution was in analysing the potential for insurance, codes and standards, and disaster management to drive climate change adaptation of infrastructure in Canada's North. The reference to Infrastructure Canada 2006 is similarly questionable. The authors of this case study component should ensure references draw on original sources, as much as possible. Third, the case study would also benefit from a more comprehensive depiction of federal actions supporting infrastructure resilience, including the work funded by Indian and Northern Affairs Canada and Natural Resources Canada. Much of this support has targeted building adaptive capacity overall and promoted cross-scale collaboration, both of which are important to highlight. Fourth, it's not apparent how this case study component helps illuminate lessons on managing climate extremes. Did the authors consider focusing on one or two specific snow storms with particularly disruptive cascading impacts (forensic analysis)? (Eyzaguirre, Jimena, National Round Table on the Environment and the Economy)	Addressed
469	9	35	19	35	19	contribute to this trend' - what trend are you referring to here? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
470	9	35	19	35	19	Delete word 'trend' from sentence two. There is no trend presented in the first sentence. (CANADA)	Addressed
471	9	35	19	35	20	How to develop a relationship with built environment and nature??? Suggest to delete the sentence about the "the special relationship that develops between the residents...their built environment and nature". Propose to just write that "people living in such harsh environments adapt to the local conditions".... (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
472	9	35	22	35	23	1. Three of the four references provided focus on infrastructure, yet the statement is much broader, referring to both structures and patterns of foraging or cultivation . Ford et al (2010) should presumably be Ford and Pearce (2010). References are required in support of the statement about foraging etc. - noting that the list should include hunting, which is a key source of food in many communities. 2. The sentence further states that these patterns have been built and developed to suit the current climate. This statement does not reflect the history of Arctic peoples and the flexibility that had to be demonstrated by them to adapt hunting and foraging patterns to large natural climate variability. (CANADA)	Addressed
473	9	35	23	35	23	The citation for Ford (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
474	9	35	24	35	25	This sentence refers only to climate-specific designs and therefore does not link appropriately to preceding sentence which also referred to patterns of foraging and cultivation. (CANADA)	Addressed
475	9	35	25	35	27	It may be stated what changes and impacts are occurring in a "faster rate than residents can adapt to". (NORWAY)	Addressed - deleted
476	9	35	27	35	27	It would be helpful to define which nation. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
477	9	35	27	35	27	The citation for Ford (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
478	9	35	29	35	29	"their adaptive capacity" -- Unclear, are you referring to the adaptive capacity of the people living in these regions? Please clarify. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed-deleted
479	9	35	30	0	0	A one word description of Dzund is needed, similar but shorter to the one given on Page 38 Line 26-27 (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Addressed-comment reflected in rewriting
480	9	35	30	35	30	You should here include a very brief description in brackets of what 'Dzud' is, eg, 'Dzud (unusually difficult winter conditions)'. This will be an unfamiliar term for many readers. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed- added
481	9	35	31	35	31	The statement that adaptation is already required, given the definition of adaptation in the SREX glossary, implies that climate change is already affecting the phenomena described in this case study. At least in the case of dzud, the effects of climate change on the extreme event have not been effectively demonstrated in the case study, suggesting that this statement should be revised to more clearly reflect the current state of understanding. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed-consulted with chapter 3 for information about climate change and comment reflected in rewriting

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
482	9	35	32	35	34	1. No references are provided for the statement that the northern territories have witnessed the demise of several ice roads. Indeed the literature that is available does not support that statement. The winter road issue (including ice roads) is discussed by Furgal and Prowse (2008) who note that there has been no trend analysis of opening and closing dates, but there is evidence of reduced trucking periods and issues of weight loads related to ice thickness. Demise denotes termination of ice roads, and there are no major roads where this has happened. 2. "Similarly" is not an appropriate way to start the second sentence because the ice roads in Arctic Canada are not related to hunting, foraging and agricultural traditions. (CANADA)	Addressed-deleted
483	9	35	41	38	21	Suggest including a discussion on the role of performance monitoring. For major structures, monitoring is essential to determine whether the structure is functioning as intended and to determine whether intervention is necessary if there are issues. This is something that needs to be done whether a changing climate may have impacts or not. It is even more important if changes in climate can impact performance. This was discussed to some extent in Canadian Standards Association (2010) and Furgal and Prowse (2008). The importance of monitoring is highlighted for the case of the Norman Wells oil pipeline NWT, Canada and other related publications (see below) also discuss the importance of monitoring. Suggested references: Canadian Standards Association, 2010. Technical Guide - Infrastructure in permafrost: a guideline for climate change adaptation. Canadian Standards Association Special Publication, Plus 4011-10; Furgal, C., and Prowse 2008. Northern Canada. In From Impacts to Adaptation: Canada in a changing climate 2007. Government of Canada, Ottawa. pp. 57-118; Naviq Consulting Inc. and AMEC Earth & Environmental, 2007. Monograph on the Norman Wells Pipeline Geotechnical Design and Performance -2006 Update, Geological Survey of Canada Open File 5702; Burgess, M.M., Oswald, J. and Smith, S.L., 2010. Government-industry collaborative monitoring of a pipeline in permafrost – the Norman Wells Pipeline experience, Canada, GEO2010, 63rd Canadian Geotechnical Conference and the 6th Canadian Permafrost Conference. GEO2010 Calgary Organizing Committee, Calgary, Sept 2010, pp. 579-586. (CANADA)	NOT ADDRESSED – not considered appropriate for this study.
484	9	35	41	38	21	An issue that should be mentioned here is the lack of data for northern regions. For example, long-term climate records are somewhat sparse. If only short or incomplete records are available this presents difficulties in determining design storm events for municipal engineering design - e.g., how do you characterize the variability in precipitation or determine the 100 year flood when rainfall and stream flow records are limited? How do you deal with the uncertainty in these values in design? (CANADA)	NOT ADDRESSED – not considered appropriate for this study.
485	9	35	41	45	41	Title of the subsection ("The Canadian North") is inconsistent with the title of the Case Study ("The Arctic") -- suggest to use consistent expressions. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
486	9	35	44	35	46	It should be clarified what is meant by "the most extreme projections." For example, are the projections for most rapid mean temperature increase intended? In addition, it would be preferable to also consider and cite relevant findings in chapter 3. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed-deleted
487	9	35	45	35	45	Recent Arctic temperature rise is far greater in magnitude than the trend in global mean temperature; how can it also then be described as consistent with the global trend? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
488	9	35	45	35	46	This sentence states that arctic regions have been warming 'faster than the most extreme projections had predicted' and cites Environment Canada, 2010 and Anisimov et al., 2007. There is no reference for Environment Canada (2010) in the reference list. If it is referring to Auld, Heather, 2010 then an alternative reference is required since Auld, 2010, refers to a PowerPoint presentation which is not an acceptable reference for an IPCC document. Furthermore, specific reference should be provided to where in Anisimov et al, 2007, this statement is supported since we could not find such a statement in this reference (Polar region chapter of the IPCC AR4) and are not aware of any work to substantiate this claim. (CANADA)	Addressed –reference is 15.2 current sensitivity and vulnerability
489	9	35	46	35	46	The statement "faster than the most extreme projections had predicted" is contradictory in itself. Projections are not predictions and thus projections can't predict anything. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed-deleted
490	9	35	46	35	46	The source Environment Canada (2010) is referenced heavily throughout this case study, but it is not included in the list of references. If the reference is the PowerPoint presentation listed in footnote 1, then suggest deleting and using more credible publications throughout. (CANADA)	Addressed-deleted
491	9	35	46	35	46	Projected, not predicted. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed-deleted
492	9	35	46	35	46	The citation for Environment Canada (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed-deleted
493	9	35	47	35	47	A reference for the Arctic assessment is needed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed-there was always one

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
494	9	35	47	35	48	Again, we could find no such statement in the ACIA report and it is certainly not a prominent finding of the report. On the contrary, in various places in the ACIA report there was a much more nuanced discussion of projections for arctic sea ice and implications for navigation across the Arctic Ocean. If anything, the ACIA stressed that the Northern Sea Route was likely to be ice free in some seasons earlier than the NWP and that the NWP would continue to experience hazardous ice conditions for some time. This same message was confirmed in the Northern Chapter of the report From Impacts to Adaptation: Canada in a Changing Climate, 2007. Government of Canada. 2008 (Furgal and Prowse, 2008). (CANADA)	Addressed
495	9	35	49	35	50	Suggest changing to "a number of communities in the North". Not all the communities are at the same level of vulnerability and some of them have capacity to adapt more quickly than others. References would be beneficial here. (CANADA)	Addressed
496	9	35	50	35	50	This trend will likely continue' - Do you mean this as a formally assessed IPCC likelihood statement. If so, then you need to cite the range of literature upon which this statement has been based. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
497	9	35	50	35	50	Referring to comment on lines 25 - 27 in same page: It may be stated what aspects of the human societies in this areas that is not able to "adapt quickly enough" (NORWAY)	Addressed
498	9	35	50	35	50	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
499	9	35	51	35	54	1. NRTEE (2009) is not a suitable reference for these sentences which present various projections of Arctic temperature rise in coming years - the primary sources for these statements must be provided. 2. In the sentence referring to winter temperature rise (of 3-11°C), no time period is specified and it is unclear if this projection is also for the next ten years (as in the previous sentence) or not. If for the more distant future, then information about the basis for this projection is required. 3. It is unclear what the statement about temperatures rising to as warm as -7°C in the far North refers to. (CANADA)	Addressed
500	9	35	51	36	1	It would be preferable to discuss trends over a longer time period given projections available to date. It is difficult for the reader to understand how the described trends will play out over longer time periods and how natural variability factors into these projections over the described ten-year time frame. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
501	9	35	52	35	52	annual average temperature is expected to rise between 1 and 3 degreeC' - For what region? The entire Arctic? What scenarios used? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
502	9	36	1	36	2	The north of the majority of provinces also need to adapt to significant changes. References would be beneficial here. (CANADA)	Addressed
503	9	36	4	36	5	Reference to a Conference PowerPoint presentation is not acceptable. (CANADA)	Addressed
504	9	36	4	36	5	This reference should be listed in the reference list instead of in a footnote. Please add the reference to the reference list, including information about the author, publication year and document title in addition to the URL, and remove the footnote. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
505	9	36	8	36	17	provide references for this section (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
506	9	36	10	36	17	Reference(s) needed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
507	9	36	11	0	0	"Amount of money" is an odd use of language, and does not capture the cost in terms of other costs beyond financial. Suggest changing "the amount of money that is required to operate and maintain structures" to "the cost of operating and maintaining structures". (CANADA)	Addressed
508	9	36	12	0	0	Insert the term "designed" before "lifespan". The infrastructure is designed to have a long life, but changes may modify the actual lifespan to be shorter. (CANADA)	Addressed
509	9	36	20	36	53	This section on permafrost thaw requires addition of text to discuss the fact that not all permafrost thaw is related to climate change and not all infrastructure damage is related to unexpected permafrost thaw. Although not explicitly stated, the text seems to imply that all the reported infrastructure damage can be related to climate change. (CANADA)	Addressed
510	9	36	22	36	23	Please provide reference for such a strong statement! (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
511	9	36	22	36	30	Do you mean to use 'likely' here as a formal calibrated IPCC likelihood term? If not, please replace with an alternative word. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
512	9	36	23	36	25	Note that one of the most important properties of the soil that will influence the impact of warming and thawing will be the ice-content - this does not appear to be mentioned anywhere. This is important because impacts will be greater in areas with ice-rich soil rather than in areas with ice-poor soils or underlain by bedrock. (CANADA)	Addressed
513	9	36	25	36	25	...soil underneath the permafrost' - this is a very strange expression. Better to say '...soil within the permafrost zone'. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
514	9	36	27	36	28	Suggest citing the original source of the work regarding the proportion of the Canadian permafrost zones that are sensitive to warming from Smith and Burgess (2004). The NRTEE document may have referred to this and presented the map (that is found in Smith and Burgess) but the original source is: Smith, S.L., and Burgess, M.M. 2004. Sensitivity of permafrost to climate warming in Canada. Geological Survey of Canada Bulletin 579. (CANADA)	Addressed
515	9	36	29	36	29	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
516	9	36	32	36	34	It is correct that permafrost thaw can result in some of the issues listed, but it is important to be careful about attributing the cause of the thaw only to climate change as it can be due to the construction and operation of the infrastructure itself, heated structures, heated buried pipes etc. (CANADA)	Thank you for this comment – this has been addressed
517	9	36	33	36	33	Please clarify: Nunavik is not a municipality but a region, managed by a regional government. (CANADA)	Addressed
518	9	36	45	0	0	Figure 9-2: Please explain in caption what the basis for this map is. Modelling? Borehole observations? Remote sensing? Is this figure necessary at all, i.e., is it important for the Case Study to have a map of the permafrost zones available. Probably not. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed-deleted
519	9	36	45	36	46	Suggest citing the original source of the referenced map: Heginbottom, J.A., Dubreuil, M.-A., and Harker, P.A. 1995. Canada -- Permafrost; National Atlas of Canada Ottawa: Geomatics Canada, National Atlas Information Service, and Geological Survey of Canada, Plate 2.1. (MCR 4177). (CANADA)	Addressed-deleted
520	9	36	48	36	53	This paragraph should clarify that maintenance of infrastructure is always going to be required whether the climate is stable or changing. (CANADA)	Addressed
521	9	36	49	36	51	The link provided for this reference is not active and we have not been able to obtain a copy, although we do note that it is a short (21 page) literature review. The authors should provide an assessment of the robustness of the stated cost figures in these sentences. It should also be made clear whether these cost figures apply to northern communities specifically or to Canadian communities as a whole (noting title of the report). (CANADA)	Addressed: http://cbtadaptation.squarespace.com/storage/CdnInfrastructureAdaptation-LiteratureReview.pdf
522	9	37	6	37	6	As well as NRTEE 2009, you should also cite Chapter 10 and 11 of the WGI AR4 here. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
523	9	37	6	37	7	A reference should be provided for number of public buildings that have been retrofitted since 2004, and clarification of the reasons. It is unlikely they all relate to snow loads (the subject of this subsection) (CANADA)	Addressed
524	9	37	8	37	8	The citation for Environment Canada (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
525	9	37	12	38	21	It is useful to illustrate the importance of collaboration between multiple orders of government in addressing climate change adaptation. Unfortunately, this section does not capture the relevant breadth and depth of such activities in Canada. Both Indian and Northern Affairs Canada and Health Canada have entire programs devoted to enhancing the capacity of northern communities to adapt to changing climate. The Nunavut Climate Change Partnership involves federal and territorial government departments in addressing community infrastructure resilience. Information of these programs is readily available on websites and conference proceedings. (CANADA)	Addressed
526	9	37	14	0	0	"Amount of money" is an odd use of language, and does not capture the cost in terms of other costs beyond financial. Suggest changing "The money required to relocate communities provides..." to "The cost of relocating communities provides..." (CANADA)	Addressed
527	9	37	21	0	0	The authors could add that Indian and Northern Affairs Canada (INAC) has a Climate Change Adaptation Program (CCAP). INAC's CCAP, Assisting Northerners in Assessing Key Vulnerabilities and Opportunities, supports Aboriginal and Northern communities, organizations and territories in addressing urgent risks in the North, where the impacts of a changing climate are already visible, and vulnerability of infrastructure is high. In doing this, CCAP empowers northern communities to develop and implement adaptation projects. See: http://www.ainc-inac.gc.ca/enr/clc/adp/ppccap/index-eng.asp (CANADA)	Addressed
528	9	37	21	37	34	The guidelines developed by the Canadian Environmental Assessment Agency for incorporation of climate change as well as other related documentation could also be mentioned here. See: R.J. 2000. Climate Change and Environmental Assessment Part 1: Review of Climate Change Considerations in Selected Past Environmental Assessments. Prepared for the Research and Development Monograph Series, 2000 (link on CEAA web site http://www.ceaa-acee.gc.ca/default.asp?lang=En&n=F2F22AF3-1&toc=show&offset=1) Federal-Provincial-Territorial Committee on Climate Change and Environmental Assessment 2003. Incorporating Climate Change Considerations in Environmental Assessment: General Guidance for Practitioners (Link on CEAA web site http://www.ceaa-acee.gc.ca/default.asp?lang=En&n=A41F45C5-1&offset=&toc=hide) (CANADA)	Addressed

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
529	9	37	24	37	25	While it may, on rare occasion, be appropriate to cite a personal communication in an IPCC report, in this case the reference should come from the National Research Council of Canada as the department with the mandate to develop the 2015 National Building Code. (CANADA)	Addressed
530	9	37	24	37	28	The reference supplied (Auld, 2011) is a "personal conversation", which is a not an appropriate reference for an IPCC assessment report. Paragraph reads as speculative without a proper reference. (CANADA)	Addressed
531	9	37	30	37	34	Environment Canada (2010) which appears to be a PowerPoint presentation, did not develop the guidelines for permafrost. This was done by the Canadian Standards Association Expert Panel. The references to Environment Canada (2010) should be removed and replaced with the correct citation for the actual document : Canadian Standards Association, 2010. Technical Guide - Infrastructure in permafrost: a guideline for climate change adaptation. Canadian Standards Association Special Publication, Plus 4011-10. (CANADA)	Addressed
532	9	37	30	37	34	It is important to note that engineers have always had to deal with the challenges presented by permafrost including thaw. Climate change is another issue that must be considered. Techniques were developed over the last 50-60 years to deal with changing permafrost conditions. These include avoidance of ice-rich soil in site selection, using insulation (gravel pads etc.), removing problem soils, building on piles anchored in bedrock or thaw stable material etc. E.g., see Furgal and Prowse (2008) for a discussion of this and links to other references: Furgal, C., and Prowse 2008. Northern Canada. In From Impacts to Adaptation: Canada in a changing climate 2007. Government of Canada, Ottawa. pp. 57-118. (CANADA)	Addressed
533	9	37	31	37	31	The citation for Environment Canada (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
534	9	37	34	37	34	The citation for Environment Canada (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
535	9	37	47	37	48	Suggest the use of a different source to explain how thermosyphons work. They extract heat from the ground during the winter which lowers the mean annual ground temperature and reduces the amount of thawing that occurs. They do not work by allowing the building to be placed directly on the ground. They work through the means of convection, i.e. there is a fluid inside that circulates that extracts heat from the ground, evaporates and then flows above the ground where it condenses and releases the heat, changing to a liquid which can flow back down into the ground (i.e. it is a heat exchanger). There are several references such as the Canadian Standards Association Plus 4011-10 document that provides a better description of how thermosyphons work than Environment Canada (2010) which is a powerpoint presentation that should not be cited (See: Canadian Standards Association, 2010. Technical Guide - Infrastructure in permafrost: a guideline for climate change adaptation. Canadian Standards Association Special Publication, Plus 4011-10). (CANADA)	Addressed
536	9	37	48	37	48	The citation for Environment Canada (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
537	9	37	52	37	52	The citation for Environment Canada (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
538	9	37	52	37	53	This statement that thermosyphons can only be used to protect against thaw in building foundations is not true. There are numerous examples of thermosyphons used for various other types of infrastructure such as frozen cored dams (eg Ekati), along railways (Railway in northern Manitoba that goes to Churchill), parking lots and water storage tanks (See Smith et al. 2001 for examples). They have been used in the vertical support members for the Alaska oil pipeline (e.g. see Johnson and Hegdal 2008) References: Johnson, E.R. and Hegdal, L.A., 2008. Permafrost-related performance of the Trans Alaska Oil Pipeline. In: D.L. Kane and K.M. Hinkel (Editors), Ninth International Conference on Permafrost. Institute of Northern Engineering, University of Alaska Fairbanks, Fairbanks, Alaska, pp. 857-864. Smith, S.L., Burgess, M.M. and Heginbottom, J.A., 2001. Permafrost in Canada, a challenge to northern development. In: G.R. Brooks (Editor), A Synthesis of Geological Hazards in Canada. Geological Survey of Canada Bulletin 548, pp. 241-264. (CANADA)	Addressed
539	9	37	53	37	53	The citation for Environment Canada (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
540	9	38	1	38	17	Techniques to deal with permafrost thaw have existed for quite some time. These included elevated foundations (on piles etc.). Relevant references have already been provided in other comments. (CANADA)	Addressed
541	9	38	2	0	0	Suggest the authors include some examples of proactive adaptation strategies. Proactive adaptation involves long term decision making which improves the ability to cope with future climate change. For example, periodic assessment and risk management strategies help make this response the most effective. Proactive adaptation is more likely to reduce the long term damage, risk and vulnerability due to climate change. Several examples of proactive adaptation actions already exist (http://www.ainc-inac.gc.ca/enr/clc/adp/ppccap/index-eng.asp). (CANADA)	Addressed

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
542	9	38	6	38	6	Naming the territories would be helpful for the subsequent text. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
543	9	38	10	38	10	The URL provided here should only be listed in the case study's reference list, not in the text. Please remove the link at this location. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
544	9	38	12	38	12	The citation for NRCAN (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
545	9	38	16	38	16	The citation 'USARC, 2003' differs from the citation 'US Arctic Research Commission, 2003' on page 35, line 23; even though both citations presumably refer to the same reference in the case study's reference list. Please harmonize the way this source is cited in both locations. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
546	9	38	17	38	17	The citation for Johnson et al. (2000) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
547	9	38	19	38	21	These general statements are very broad and do not clearly link to the discussion in the preceding paragraphs. Those list specific actions taking place, but do not address strengths and weaknesses in adaptive capacity per se. Suggest either focusing this final paragraph or deleting it. (CANADA)	Addressed
548	9	38	24	38	24	suggest to use consistent title with what is used in the title of the Case Study itself (which we suggest to change in order to highlight the region instead of the physical event [or perhaps both] (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on cold and recommended that the case study be split into Dzud and cold vulnerabilities in Northern Canada (see Case Study number 9.2.10. In addition, a common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed.
549	9	38	24	38	24	The term Dzud could be explained in the title to avoid the misunderstanding that Dzud is an area, not an extreme event. (NORWAY)	Dzud is explained in the paragraph in the introduction and background – we consider this is the best place to address this comment
550	9	38	24	40	38	I understood that the collapse of communism in Mongolia increased vulnerability to dzud because of a) ending of fuel subsidies and greater costs of lorry transport of feed b) increase in land disputes between and within sums, and c) desire of families to return to 5-species herding, which was more labour intensive and more vulnerable. Unfortunately i do not have references to these to hand. I also understood that drought increased dzud impact because there was less chance that standing grass would be visible over snow. Arshard sayeed 2010 is not in the references - other references on insurance by Jerry Skees could be cited. (Morton, John, Natural Resources Institute, University of Greenwich)	Dzud case study reflects many of this helpful comments – but for space reasons not all – references are now complete and up to date
551	9	38	42	38	42	What's the temperature range presented here representing: spatial and/or temporal variability? Scenario sensitivity? Other sources of Uncertainties? Please clarify. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – reworded to reflect comment
552	9	38	43	38	43	Typo in citation: For Jigmiddroj (2010), the author's name is spelled differently in the chapter text, as compared to the case study's reference list. Please ensure correct spelling of the author's name in both the text and the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – but this paper has not been published yet – won't be until October 2011 - so not used in case study and therefore not listed in references
553	9	38	46	0	0	8,711 households had lost all their animals is not a right depiction of the situation. This figure is important if these households are specifically reliant on animals for livelihood. Owning a single animal with major sources of income other than animals may add one household to this figure. These figures should me mentioned only for herding households (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Addressed – case study reworded to reflect this comment
554	9	39	7	39	26	It would be helpful to discuss the extent to which recovery occurs between dzud events. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - the case study has been reviewed to reflect this comment as well as a common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed and this is now included clearly.
555	9	39	17	39	17	The citation for Dzud Impact (2004) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - reworded
556	9	39	17	39	17	The citation 'AIACC (2006)' differs from the citation 'AIACC AS06, 2006' on page 35, line 38; even though both citations presumably refer to the same reference in the case study's reference list. Please harmonize the way this source is cited in both locations. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – reworded and recited correctly
557	9	39	18	0	0	The increment over the previous year is important and not simply the incidence of poverty in 2002-03 (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Addressed - reworded
558	9	39	19	39	19	The citation for JEMR (2004) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - recited

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
559	9	39	29	39	35	This small subsection should explain the basis for expectations about whether the Dzud will be more or less frequent. It should probably be moved to immediately after the section that explains what a Dzud is on page 38. The existing section is too vague, but it seems to be saying that the Dzud will get worse, while presenting specific projections that seem to imply it might get better. Will warmer temperatures cause a more snowy autumn? Or perhaps less snow which would be good? Will the extreme cold temperatures be less of a problem? What do we mean by "drifting windstorms" and how might their severity be affected by the climate projections? Might they be less severe to earlier snow melt and a less snowpack? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	addressed -. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to revise the section on cold and recommended that the case study be split into Dzud and cold vulnerabilities in Northern Canada (see Case Study number 9.2.10). In addition, a common structure of representation of research in chapter nine has also been agreed. This approach made it possible to focus on more detailed study of selected cases of cold.
560	9	39	31	39	35	This first paragraph is not accurate, very vague, and needs rewriting. Line 31: 'Climate change models project..' - Which models? For which region? Which scenarios? What time period?. This paragraph should be written based on the projections given in Chapter 11 of the WGI AR4 (Table 11.1), where for a high-end emission scenario, a mean annual temperature increase of 3.3 - 3.8 degreesC is projected by the end of the 21st century for this region of Asia. Winter precipitation is projected to increase in the range of 10 - 19%. However, summer precipitation is also projected to increase, so you CAN NOT say that increased drought conditions are expected in summer in Mongolia. Chapter 3 of SREX state that there is 'low confidence' in any projected changes in drought in this region. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - reworded
561	9	39	31	39	35	The time frame and relevant assumptions (emissions scenarios, geographic location, etc.) for the projections described in this paragraph need to be clearly specified, with references provided for all sentences. Ideally, a range of projections, appropriately reflecting the relevant uncertainties, should be presented, rather than an isolated projection without assumptions characterized. The connection between any described projections and the occurrence of dzuds also needs to be clearly presented; if projections for dzuds themselves are not available, the author team needs to make this explicit. Additionally, the connection between the first two sentences must be substantiated: how do projections for increasing temperature and winter precipitation indicate an expected increase in drought conditions and storms? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – reworded to reflect this comment
562	9	39	47	40	38	Is there a logic for the order 'national level -> local level -> international level'? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed – reworded to reflect this comment
563	9	40	3	40	3	It would be preferable to indicate more clearly who is attempting, with limited success, to convince to public of the utility of such adaptation funding. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - reworded
564	9	40	22	40	24	Something is missing in this sentence. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
565	9	40	33	40	33	Which UN agencies were partners? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
566	9	40	36	40	36	Components of the project is unclear. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
567	9	40	38	40	38	The citation for Arshad Sayed (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
568	9	40	51	40	51	It's disconcerting seeing a personal conversation included in a list of references in an IPCC report. If it is to be included, one might record with whom Ms Auld had the conversation. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Addressed - deleted
569	9	40	51	40	51	Referring to a personal communication is not acceptable, please remove! (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
570	9	41	13	41	14	For Infrastructure Canada (2006): This listed source is not available at the link provided. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
571	9	41	18	41	19	Referring to an unpublished paper is not an option, please remove, unless it is in press with a peer-reviewed journal by the SREX cut-off date for accepted papers. Would have been useful to provide information about where it has been submitted to. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
572	9	41	53	41	53	This reference could not be found (wrong link) (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
573	9	42	2	42	2	What is a Working paper? Where can a reader locate this? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
574	9	42	8	0	0	This is overall a very nice example of a useful Case Study. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Thanks.
575	9	42	16	42	30	Please provide references for this section. There is only a single reference provided on line 20. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Additional citations added.
576	9	42	18	42	30	It is important to discuss climate, in addition to weather here. In many places where weather or weather events are mentioned, "weather and climate" and "weather and climate events" may be more appropriate. Additionally, more citations are needed throughout the paragraph. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Thanks. The text has been changed to incorporate this feedback.
577	9	42	23	42	30	Reference(s) needed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Citations added.
578	9	42	24	42	30	Greater details need to be provided on the mechanisms linking the mentioned trends related to climate and to climate-related stressors with impacts for the disease outcomes. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The text has been recast to focus more immediately on cholera and highlight the interactions between social and political vulnerability and disease.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
579	9	42	26	42	26	delete "and" after "widespread"; suggest to add reference to SREX Chapter 3 when stating that "climate continues to change". (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Done.
580	9	42	50	42	51	You need to expand on this statement, and based on the projections provided by Chapter 3, be specific on how climate change will increase cholera risk. For example, due to projected 'likely' increase in frequency of heavy precipitation over many areas of the globe, in particular (and very relevant for Cholera) in tropical regions (Table 3.1, Chapter 3). (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	This internal reference has been made.
581	9	42	50	42	51	A citation should be provided for this sentence. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Citation added.
582	9	43	3	43	5	The presentation of risk as a function of hazard, vulnerability, and exposure needs to be consistent with the glossary entries for these terms. For example, the glossary entry for vulnerability does not include exposure as a subcomponent. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Exposure has been separated out from the formula and treated as a distinct variable. Vulnerability has been decomposed into susceptibility and adaptive capacity.
583	9	43	3	43	5	This is not the definition of vulnerability used in the SREX. This definition of vulnerability comes from a natural hazards perspective where vulnerability is viewed as the future residual damage after all factors and possible actions are taken into account. A simple example is future hurricane hazard for a particular location, where what is considered to be vulnerable (from this perspective) is the damage that could occur after considering the magnitude/extent of the hurricane, the sensitivity of communities/ecosystems, and the actions that could be taken in advance to reduce hurricane damage. This is not the perspective of most sectors, where vulnerability is a description of the current state, independent of the magnitude/extent of climate change. From this perspective, climate interacts with vulnerability to create impacts. Vulnerability studies in health, agriculture, ecosystems, etc. focus on the factors that increase/decrease the response of people/ecosystems to a particular hazard. For example, populations with greater proportions of adults over the age of 65 are more vulnerable to heatwaves, independent of whether or not there is a heatwave. Adaptive capacity is an estimate of the potential of people/communities/ecosystems/etc. to avoid, prepare for, and respond to climate change risks. That potential depends on current vulnerability. A simple example is that Bangladesh has a current high burden of diarrheal diseases, in large part because of limited access to safe water and improved sanitation. That lack of water/sanitation security decreases the adaptive capacity of Bangladesh to effectively manage additional cases of diarrheal diseases due to climate change. For impacts researchers, vulnerability is often a more important driver of impacts than the hazards of climate change. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Respectfully, this formula does not contradict the SREX definition of vulnerability (the propensity or predisposition to be adversely affected), nor does it necessarily reflect an emphasis on future shifts in hazard distribution instead of vulnerability in the present state. While the formula itself does originate in the natural hazards literature, it is applicable to study of impacts in other sectors and flexible in re: to current versus future vulnerability. To wit, the example used in this comment seems to support the points made in the case study: that vulnerability increases impacts and these impacts erode adaptive capacity.
584	9	43	25	43	25	Do you mean 'Likelihood of exposure'? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Yes. This change has been made.
585	9	44	22	0	0	Figure 9-3 and 9-4: suggest that these two figures are presented as parts A and B of a single figure. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	See below.
586	9	44	22	44	26	Figures 9.3 and 9.4: those two figures could easily be combined in one figure with two panels. In additional, it would be extremely useful (and much less confusing) if the two figures covered the same area instead of Fig. 9.4 focusing on Zimbabwe only, while Figure 9.3 is covering a much larger area. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	We will discuss with the graphics personnel to determine if these figures can be combined as suggested.
587	9	44	31	44	35	Would perhaps make sense to provide some selected references already here in this introductory para. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Citation added.
588	9	44	31	44	35	Citations for information in this paragraph should be provided as appropriate. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Additional citations added.
589	9	44	40	44	44	Citations for information in this paragraph should be provided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Additional citations added.
590	9	45	12	45	14	Specific relevant sections in chapters 1 and 8 should be referenced here. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Internal citations added.
591	9	45	13	45	13	what evidence is there that climate change increases variability? What do you mean with this statement? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Wording clarified.
592	9	45	30	47	2	The reference list includes 25 references that contain 'et al.'. All author names should be listed here for those references, without use of "et al." Please add the other author names to all those references in the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This has been changed.
593	9	45	43	45	43	For Colwell, R. (1996): The information on this reference is incomplete. Please add the missing information for this reference, e.g. the title of the journal article. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This has been changed.
594	9	46	35	46	36	What is the title of the publication? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The title of the publication is now provided.
595	9	47	5	0	0	Case Study 9.2.8: the text and statements in this case study need to be much better linked with the overall SREX assessment, in particular with Chapter 3 and 4. Instead of reassessing what is provided in Chapter 3 and 4, reference should be made to those chapters (see further comments below) (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	This has been addressed in the new draft, with references to Chapter 3 included
596	9	47	5	0	0	Need to define "Coastal Mega-Cities" and to clarify the focus of this particular case study. Different subsections deal with "Megadeltas", simply "Cities", or "Coastal Cities"...please ensure consistency in terminology. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	This has been addressed in the new draft, which focuses specifically on one city, Mumbai, rather than megacities as a category—the emphasis is on the particular city rather than the general category

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
597	9	47	5	0	0	Case study 9.2.8. This is not a case study. It is a review of some issues with cities, most of which was taken from the AR4. The SREX builds on the AR4 so that information can be deleted. The material here needs to be rewritten to provide a case study, with appropriate referencing. The conclusions are unsupported by the previous text. Material that is not relevant to the case study should be deleted. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This has been addressed in the new draft, with a specific focus on Mumbai
598	9	47	9	47	9	Reword: "Cities are one of the major contributors towards anthropogenic climate change due to.....". Cities can not be acting as drivers. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	This sentence is no longer included in the case study.
599	9	47	9	47	16	Because the section is about coastal megacities, the summary totals for all cities are inapposite--unless the section also provides comparable data for the coastal megacities. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The case study has been reworked to address this issue and this has been supported by the TSU
600	9	47	11	47	12	Please double check this data from WWF (2009). I read in a conference proceeding published by the University of Tokyo that "Over half of the world's population is concentrated in urban areas covering just 4 percent of the world's surface" Source: http://icus.iis.u-tokyo.ac.jp/USMCA2010/USMCA_2010_Recommendations.pdf . Since WWF is saying 1%, whereas University of Tokyo saying 4% of the earth surface is covered by urban areas, I suggest that this should be cross-checked. (Surjan, Akhilesh, United Nations University)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
601	9	47	13	47	13	Delete 'man-made'. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
602	9	47	16	47	28	A definition of low-lying would be useful. Would that include "coastal" cities like Los Angeles which is mostly quite high? What about Chicago or Cleveland? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Since this case study is now much more focused on once city, I think this ambiguity has been cleared up, especially since the case now refers to sections of Mumbai that have been built on marginal land that has been reclaimed
603	9	47	17	47	19	provide references supporting the statement about "...increasingly vulnerable due to climate change, which has heightened the risk of disasters to cities and neighbouring regions". Refer to appropriate SREX Chapter 4 sections. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
604	9	47	20	47	22	This statement is not entirely in agreement with Ch.3. In particular, the frequency of tropical cyclones is not projected to increase. (Kossin, James, NOAA / NESDIS / National Climatic Data Center)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains: the new case draws upon and refers to Chapter 3 when discussing potential climate change impacts
605	9	47	20	47	22	This statement needs to be reworded to be consistent with the projections given in Chapter 3. For tropical cyclones, as a global average, maximum wind speeds are expected to increase (but not in all regions), and related rainfall rates are expected to increase. BUT, there is no expected increase in the frequency of cyclones. Please refer to, and cite chapter 3 (Table 3.1). (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains: the new case draws upon and refers to Chapter 3 when discussing potential climate change impacts
606	9	47	20	47	22	This sentence should consider and cite relevant sections and assessment findings from chapter 3 and 4. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains: the new case draws upon and refers to Chapter 3 when discussing potential climate change impacts
607	9	47	22	0	0	Tropical cyclones are not expected to increase in frequency - see chapter 3. (Nicholls, Neville, Monash University, School of Geography & Environmental Science)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains: the new case draws upon and refers to Chapter 3 when discussing potential climate change impacts
608	9	47	24	47	24	delete "the IPCC concludes" -- you are citing here one particular Chapter of the WGII assessment report authored by Nicholls et al. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	This has been addressed in the new draft, with references to Chapter 3 included.
609	9	47	24	47	24	Typo in citation: For Nichols et al. (2007), the author's name is spelled differently in the chapter text, as compared to the case study's reference list. Please ensure correct spelling of the author's name in both the text and the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
610	9	47	27	47	28	Where is the connection to coastal mega-cities? You need to link this impact on ecosystems with impact on megacities if this sentence is to remain. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
611	9	47	30	47	31	What have you based this very high confidence statement on? Such statements need to be based on a range of carefully assessed literature and it is not possible that such an assessment can be given in the case-studies chapter. If this statement is based on the assessment given in another chapter, please cite this chapter (e.g., if appropriate Chapter 4). (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	This has been addressed in the new draft, with references to Chapter 3 included.
612	9	47	30	47	31	This statement should be rephrased to indicate the connection between extreme weather and climate events (hazards) and climate change itself. Is the intent here to indicate that cities and settlements are vulnerable to extreme weather and climate events? Vulnerability to extreme events is not an alternative to vulnerability to gradual climate change; rather, vulnerability in these contexts is intrinsically linked because trends in extreme events are influenced by climate change. Additionally, assuming the confidence assignment here has been made by the author team, it needs to be clearly linked to a traceable account--that is, to the author team's evaluation of evidence and agreement per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
613	9	47	30	47	32	Delete this incomplete list of extremes - at this stage of the report, the reader is well aware of what is meant by 'extremes' and you have the opportunity later within this case study to be specific. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
614	9	47	33	47	33	Typo in citation: For Willbank et al. (2007), the author's name is spelled differently in the chapter text, as compared to the case study's reference list. Please ensure correct spelling of the author's name in both the text and the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
615	9	47	38	47	39	I am not sure if use of the word "Slum" is appropriate in this sentence "People living in slums and including those without adequate urban infrastructure.....". I am afraid that even those people who do not live in slums (but live in 'houses with non-engineered construction' or people living in houses construction with RCC but located in low-lying areas, in flood plains, near the natural drains...an so on) are equally (sometime more) vulnerable. (Surjan, Akhilesh, United Nations University)	The use of "slum" is retained since the published literature upon which the case study has been developed uses the term universally, as does the Government of India
616	9	47	38	47	39	The first sentence of this paragraph would benefit from a citation. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
617	9	47	41	47	46	It's not quite clear how the Chinese Eco-Cities mentioned here relate to the Coastal Mega-Cities the Case Study is about. Is any of these Eco-Cities a former/current Coastal Mega-City. Please clarify the connection and make it clear, if necessary, what developing an Eco-City from a Mega-City means compared to just developing an Eco-City from any other (small) City. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
618	9	47	42	47	42	Is there any accepted definition of "eco-cities". The examples cited from Chinese cities as "eco-cities" make wrong impression. It is better to use the word "energy-efficient cities". However, if these cities have also paid attention to urban ecosystem restoration, followed community partnership for addressing neighborhood environmental issues, have education programs for schools on environment.....and so on, we may consider them as "eco-cities". (Surjan, Akhilesh, United Nations University)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
619	9	47	48	47	48	The Copenhagen is by no means a peer-reviewed document and thus we propose to be very cautious when relying any parts of the assessment on this document. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
620	9	47	48	47	48	The citation for Copenhagen Diagnosis (2009) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
621	9	47	48	47	52	What is meant by "happening more rapidly" should be indicated more clearly and specifically. It would also be preferable to cite additional peer-reviewed sources that support this statement. Finally, it seems that a risk management approach is appropriate regardless of whether changes are happening more rapidly than projected, and therefore the logic of the sentence seems faulty. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
622	9	47	49	47	49	"predictions" - should be "projections"; what earlier projections are you referring to here? Please specify. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
623	9	47	50	47	50	Refer to previous Chapter in the SREX when stating that "Adaptation strategiesneed to be a priority" in order to strengthen the point. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
624	9	48	3	48	3	Define Megadelta. Or should this simply say "Coastal Mega-Cities"? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
625	9	48	3	48	3	The title of this subsection implies that multiple cities will be considered, at odds with a discussion focused on Katrina. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
626	9	48	6	48	7	Please add "and on the timing and magnitude of climate and weather extremes" -- The "challenge for megadeltas" will probably not only depend on the adoption of appropriate adaptation measures but also on the level of climate change/extremes. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
627	9	48	8	48	9	"expected to become more common IN SOME REGIONS with climate change (see 3.4.4)" You must be consistent and cite Chapter 3 here. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
628	9	48	8	48	9	The description of trends in cyclone activity *must* consider and cite the assessment findings of chapter 3. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
629	9	48	11	48	12	The time frame of these changes should be specified. Also, the type of seasonal storm being referred to here should be clarified. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
630	9	48	15	48	16	"A number of studies....." - please cite these studies. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
631	9	48	16	48	17	Typo in citation: For Willbanks et al. (2007), the author's name is spelled differently in the chapter text, as compared to the case study's reference list. Please ensure correct spelling of the author's name in both the text and the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
632	9	48	20	48	20	Is this now about "Cities" in general or about "Mega-Cities" (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
633	9	48	22	48	22	What is ADB and JICA?? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
634	9	48	22	48	29	This section contains several confusion and/or wrong statements: what does it mean that "cities have been examined" -- examined for what?; replace "by the A1FI" with "using the A1FI..."; IPCC explicitly does not assign any likelihood to any of the 40 SRES scenarios, it is thus incorrect to state that these scenarios serve as "likely high-low" cases. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
635	9	48	22	48	37	Are you able to strengthen this information by citing additional literature? It is hard for the reader to judge the robustness of this information when it appears to come from a single study. Suggest to refer to Chapter 3 here, not for the cities specific projections, but for the overall projected and assessed changes. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
636	9	48	23	48	29	The time frames of projections described here should be specified. Also, what is meant by "high-low cases"? Finally, the use of "likely" on line 24 appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
637	9	48	24	48	24	Delete: 'as likely high-low cases'. Possible rewording would be 'as high and low-end emission scenarios'. But, readers should be familiar enough with the scenarios without this additional explanation. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
638	9	48	25	48	25	In relation to 24hr precipitation please cite Chapter 3 (Table 3.3). (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
639	9	48	27	48	27	IPCC models? - There are no IPCC models. The IPCC does not create, develop or run climate models. We assume you are referring to the suite of climate models contributing results to the CMIP3 archive, that were then assessed in IPCC AR4 (e.g. Meehl et al., 2007)? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
640	9	48	31	48	31	It should be clarified what is meant here by "different"--risk and vulnerability are different for a given city, or they differ across cities? (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
641	9	48	31	48	33	The magnitude of climate change and other assumptions pertaining to this projection should be specified. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
642	9	48	46	0	0	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
643	9	48	46	48	46	Do you mean to use 'likely' here as a formal calibrated IPCC likelihood term? If not, please replace with an alternative word. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
644	9	49	1	0	0	Table 9-4: The first column of this table 'Climate change increases hazards' must be deleted. These are not carefully assessed climate projections and the information is generalised and not useful. Chapter 3 is the location where the reader turns to for projected changes in hydro-meteorological hazards. The information in this column is not scientifically robust, and is inconsistent with the assessment of chapter 3. Delete. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
645	9	49	1	0	0	Table 9-4: Caption needs expansion - Are these adaptation options in general or relevant for a particular region? Are these adaptation options focussing on hydro-meteorological hazard only (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
646	9	49	4	49	18	"hard/soft defence" are used on line 4, but only defined on lines 8-10. Suggest to slightly rearrange the paragraph by moving the text on lines 8-12 starting with "Coastal protection..." down to "...including coral reefs and sea grasses" to the beginning of the paragraph. Then the para starts with what hard/soft defences are, continues with what coastal defences has traditionally done, and ends with the practical view. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
647	9	49	4	49	18	The section leaves the impression that the choice is either hard defense or natural resource protection. The option of elevating land grades also needs to be included. In the United States, the report known as CCSP SAP 4.1 elaborated in great detail the two alternative pathways for shore protection (hard protection and land surface elevation). See http://epa.gov/climatechange/effects/coastal/pdfs/CCSP_chapter6.pdf#page=5 . The specific citation is Titus, J.G. and M. Craghan, 2009: Shore protection and retreat. In: Coastal Sensitivity to Sea-Level Rise: A Focus on the Mid-Atlantic Region. A report by the U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research. [J.G. Titus (coordinating lead author), K.E. Anderson, D.R. Cahoon, D.B. Gesch, S.K. Gill, B.T. Gutierrez, E.R. Thieler, and S.J. Williams (lead authors)]. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington DC, pp. 87-104. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
648	9	49	6	49	6	Please cite a specific IPCC chapter. Suggest to reword "it was recognized in the IPCC" -- recognize is probably not the right word. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
649	9	49	23	49	25	suggest to delete the sentence highlighting the UN-HABITATs experiencing -- reads like a promotional statement for this organization. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
650	9	49	34	49	38	Are there more recent studies that can be cited here to strengthen this statement? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
651	9	49	41	50	15	This whole section does not provide anything like an assessment, it just states what a number of UN organizations are doing in the context of Cities and Climate. Is this highlighting of UN initiatives really relevant and appropriate in the context of a scientific assessment? Suggest to delete the 3 paragraphs or to at least change the focus from highlighting few UN-Initiatives to a more general discussion of what's possible/not possible (based on available peer-reviewed literature). (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
652	9	49	41	50	15	(1) Two major international initiatives are missing here. First one is: http://www.c40cities.org/ which is initiated under Clinton Climate Initiative. Second is CITYNET, an Asia-Pacific regional network of local authorities, with an agenda emphasizing urban development. CITYNET has over 100 members in about 20 countries. They have specific programs on disaster resilience and climate change (source: http://www.citynet-ap.org/programmes/). (2) Climate and Disaster Resilience Initiative may also find mention here (source: http://unfccc.int/files/adaptation/nairobi_work_programme/partners_and_action_pledges/application/pdf/kyotouni_furt_herinfo_100519.pdf) (3) Paper titled "Slum dwellers response to flooding events in the megacities of India" is also a very good case study (source: http://www.springerlink.com/content/m435w70170743277/) (Surjan, Akhilesh, United Nations University)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
653	9	49	49	49	50	What do you mean with 'global local government associations'? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
654	9	50	8	50	15	this needs to be placed in an updated time frame (Jeggle, Terry, University of Pittsburgh)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
655	9	50	20	50	20	Reword: "Coastal mega cities are one of the major contributors towards anthropogenic climate change but at the same time...." (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
656	9	50	20	50	20	worst victims' - This is a strong statement. Have you demonstrated this in the case study? Is this based on a quantitative measure? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
657	9	50	20	50	21	It would be preferable to be more specific about the nature of climate change impacts on coastal megacities. Instead of the phrase "worst victims," it would be helpful to use more precise language about the nature of the impacts, for example, because there are many ways to define "worst." (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
658	9	50	20	50	30	The assessment findings presented here could potentially be characterized by calibrated uncertainty language, especially summary terms for evidence and agreement and levels of confidence, per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties. We encourage the author team to consider assigning such calibrated language to findings here. The author team's degree of certainty in these statements is not clear and could be clarified with the use of calibrated language. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
659	9	50	22	50	23	It should be clarified what is meant by "felt indiscriminately" since impacts can be defined in different ways and since the nature of impacts will differ with geography and socioeconomic conditions. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
660	9	50	24	50	27	The sentence appears to be conveying a conclusion of the citation provided, but the author team should consider rewording the sentence to avoid potential interpretations of prescriptiveness. Additionally, the author team should consider characterizing its degree of certainty in the statement through use of calibrated uncertainty language, per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
661	9	51	11	51	12	For Nicholls, R.J. et al. (2008): All author names should be listed here for this reference, without use of "et al." Please add the other author names to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
662	9	51	13	51	15	For Nicholls, R.J. et al. (2007): All author names should be listed here for this reference, without use of "et al." Please add the other author names to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
663	9	51	24	51	25	For UEPB (2009): This listed source is not available at the link provided. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been reworked and this comment is no longer obtains
664	9	51	45	0	0	Case Study 9.2.9: the high reliance of this case study on UN reports is a cause for concern. Some sections are uniquely relying on single UN reports. Some sections come across as being just taken over from some of these UN reports, without proper assessment of the evidence/agreement available. Need to add and assess additional sources/evidence as much as possible. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Diversified to additional peer reviewed sources
665	9	51	45	0	0	Case study 9.2.9. The writing approach and sourcing throughout this case study must be carefully revisited by the author team. The quality and validity of cited sources should be evaluated per the General Guidance on the Use of Literature in IPCC Reports, and characterization of the information in these sources must be considered. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Reviewed and addressed
666	9	51	49	51	49	In the United State, "SIDS" means "sudden infant death syndrome". In a report that may be read by public health officials, do we really need an acronym for small island states (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Sudden Infant Death Syndrome is the usual medical interpretation of SIDS but in the context of this case study Small Island Developing States is explicit and will be kept as a recognised abbreviation for SREX
667	9	51	49	52	4	Citations should be provided for these definitions of SIDS and LDCs. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Added

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
668	9	51	51	51	51	The citation for SIDSNET is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Removed because not necessary
669	9	52	1	52	1	Please provide the number of LDCs. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Discussion of LDCs was removed
670	9	52	6	0	0	Percentage of SIDS that are LDCs would be more useful. The characteristics mentioned appear to be those peculiar only to LDCs. A reference in this may help. (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Discussion of LDCs was removed
671	9	52	6	52	8	Please provide reference for this statement (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
672	9	52	14	52	15	This description of trends in climate and weather events and physical impacts *must* consider and cite the assessment findings and relevant sections of chapter 3. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
673	9	52	15	52	15	Delete - 'especially the increased frequency of droughts, floods and hurricanes'!!! This is generalised and inconsistent with the assessment given in Chapter 3. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
674	9	52	15	52	15	Typo in citation: For Read, ICTSD (2010), only the author's name (without the acronym) is listed in the case study's reference list. Please harmonize the reference in both locations (case study text and reference list). (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
675	9	52	15	52	16	This sentence should be supported by citations, perhaps as well by reference to relevant sections of chapter 4. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Revised. Reference to chapter 4 text added.
676	9	52	20	52	20	The citation for Woodroffe (2007) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
677	9	52	21	52	21	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Revised to "may"
678	9	52	23	52	23	The citation for Nurse and Sem (2001) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
679	9	52	23	52	24	Please consider to update Pernetta 1990 reference with a more recent study. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Unchanged
680	9	52	25	52	25	Is this highlight on "negatively impacted" necessary and warranted? Provide support of the statement. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
681	9	52	27	52	29	Here you should be able to draw upon the assessment given in Chapter 4, for evidence that climate-related disasters have become more frequent. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
682	9	52	27	52	29	This statement should be linked more explicitly to relevant findings and sections of chapter 3. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
683	9	52	27	52	50	Much of this material is repeated elsewhere. Also, please refer to the appropriate sections of Chapter 3 and condense that material. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - Revised.
684	9	52	29	52	29	The citation for Seck et al. (2005) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
685	9	52	29	52	29	The citation for UN (2009) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Citation for UN (2009) is added to the reference list.
686	9	52	30	52	30	The citation for UN (2009) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Citation for UN (2009) is added to the reference list.
687	9	52	32	52	32	The citation for UN (2009) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Citation for UN (2009) is added to the reference list.
688	9	52	34	52	34	The citation for UN (2009) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Citation for UN (2009) is added to the reference list.
689	9	52	42	52	43	...threshold for extreme events' - this seems like the wrong phrase here. The threshold of whether a climate event is extreme or not is predefined (ie, 95th or 99th percentile) and not lowered by other factors. Whether this extreme climate event is transformed into an extreme impact is the part that might be influenced by these other factors. Perhaps better wording would be: "...effectively increase the vulnerability to extreme climate events"?? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Adjusted
690	9	52	42	52	43	It seems preferable here to use the phrase "threshold for extreme impacts from climate and weather events." (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
691	9	53	4	53	35	both the Seychelles and Marshall Islands examples are all based on one single UN Desa reference -- how robust can this assessment be? Need to add more sources and evidence. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
692	9	53	8	53	9	"The study showed that...." Please cite the study at this point. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Done
693	9	53	13	53	13	delete prescriptive formulation "must take seriously" (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
694	9	53	15	53	15	Delete - 'a stark example of an extreme weather event'. You have not demonstrated that this particular flood was an 'extreme weather event'. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
695	9	53	16	53	16	The format of the citation 'UN DESA, Code 57' is not correct. Please change the format of this citation to "author, year". (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
696	9	53	34	53	35	The format of the citation 'UN DESA, Code 326' is not correct. Please change the format of this citation to "author, year". (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
697	9	53	42	53	46	replace "percent" with "%" (2x) (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed
698	9	53	53	53	53	Provide references to support the statement that Malawi is one of the more drought-prone countries in Southern Africa. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
699	9	54	8	54	14	The case of Ethiopi may be better placed in the drought mitigation case study as it is too abbreviated here in the LCD's case study to illustrate much benefit. It seems quite out of context here. (Jeggle, Terry, University of Pittsburgh)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
700	9	54	8	54	14	We suggest clarifying this case study and have provided suggested text below: Since 2004, the Government of Ethiopia and its international partners including WFP and the World Bank have established a weather risk management framework which links early warning based on a combination of satelite derived crop models with socio-economic vulnerability data to a contingent finance pool. Indexes linking drought and flood risk to projected food insecurity triggers the release of funds to scale up the Government's employment-based Productive Safety Net Programme (PSNP). The PSNP addresses the predictable needs of chronically vulnerable groups who require assistance during the hunger gap season even in good years, providing a strong social protection mechanism for the most vulnerable populations against extreme weather events (Hazell et al 2010, Maxwell et al., 2010). Reference: Hazell, P., Anderson, J., Balzer, N., Hastrup Clemensen, A., Hess, U. and Rispoli, F. (2010) Potential for scale and sustainability in weather index insurance for agriculture and rural livelihoods. IFAD/WFP: Rome. (World Food Programme (WFP))	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
701	9	54	10	0	0	Any visible results can be mentioned. (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
702	9	54	17	54	29	Why do you switch between from LDCs to SIDS? - please consider to include Grenada before Malawi and Ethiopia (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
703	9	54	20	54	22	The example of 9/11 could be explained more explicitly. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
704	9	54	21	54	21	Don't understand this statement and why you are linking "small open economy" with "the effects of 9/11" through the "vulnerability" to external shocks and natural disasters" -- this needs some more explanations and probably clarification. Can you provide evidence for this claim? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
705	9	54	32	54	54	Delete the last sentence calling for support of ISDR ("Member States could be encouraged to support..." -- this really is not appropriate here, in particular given the involvement of ISDR in the SREX. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
706	9	54	32	55	41	Almost none of this material is supported by the previous text, and large amounts of the text is not relevant to the case study. Please rework the case study to provide the evidence needed to support the conclusions and eliminate the other information. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Significantly revised
707	9	54	34	54	35	The author team should consider rewording this sentence to avoid potential interpretations of prescriptiveness. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Revised
708	9	54	38	54	38	Who are these 'other stakeholders'? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
709	9	54	44	54	44	Because the term "mitigating" is being used here in relation to disasters (instead of directly in relation to climate change), use of the term should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
710	9	54	46	54	46	Please be careful to avoid policy prescriptive statements (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Done
711	9	54	54	54	54	The citation for UNISDR (2004) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
712	9	55	2	55	13	Why focus in such detail on the SWIO? The level of scientific detail in the first part of this paragraph does not fit within the context of this case study or the chapter and feels very much like it has been cut and paste from elsewhere. This paragraph should be shortened, to simply focus on the general point made in lines 12 - 13. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Removed substantial portion and revised
713	9	55	13	55	13	The format of the citation 'UN DESA, Code 58' is not correct. Please change the format of this citation to "author, year". (IPCC WGII TSU)	Changed
714	9	55	21	55	22	Specific relevant citations should be provided for this sentence, or the sentence should be deleted. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Removed
715	9	55	21	55	41	Is this information specific to this case study? Its seems more general and likely to be covered by other chapters, so could be removed here. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
716	9	55	23	55	23	The citation for Heltberg et al. (2008) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
717	9	55	25	55	25	The citation for Heltberg et al. (2008) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
718	9	55	30	55	32	Specific relevant citations should be provided for this sentence, or the sentence should be deleted. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Adjusted
719	9	55	32	55	34	Not clear what you mean here: The best way to improve national policy making is via increased international funding? Could you make it clearer as to what you mean here. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Adjusted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
720	9	55	32	55	34	This sentence should be reworded to avoid potential interpretations of prescriptiveness. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Adjusted
721	9	55	46	55	48	This statement might be true but it might also be false--it certainly needs to be substantiated by an assessment of the literature beyond one citation. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Addressed - deleted
722	9	55	46	55	48	This discussion of climate sensitivity seems completely tangential to the scope and content of this case study. It should be deleted. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
723	9	55	46	55	55	Why do you focus on Africa in your conclusions? You have mentioned a lot more regional examples, mainly SIDS so these should be brought into your concluding statements. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
724	9	55	46	56	5	The lessons identified in this section do not seem to originate from the material in the case study as a whole. The section should be substantially revised to reflect lessons learned in the case study as a whole. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
725	9	55	48	55	53	"in addition.....". This is not a lesson that has been identified within this case study!. Such issues of regional downscaling and local scale variability are identified and discussed in Chapter 3. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
726	9	55	48	55	53	The focus on Africa specifically in the general lessons section seems inappropriate given the focus of the case study as a whole on SIDS and LDCs. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Significant revision made this comment irrelevant
727	9	56	3	56	5	Please reword, it is not clear what you are wanting to say with this sentence. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Adjusted significantly
728	9	56	28	56	31	For De Comarmond Alain and Payet Rolph (2010): This listed source is not available at the link provided. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
729	9	56	39	56	40	For Global Environment Facility: This listed source is not available at the link provided. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
730	9	57	23	57	28	It would be helpful to provide more information for these listed references, for example on the title of the document cited and the publication year. (IPCC WGII TSU)	done
731	9	57	47	0	0	Case Study 9.2.10: the discussions in this Case study are based on a very limited number of references, in some cases not a single reference is provided for entire sections! This can't be a thorough assessment. This discussion needs to be supported by more and independent lines of evidence. If there is not more information available this needs to be clearly stated and be part of the uncertainty assessment provided. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Additional references added.
732	9	57	47	58	46	This case on financial mechanisms & instruments, including insurance, seems restricted to developing countries: it should therefore be specified. Otherwise, if the case is supposed to cover developed countries as well, it should be redrafted (much too short; too limited analysis; very little on the core subject of the financial mechanism). (FRANCE)	Title changes to developing countries only
733	9	57	47	61	8	This entire section has so few citations that it is difficult to tell whether particular assertions are being attributed to the most recent citation or next citation (which might be in a different paragraph) or are simply offered without support. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Additional references added.
734	9	57	49	58	46	Overlap between this introduction and relevant sections of chapters 5, 6, and 7 should be reduced, with redundant material removed and this case study's introduction made more concise and focused. Additionally, statements made in the introductory section require further support by relevant citations. It would also be preferable to establish more clearly the scope of examples considered in the case study, indicating that examples considered pertain to developing countries for the most part, as well as establishing the contrast between these examples and risk transfer and insurance practices in developed countries. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Co-authors from these chapters have addressed this issue.
735	9	57	51	58	35	More independent evidence/references needed to be cited to support your discussion in these sections. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Additional references added.
736	9	57	53	57	53	change "be able" to "being able" (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Text redrafted
737	9	58	1	0	0	constrain should be "constraining" or "that constrain" (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Text redrafted
738	9	58	4	58	7	Reference(s) needed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Additional references added.
739	9	58	17	0	0	directly should be directed (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Text redrafted
740	9	58	21	58	24	Reference(s) needed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	References added
741	9	58	26	58	28	Statement about Warner et al. 2010 (a UNISDR report): does this mean that you are simply repeating the review (assessment?) provided by Warner et al.? This would clearly not be appropriate as this is supposed to be an independent assessment of all the available information. If there is not more information available this needs to be clearly stated and be part of the uncertainty assessment provided. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Text redrafted
742	9	58	26	58	28	Please delete this sentence. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Deleted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
743	9	58	42	58	42	Typo in citation: For Hoeppe and Gurenko (2006), the first author's name is spelled differently in the chapter text, as compared to the case study's reference list. Please ensure correct spelling of the author's name in both the text and the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
744	9	58	49	0	0	same comment as above (FRANCE)	Title changes to developing countries only
745	9	58	49	59	15	Overlap between this section and relevant sections of chapters 5, 6, and 7 should be reduced, with redundant material removed. A general categorization of risk transfer tools is better situated in the other chapters, with the presentation here focused on the categories for which specific examples are provided. Additionally, for material retained, citations to relevant sections of chapters 5, 6, and 7 should be provided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	We reduced overlap as much as possible
746	9	58	51	58	51	The citation for Cummins and Mahul (2009) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This has been done.
747	9	59	1	59	4	The difference between traditional and micro-insurance here is unclear. The discussion here sounds like a discussion of normal insurance, with an emphasis on low-income customers. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This is what microinsurance is, the key distinction being the provision via NGOs or microfinance institutions.
748	9	59	10	59	11	The bullet-point could mention the clients of these tools : they are not made for everyone, but mainly to help reinsurers. They are not "general" tools but rather specialized ones. (FRANCE)	Insurance linked securities have been deleted
749	9	59	18	59	18	Suggest to shorten the title of this subsection to "Role of Thematic Approach in Specific Cases" -- no need to state at the level of the title that you are "analysing information available"... this seems clear. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Revised as "Interventions - Examples of local, national and international risk transfer for developing countries"
750	9	59	18	59	18	The title of this section is unclear. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Revised as "Interventions - Examples of local, national and international risk transfer for developing countries"
751	9	59	27	59	47	The author team should consider related description of the CCRIF in chapter 7 (p. 32, lines 13-20). The consistency of material presented in both locations should be ensured, with overlap reduced. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This overlap has been reduced.
752	9	59	40	59	40	It is unclear why pooling the resources would lower the cost by 40 percent. Is commercial insurance (on average) that profitable? Did the program cause that much risk reduction? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This is due to risk pooling. We deleted the number, as it did not seem very robust and now write: "The advantage of pooling is that due to diversifying risk it greatly reduces the costs of reinsurance compared to the price each government would have paid individually."
753	9	59	45	59	45	Which other hazards do you refer to? Give examples. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	This phrase has gone with revisions.
754	9	59	52	59	52	Please delete this sentence. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This phrase has been deleted with the revisions
755	9	59	52	60	16	It would be preferable to indicate relevant citations for statements and examples more explicitly. Morelli et al. (2010) and Bhatt et al. (2010) may support much of the two paragraphs, but this linkage should be clarified for the reader. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case has been substantially revised including additional sources.
756	9	60	11	60	11	Please provide an assessment of key findings. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - reworded
757	9	60	19	60	32	The mechanism through which payouts occur should be specified more explicitly. It seems that payouts occur to insured farmers in an area if production in the area's reference plot is poor--regardless of farmers' individual productivity--but this mechanism could be stated more clearly for the reader. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The Bolivian example is gone and we discuss the case of India which is more interesting.
758	9	60	37	60	54	The mention of examples without further details is not very effective. Mentioning fewer examples, while providing more information on how they work, would be preferable. (IPCC WGII TSU)	We have 3 examples for which we seem to have sufficient detail in order to arrive at conclusions.
759	9	60	43	60	43	Why was there poor uptake? (IPCC WGII TSU)	This is not in the text anymore
760	9	61	5	61	8	The statements in this section do not seem to capture lessons learned from the material presented in case study. Additionally, following revision, statements in this section could potentially be characterized by calibrated uncertainty language, especially summary terms for evidence and agreement and levels of confidence, per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties. The author team's degree of certainty in statements here is not clear and could be clarified with the use of calibrated language. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - We draw important lessons now and have included calibrated uncertainty language
761	9	61	19	61	20	For Hellmuth et al. (2009): The information on this reference seems to be incomplete. Please add the missing information e.g. on the publisher, for this reference. (IPCC WGII TSU)	We added uncertainty language .
762	9	61	21	61	22	For Höpffe, P., Gurenko, E. (2006): The information on this reference seems to be incomplete. Please add the missing information, e.g. the volume and issue of the journal where this article was published, for this reference. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Reference has been completed
763	9	61	30	61	31	For United Nations Environment Programme Finance Initiative (2009): This listed source is not available at the link provided. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGI TSU)	Reference has gone with revisions.
764	9	61	39	0	0	Case Study 9.2.11: the discussions in this Case study are based on a very limited number of references, mostly originating from UNISDR/World Bank reports. Suggest to provide more and independent evidence. If there is not more information available this needs to be clearly stated and be part of the uncertainty assessment provided. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Noted. No more example-related info available. Uncertainty addressed by referencing the lessons illustrated in the "lessons identified" section.
765	9	61	39	0	0	Case study 9.2.11. Throughout the case study, there are subsections with italicized or underlined titles that are not numbered. Per the SREX style guide, these subheadings need to be numbered. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
766	9	61	39	65	44	Shouldn't this case study draw on the wide array of community education and capacity building work on DRR. Examples of this can be found on http://community.eldis.org/DRR/.59e3c4cb/.59e99723 and http://community.eldis.org/?233@@/.59eb15c6!enclosure=.59eb15c7&ad=1 (Nightingale, Katherine, Christian Aid)	Addressed.
767	9	61	44	61	45	What does it mean to be "well informed and motivated towards a culture of disaster prevention and resilience" -- please clarify. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGII TSU)	This is Hyogo Framework language but comment addressed anyway.
768	9	62	6	62	9	It would be helpful to provide slightly more detail about what the campaign achieved (and where). (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
769	9	62	12	62	13	This reference should be listed in the reference list and cited in the text in the format 'author, year'; instead of in a footnote. Please add the reference to the reference list, including information about the author, publication year and document title in addition to the URL, and remove the footnote. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
770	9	62	29	62	29	The acronym ECHO must be defined where first used. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
771	9	62	29	62	30	What do ECHO and PDR stand for? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
772	9	63	23	63	28	It should be clarified if the mentioned "survey" and "study" are Shiwaku et al. (2006). (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
773	9	63	33	63	43	Further relevant citations should be provided for this paragraph. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Noted. No more example-related info available. Uncertainty addressed by referencing the lessons illustrated in the "lessons identified" section.
774	9	63	37	63	37	What does SEEDS stand for? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
775	9	63	37	63	37	The acronym SEEDS should be defined where first used (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
776	9	64	31	64	31	reference needed as evidence these typhoons were 'record typhoons'. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGII TSU)	Noted and deleted.
777	9	64	36	64	36	This begs the question of what is a balanced national average. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Noted and deleted.
778	9	64	39	0	0	Case Study 9.2.11: parts of this case study need substantial revision as it does not provide any kind of scientific synthesis or assessment. To large parts this Case Study includes individual reports from some workshops/events etc. Statements like "Participants were surprised how quickly they had to put to use their risk reduction knowledge" (page 64, lines 17/18) or "The training closed with a workshop ..." (page 64, lines 20/21), or "Participants watched documentaries about climate change and played the Urdu version of Riskland..." (page 65, lines 24-26), etc. don't seem to be necessary in a scientific assessment. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGII TSU)	Several approaches to presenting the country examples were considered. Author finds that the short country example is appropriate for topic.
779	9	65	3	65	3	What does CEE stand for? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
780	9	65	3	65	3	The acronym CEE must be defined where first used (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
781	9	65	6	65	6	The citation for CEE Himalayas (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
782	9	65	10	65	10	The citation for CEE Himalayas (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
783	9	65	16	65	16	The citation for CEE Himalayas (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
784	9	65	22	65	22	The citation for CEE Himalayas (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
785	9	65	26	65	26	The citation for CEE Himalayas (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
786	9	65	33	65	33	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Noted and deleted.
787	9	66	21	66	21	The URL provided here seems to pertain to the reference 'Santa Catarina State Civil Defence Department (SCSCDD), Brazil. 2008c' in lines 16-17. Please revise the location of the URL if necessary. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Thank you, corrected.
788	9	66	46	0	0	Case Study 9.2.11: this is an overly long case study when compared to all the others. Suggest to shorten substantially. This will also help to focus on the key issues and to strengthen the message the Case Study tries to convey. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGII TSU)	It is less than 3000 words as agreed. Reworked "lessons identified" section to clarify message.
789	9	66	46	0	0	Case study 9.2.12. Throughout the case study, there are subsections with italicized or underlined titles that are not numbered. Per the SREX style guide, these subheadings need to be numbered. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
790	9	66	46	0	0	Case study 9.2.12. This case study should be closely linked with appropriate sections of Chapter 6. (IPCC WGII TSU)	We are in the process of completing this
791	9	66	50	66	54	This introduction leads the reader to believe this section only analyzes the Philippines law to draw lessons for others, but that law is one of several policies analyzed. Many readers will be equally interested in the other policies, and it might help to identify those earlier. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Agree and addressed.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
792	9	66	50	67	5	The entry point to this introduction, starting with "The Philippines is at the forefront", is clearly not ideal. It would make much more sense in this opening statements to provide a general introduction to legislation for Multilevel Governance rather than jumping on the example of the Philippines. In fact, the title of the Case Study is also very general and does not single out the Philippines. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Agree and addressed.
793	9	67	3	67	3	"European Commission Directive" should be replaced by "European Union Directive", as the WF and Floods Directives have already been adopted at EU (supranational) level. This correction must be applied throughout the text, especially in Chapter 9 (European Commission, DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	No longer in this case study.
794	9	67	14	67	17	It is not absolutely correct to state that only UK, Canada, FR, and Philippines have specific climate change legislation. Although the paragraph does refer to "States" (which EU is not), the omission of the EU Climate-Energy Package might be misleading to the average reader. (European Commission, DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Sentence deleted so no longer relevant.
795	9	67	16	67	16	It would be helpful here to clarify if "climate change legislation" refers specifically to adaptation legislation, as opposed to adaptation and mitigation legislation. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Sentence deleted so no longer relevant.
796	9	67	19	67	25	Please provide references that support the statements in this section, e.g., to what are "useful steps" etc. Such statements need to be based on evidence. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed. Attribution clarified in "lessons identified" section.
797	9	67	28	67	44	What literature have you assessed to establish these listed elements of effective legislation? Citations needed. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed. Attribution clarified in "lessons identified" section.
798	9	67	28	67	44	Reference(s) needed. Also, this should be cross-referenced with Chapter 6. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed. Attribution clarified in "lessons identified" section.
799	9	67	30	67	44	When the case study is revised to provided numbered subsections (see general comment on the case study), it would be much preferable to then provide a reference to the relevant subsection in each bulleted element here. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed. Section restructured.
800	9	68	12	68	23	are these footnotes needed? It seems that those could all be handled by adding the appropriate references instead. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
801	9	68	23	68	23	The citation 'UNDP ILS Indonesia 2009' differs from the citation 'UNDP 2009' on page 68, line 10; even though both citations presumably refer to the same reference in the case study's reference list. Please harmonize the way this source is cited in both locations. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - No longer included.
802	9	68	26	68	26	which section is referred to here when writing "both described in subsection 2" (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed.
803	9	68	26	68	26	When the case study is revised to provided numbered subsections (see general comment on the case study), this subsection number should be updated appropriately. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
804	9	68	36	68	36	Title would be more effective in reverse, ie, "The comprehensive legislation model: South Africa and Colombia" (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Case study reworked and title no longer used.
805	9	68	48	68	49	The citation for Vásquez (2006) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Case study reworked and reference no longer included.
806	9	69	1	69	1	Title would be more effective in reverse, ie, "The linked legislation model: The Philippines" (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Case study reworked and title no longer used.
807	9	69	12	69	12	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Deleted.
808	9	69	35	69	35	The citation for Baker and Refsgaard (2007) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Citation is no longer part of this case study.
809	9	69	42	0	0	REPLACE Commission by Parliament (the European Commission has no legislative power) (FRANCE)	Citation is no longer part of this case study.
810	9	69	51	69	53	It would be preferable to provide a reference to the sections of chapters 5 and 7 where subsidiarity is addressed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This information is no longer part of this case study.
811	9	70	1	70	5	Is there any information available commenting on whether or not the Spanish water initiative has been successful? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	This information is no longer part of this case study.
812	9	70	7	0	0	IDEM (FRANCE)	This information is no longer part of this case study.
813	9	70	12	0	0	replace Barrier by "Barnier" (FRANCE)	This reference is no longer part of this case study.
814	9	70	38	70	38	The citation for NDMC (2009) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected.
815	9	71	36	71	36	Typo in citation: For World Bank (2008), the reference that seems to correspond to this citation in the case study's reference list also lists UNISDR as a author. Please ensure the citation is correct and harmonize the reference in both locations (case study text and reference list). (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected.
816	9	71	42	71	42	The citation for UNISDR (2009) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Sentence no longer included
817	9	71	44	71	45	why is this information included as a footnote? It would be better to appear in the sentence, as (....). (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
818	9	72	8	72	8	The citation for Adger et al. (2005) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This reference is no longer part of this case study.
819	9	72	8	72	8	The citation for Urwin and Jordan (2008) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This reference is no longer part of this case study.
820	9	72	44	73	2	References to the White Paper on Adaptation is missing in the main text (there are 2 references in biblio parts). A useful place to make reference to it (despite it not being "legislation") might be under "Lessons identified and conclusion", second bullet point : "Legislation takes a long time to develop; best to avoid starting from scratch" (European Commission, DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Case study is strictly on legislation, not policies. Section reworked and bullet no longer included as such.
821	9	72	46	72	46	this is supposed to be an assessment, not a review... (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed.
822	9	72	46	73	23	The author team should consider characterizing these conclusions with calibrated uncertainty language, especially summary terms for evidence and agreement and levels of confidence, per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties. Use of calibrated language would also enable the reader to understand more fully and compare more systematically the state of knowledge across statements. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed by clarifying attributions in the lessons identified section.
823	9	73	16	73	17	The author team should consider rewording this sentence to avoid potential interpretations of prescriptiveness. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed.
824	9	74	3	74	4	The reference for Inman, R. P. and Rubinfeld, D. L contains no publication year. Please add the publication year for this source and make sure it corresponds to the in-text citation. (IPCC WGII TSU)	This reference is no longer part of this case study.
825	9	74	27	74	28	For South Africa, Republic of (2003): This listed source is not available at the link provided. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – it is 2002 not 2003
826	9	75	0	0	0	From my feeling I would not say that this is really a case study. It would much better fit in Ch5 P23-24. See also commen No 22. (Koppe, Christina, Deutscher Wetterdienst)	Chapter 9 includes examples of Methodologies. This case study references the most other chapters.
827	9	75	1	0	0	The case study on early warning systems ignores droughts completely which is bizarre considering that there are major international EWS for drought - such as FEWSNET, referred to in Chapter 5. This case study starts from the basis that most deaths and economic losses from weather-related disasters come from floods and storms, which is true, but in terms of the numbers of people affected by climate-related disasters, it is droughts and floods which are the big two. Another aspect missing from this case study is that an EWS is only as good as its ability to trigger a response. An EWS that produces wonderful information is of no use unless it triggers a response. Therefore there needs to be real consideration of the exact types of information the donors/others require, in order for them to trigger their systems, to start a response. There need to be feedback mechanisms, self-reflection and learning, to improve the system over time. The effectiveness of the EWS in Kenya has significantly reduced response time. (Hillier, Debbie, Oxfam)	In the re-writing of this case study, the text has been modified to better reflect these concerns. Drought is included as an example. Cross referencing to other chapters is included which addresses these concerns. In my opinion the highlighted comment has not been addressed adequately. Gordon's answer: Consideration of donors needs is beyond the scope of this case study.
828	9	75	1	0	0	Case study 9.2.13. Throughout the case study, there are subsections with italicized or underlined titles that are not numbered. Per the SREX style guide, these subheadings need to be numbered. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
829	9	75	1	0	0	Case study 9.2.13. This case study duplicates information in the heatwave case study, as well as information in Chapters 5 and 6. It should be condensed to key issues without repeating information elsewhere, and should indicate relevant sections of other chapters where the reader can get more information. It also needs primary scientific references for statements of facts (e.g. Wahlstrom 2009 should be replaced by references for the numbers quoted). In addition, the case study misses the rich scientific research on seasonal forecasts. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The case study has been condensed and appropriate cross referencing to chapters included.
830	9	75	6	75	6	The citation for For Munich Re (2010) is not provided in the case study's reference list. Please ensure this citation is added to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected.
831	9	75	6	75	13	The described trends should reference relevant sections and assessment findings of chapters 3 and 4 as appropriate. Also, the author team may want to consider the extent to which changes in reporting have contributed to the observed upward trend. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The wording has been changed but the full analysis of these trends is not appropriate for this case study.
832	9	75	9	75	9	You need to cite references which support this statement that flood and storms were the dominant factor in these disasters. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Text deleted.
833	9	75	16	75	16	footnote is not needed and you should simply refer to the SREX glossary. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Corrected
834	9	75	18	0	0	Grammatical errors in the sentence (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	Corrected
835	9	75	27	75	28	This reference should be listed in the reference list and cited in the text in the format 'author, year'; instead of in a footnote. Please add the reference to the reference list, including information about the author, publication year and document title in addition to the URL. and remove the footnote. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
836	9	75	27	75	47	Please remove all footnotes and include information either in the text or in the reference list (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Corrected
837	9	75	30	75	30	"Hyogo Framework for Action" Spell/Define Hyogo. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Reference provided. Hyogo is a name of a place in Japan where the meeting took place.

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
838	9	75	30	75	31	This reference should be listed in the reference list and cited in the text in the format 'author, year'; instead of in a footnote. Please add the reference to the reference list, including information about the author, publication year and document title in addition to the URL, and remove the footnote. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
839	9	75	41	75	42	This reference should be listed in the reference list and cited in the text in the format 'author, year'; instead of in a footnote. Please add the reference to the reference list, including information about the author, publication year and document title in addition to the URL, and remove the footnote. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
840	9	75	44	75	47	This reference should be listed in the reference list and cited in the text in the format 'author, year'; instead of in a footnote. Please add the reference to the reference list, including information about the author, publication year and document title in addition to the URL, and remove the footnote. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
841	9	75	49	75	52	The author team should reword this sentence so that it is not interpreted as potentially prescriptive. If the sentence conveys information presented in the underlying source, the author team should indicate this more clearly. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Reworded and referenced
842	9	75	54	76	20	It is true that weather prediction using the state-of-the-art forecasting systems may provide short-range early warnings and not climate information. However, large weather centres (e.g. ECMWF) make a big effort to provide monthly or seasonal forecasts mainly providing the general trend of the meteorological conditions as well as some probabilistic prediction of some "extreme" events. Therefore, the focus of the future research of the meteorological centres should be towards the development and amelioration of such systems. However, such model systems require increased computer power and hence increased funding. (GREECE)	Noted.
843	9	76	4	76	4	Please add information on seasonal forecasts from, for example, IRI or the US NDIS. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Information on seasonal forecasts has been added.
844	9	76	6	74	15	The author team should consider adding relevant citations as appropriate. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text has been modified.
845	9	76	6	76	20	Please condense and refer to relevant sections in Chapters 5 and 6. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Condensed and references to Chapter 5 (and 6)
846	9	76	23	76	23	"Examples of Benefits of Early Warning Systems" Excellent examples provided in this section. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Thank you.
847	9	76	30	76	33	Is this list of regional assessments complete or selective? Please make it clear if these regions are listed as selected examples only. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Noted as examples
848	9	76	30	76	33	It would be helpful to clarify what is meant by "assessments of adaptive capacity to responding to cyclone warnings." (IPCC WGII TSU)	Wording changed
849	9	76	33	76	34	add number of Case Study when referring to Tropical Cyclones Case Study. Assume you are referring to Case Study 9.2.1? (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Corrected
850	9	76	33	76	36	It would be preferable to cite this case study by number, in place of or in addition to its title. Additionally, it would be better to paraphrase the case study instead of directly citing it, since it is in the same chapter. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
851	9	76	44	76	45	It would be helpful to indicate more clearly if the second half of the sentence is also supported by the provided citations or if it represents an author team conclusion. (IPCC WGII TSU)	The wording is clear that it is the opinion of Kalkstein and Sheridan
852	9	76	44	76	46	Please refer to the heatwave case study and give primary references. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Done
853	9	76	45	76	45	Please give more details on what improvements are needed in regards to heat-health warnings. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Not appropriate for this level of analysis. Perhaps better to say that comments is address by changing the text to read "although improvements are still needed (Kalkstein and Sheridan, 2007)." Gordon's answer: The text has been changed the text to read "although improvements are still needed (Kalkstein and Sheridan, 2007)."
854	9	76	45	76	45	What is meant by 'societal impacts' of warning systems? Please give some examples. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Text modified Suggest a more explicit response be provided since text referring to "societal impacts" has been deleted. Gordon's answer : Text has been deleted.
855	9	76	45	76	45	It would be preferable to be more specific about the nature of the mentioned "social impacts." (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text modified See above. Gordon's answer : Text has been deleted
856	9	76	48	77	49	The flood warning system developed for Bangladesh by Webster and collaborators (BAMS, Nov 2010) could be mentioned here. (Global Climate Observing System Steering Committee)	Included
857	9	76	50	76	50	Typo in citation: For Nichols (2001), the author's name is spelled differently in the chapter text, as compared to the case study's reference list. Please ensure correct spelling of the author's name in both the text and the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
858	9	76	59	0	0	"Nichols" should be "Nicholls". (Nicholls, Neville, Monash University, School of Geography & Environmental Science)	Corrected
859	9	77	1	77	3	And what was the conclusion? (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text modified – in what way? Gordon's answer : Text has been deleted
860	9	77	7	77	7	There are many more recent references. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text modified – in what way? Gordon's answer : Text has been modified and newer references added

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
861	9	77	14	77	22	References that support these statements are needed (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Reference added. Gordon's answer : several references added
862	9	77	14	77	22	The author team should consider characterizing these conclusions with calibrated uncertainty language, especially summary terms for evidence and agreement and levels of confidence, per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties. Use of calibrated language would also enable the reader to understand more fully and compare more systematically the state of knowledge across statements. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Not done. I assume you did consider the comment, and decided not to act on it. If so, reasons need to be given. Gordon's answer : Not done because this requires a group consensus and these case studies were usually written by a small number of authors and if we concluded that the term was medium confidence you would want a reference.
863	9	77	17	77	18	Reference(s) needed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Added I cannot find this response. Gordon's answer : additional references added
864	9	77	25	0	0	suggest to coordinate with Chapter 3 to ensure consistency with and input from Chapter 3; reference to the SREX assessment of the physical science basis would be appropriate. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Chapter 3 CLAs are co-authors but has this ensured consistency? Only one reference to SREX Chapter 3 – sufficient, given this comment? Gordon's answer : Chapter 3 CLAs are co-authors and they reviewed this to ensure consistency.
865	9	77	25	78	31	This section is repetitive and can be condensed. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text modified
866	9	77	27	78	31	This section must provide additional citations. There are currently many statements that describe specific information for which a citation is necessary as a source for that information, and many statements that are presented as conclusions of the author team without a traceable link to underlying evidence. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text modified and reduced. Gordon's answer : additional references added.
867	9	77	29	77	29	The use of "likely" here appears to be casual, not tied to the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties, and therefore its use should be avoided. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Term deleted – more explanation needed for this and subsequent uses of “text modifies”, to show how the comments have been addressed; “text modified” is too terse. Gordon's and Virginia's answer thank you for the comment – the text was deleted because we recognise the validity of the TSU comment – thank you
868	9	77	40	77	41	This sentence is unclear. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text modified
869	9	77	47	78	18	More references needed to support these statements (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Text modified. Gordon's answer : additional references added.
870	9	77	54	77	54	Please don't generalise: 'large uncertainties' should be 'variable levels of uncertainties'... (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Text modified. Gordon's answer text modified as per suggestion.
871	9	78	11	78	11	Specific relevant sections in chapter 3 should be referenced here. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text modified. Gordon's answer text modified as per suggestion and to the include the references.
872	9	78	12	78	12	Please don't generalise: 'prediction is very high' should be 'predictions CAN BE very high'... (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Text deleted
873	9	78	21	78	21	Delete: "the large" (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Deleted
874	9	78	36	78	50	The author team should consider characterizing these conclusions with calibrated uncertainty language, especially summary terms for evidence and agreement and levels of confidence, per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties. Use of calibrated language would also enable the reader to understand more fully and compare more systematically the state of knowledge across statements. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Not done – see my response to a similar reply made above. Gordon's answer : - Gordon recommended that the same answer as prepared for 862 was appropriate – so I copy that answer here : Not done because this requires a group consensus and these case studies were usually written by a small number of authors and if we concluded that the term was medium confidence you would want a reference.
875	9	78	40	78	40	This sentence is unclear. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text modified
876	9	78	45	78	47	This sentence is unclear. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Text modified
877	9	78	46	78	46	Why is uncertainty increasing with climate change? This is a phrase coming up often in SREX but without any scientific basis. Uncertainty regarding how the climate might be in 50 years time from now, is not any greater than if someone had asked the same question 30 years ago. Uncertainty also comes on the impact side of things with the reaching of conditions that have not been seen in historical times, but this uncertainty is not rising, and is probably decreasing as we get closer to approaching these conditions so get a better idea of what we are in for. Please specify what you mean with this statement. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Text modified. Gordon's answer : this text was deleted.
878	9	79	8	79	9	For Brunet, G. and Coauthors (2010): All author names should be listed here for this reference, without use of “coauthors” Please add the other author names to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
879	9	79	16	79	17	For Davis, C. and Coauthors (2008): All author names should be listed here for this reference, without use of “coauthors” Please add the other author names to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
880	9	79	40	79	41	For IFRC (2009): The link provided for this reference does not link directly to the document cited. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected – provided to grey literature bank
881	9	80	16	80	19	For Meehl, G.A. and Coauthors (2007): All author names should be listed here for this reference, without use of “coauthors” Please add the other author names to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
882	9	80	20	80	20	For Meehl, G.A. and Coauthors (2009): All author names should be listed here for this reference, without use of "coauthors" Please add the other author names to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
883	9	80	28	80	29	For MunichRe Topics Geo (2009): The link provided for this reference does not link directly to the document cited. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected - provided to grey literature bank
884	9	80	43	80	45	For Shapiro, M.A. and Coauthors (2007): All author names should be listed here for this reference, without use of "coauthors" Please add the other author names to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
885	9	80	46	80	47	For Shapiro and co-authors (2010): All author names should be listed here for this reference, without use of "coauthors" Please add the other author names to the reference list. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected
886	9	81	19	81	20	For Vos et al. (2010): The link provided for this reference does not link directly to the document cited. Please revise or delete the provided URL. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Corrected - provided to grey literature bank
887	9	81	31	0	0	It is suggested to include subchapter 9.3 at the beginning of chapter 9 and to rename it as executive summary, following the structure of chapters 1 to 8. (Radunsky, KLaus, Umweltbundesamt GmbH)	Addressed – an executive summary has been added at the start of chapter 9
888	9	81	31	0	0	Section 9.4: It would be very useful for this synthesis section to explicitly refer back to the individual case studies, providing a more direct link to what has been written in the 13 subsections/Case studies before. Also it seems that it would be useful to actually expand and strengthen the synthesis part as otherwise the impression remains that Chapter 9 consists of a number of individual, mostly unconnected pieces.... Similarly it would be important to provide a more direct link to the 13 individual case studies in the introduction part of Chapter 9. Together, Introduction and Synthesis, are key to provide the framing for the Case Studies within the SREX. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed: 1 - The introduction explains more directly the individual case studies; 2 - A matrix has been added in the introduction which provides the link between the introduction and the synthesis; 3 - synthesis now links to the cases studies and their lessons identified whilst having paragraphs expressing common themes
889	9	81	31	0	0	"9.3. Synthesis of Lessons Identified from Case Studies" Again, this section also has great examples. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Thank you
890	9	81	31	0	0	Section 9.3. The author team should consider characterizing these conclusions with calibrated uncertainty language, especially summary terms for evidence and agreement and levels of confidence, per the AR5 Guidance Note on Treatment of Uncertainties. Use of calibrated language would also enable the reader to understand more fully and compare more systematically the state of knowledge across statements. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Thank you - calibrated language has been used in conjunction with advice from the relevant chapters in SREX. In May 2011 the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to add the matrix linking all the case studies to the SPM statements -this was considered the best way to address these issues for Chapter 9
891	9	81	31	81	31	"Synthesis of Lessons Identified from Case Studies" Excellent. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Thank you
892	9	81	33	0	0	I felt this section was rather lightweight given some of the excellent work that had gone into the case studies and would definitely benefit from being augmented. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Addressed in the text of the Synthesis in part but also because in May 2011 at the fourth meeting of the leading authors decided to add the matrix linking all the case studies to the SPM statements -this was considered the best way to address these issues for Chapter 9
893	9	81	34	81	35	This is important....' - It reads a little strange here for the authors to be justifying the importance of their own chapter. Whether or not Chapter 9 'adds context and value' should be obvious to the readers. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
894	9	81	42	81	43	Delete 'for use by policymakers'. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - deleted
895	9	81	45	0	0	including should be "including" (GARG, AMIT, INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AHMEDABAD)	addressed
896	9	81	45	81	45	"...including..." should be including. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	addressed
897	9	81	45	81	46	Safer hospitals were barely mentioned in the case studies. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
898	9	81	52	81	53	This sentence on uncertainty needs to be rephrased. Why would the "uncertainty as to the details of climate change in the future" "be reduced, in a sense, through the risk reduction approaches of DDR"? The uncertainty of climate change in the future is completely unrelated to the risk reduction approaches of DDR! Or are you arguing that DDR approaches will lead to GHG mitigation efforts and thus affect the emissions projections? If this is the case or not, this is clearly not part of any of the Case Studies in Chapter 9 and thus can not be the conclusion/synthesis in this section. BTW, delete "in a sense" -- this is very vague. (Stocker, Thomas, IPCC WGI TSU)	Addressed - reworded
899	9	81	52	81	53	DRR will reduce uncertainty associated with impacts, but not with projections of future climate change. It would be preferable to be clearer about this point. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - reworded
900	9	82	21	82	21	It seems like you should be able to say something about integration of disaster risk management and climate change adaptation. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed
901	9	83	0	0	0	Tables 9.1 and 9.3 : what is the wind speed averaging time : 1-min or 10-minutes ? (International Petroleum Industry Environmental Conservation Association (IPIECA))	Addressed – with the data that is available
902	9	83	0	0	0	Table 9-1. In this table and its caption, the term "affected" is used where the intended meaning seems to be "exposed." It would be preferable to use the term "exposed," given the centrality of the concept of exposure in the SREX report and the definition of the term in the glossary. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - reworded

#	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
903	9	83	0	0	0	Table 9-2. The asterisk footnote should be clarified, for example, more explicitly indicating why the described forecast does not constitute early warning, indicating what "Cox's bazaar" was, and specifying what is meant by "reliable information is not available" (e.g., there isn't information on whether or not this forecast was communicated?). (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed - deleted
904	9	84	0	0	0	Table 9-4 : • Table 9.4 needs re-organizing. On the second row and first column the title; "Climate change increases hazards" can be replaced with "Climate Change Hazards" • On the third row and first column "Hydrometeorological hazards increase" should be replaced with "Hydrometeorological hazards" • On the first column in the sentence beginning with "Hydro... content also can be" should be replaced with "can also be" • "Tsunami" can be added to the column in the "such as landslides...., tsunami"; tsunami induced hazards can be added to the table. Besides in the 4th column: What is PMF please use its expanding; Meteorological forecasts can be replaced with "Improving of meteorological forecasting"; one line can be added to this column as " Assessment of earthquake induced tsunami hazards at a nuclear power plant site". Finally, there are several points need corrections in the 5th column. e.g. remove " which increases risk"; last sentence can be replaced with "Climate change mitigation efforts reduce hazard potential and risks". This may alter its understanding. (Incecik, Salahattin/Selahattin, Istanbul Technical University)	Addressed - deleted
905	9	84	0	0	0	Table 9-4. All discussion of changes in hazards *must* reflect and cite the relevant assessment findings and citations in chapter 3. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Addressed – deleted
906	9	85	0	0	0	Table 9-5. This table should provide references to relevant sections of chapters 5, 6, and 7 as appropriate. (IPCC WGII TSU)	Not addressed although the table was sent to Chapters 5, 6 and 7 so no comments have been added